

THE ANALYSIS OF THE INTEGRATION PROCESS OF THE ORGANIZATION
OF TURKIC STATES (OTS) FROM A NEOFUNCTIONALIST PERSPECTIVE

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO
THE GRADUATE SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
OF
MIDDLE EAST TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY

BY

DENİZ ÜNVER

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR
THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF SCIENCE
IN
THE DEPARTMENT OF EURASIAN STUDIES

JULY 2023

Approval of the thesis:

**THE ANALYSIS OF THE INTEGRATION PROCESS OF THE
ORGANIZATION OF TURKIC STATES (OTS) FROM A
NEOFUNCTIONALIST PERSPECTIVE**

submitted by **DENİZ ÜNVER** in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of **Master of Science in Eurasian Studies, the Graduate School of Social Sciences of Middle East Technical University** by,

Prof. Dr. Sadettin KIRAZCI
Dean
Graduate School of Social Sciences

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Işık KUŞÇU BONNENFANT
Head of Department
Department of

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Işık KUŞÇU BONNENFANT
Supervisor
Department of

Examining Committee Members:

Prof. Dr. Oktay TANRISEVER (Head of the Examining Committee)
Name of University
Department of

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Işık BONNENFANT (Supervisor)
Middle East Technical University
Department of

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Sezgin MERCAN
Name of University
Department of

I hereby declare that all information in this document has been obtained and presented in accordance with academic rules and ethical conduct. I also declare that, as required by these rules and conduct, I have fully cited and referenced all material and results that are not original to this work.

Name, Last Name: Reşide Deniz Ünver

Signature:

ABSTRACT

THE ANALYSIS OF THE ORGANIZATION OF TURKIC STATES FROM A NEOFUNCTIONALIST PERSPECTIVE

Reşide Deniz Ünver

M.S., Department of Eurasian Studies

Supervisor: Işık Kuşçu Bonnenfant

July 2023, 158 pages

Following the Soviet Union's disintegration in 1991, the Turkic-speaking former Soviet republics became independent states. It was not long after, Türkiye began to build relations with those countries in a gradual manner. The initial bilateral ties led to the process of developing a regional integration process on a multilateral level. The regional integration process of Turkic Speaking Countries started with the Ankara Summit in 1992. Nakhchivan Summit in 2009 was another milestone in the organizational history, as now called the Organization of Turkic Speaking States had gained a more institutionalized structure. The Organization, which aims to facilitate the member states' cooperation in economic, cultural, political and education fields, provides a basis for regional integration. With its increasing influence in the region, the Organization is essential for the Turkic countries and the region.

This thesis analyzes the Organization of Turkic-speaking States from a Neofunctionalist perspective. According to the Neofunctionalist perspective, cooperation in one sector may have a positive impact in other areas (spill-over effect) during the integration process. This argument proves itself in the example of the

integration process of the Turkic Republics. For instance, cultural cooperation automatically affects cooperation in education. Another argument of the Neofunctionalist perspective is the fact that economic cooperation further pushes for integration by creating or developing other cooperation areas. In the example of the Organization of the Turkic States, it can be analyzed that economic cooperation has an impact on many other areas of collaboration such as in transport and tourism. Therefore, the main argument in this thesis is that the Organization of Turkic States helps developing multilateral ties among the Turkic states by gradually spreading cooperation ties among various issue areas, as suggested by the Neofunctionalist perspective.

Keywords: Neofunctionalism, Organization of Turkic States, regional integration

ÖZ

TÜRK DEVLETLERİ TEŞKİLATI'NIN YENİ İŞLEVSELÇİ BAKIŞ AÇISIYLA İNCELENMESİ

Reşide Deniz Ünver

Yüksek Lisans, Avrasya Araştırmaları

Danışman: Doç. Dr. Işık Kuşçu Bonnenfant

Temmuz 2023, 158 sayfa

Sovyet Sosyalist Cumhuriyetleri Birlięi 1991'de yıkılınca, Türkçe konuşan cumhuriyetler bölgede ortaya çıkmıştır. Üzerinden çok zaman geçmeden, Türkiye bu ülkelerle yavaşça ilişki kurmaya başlamıştır. Bunu Türk dili konuşan ülkelerin bölgesel entegrasyon sürecini takip etti. Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkelerin bölgesel entegrasyon süreci 1992 yılında Ankara Zirvesi ile başlamış, ardından örgütün hükümetler arası yapısının şekillendięi 2009 yılında Nahçıvan Zirvesi izlemiştir. Ayrıca, İstanbul'da gerçekleşen 8. Zirvede, Organizasyon Türk Devletleri Teşkilatı adını almıştır. Ekonomik, kültürel, politik ve eğitim alanlarında işbirlięi yapan kuruluş, bölgesel entegrasyona temel oluşturmaktadır. Bu bağlamda örgüt, bölgede artan etkisi ile Türk ülkeleri ve bölge için önem arz etmektedir.

Bu çalışmanın amacı, Türk dili konuşan devletlerin örgütlenmesini yeni işlevselci bir bakış açısıyla analiz etmektir. Yeni işlevselci bakış açısına göre, entegrasyon sürecinde bir sektördeki iş birlięi dięer sektörü etkilemektedir. Bu argüman, Türki Cumhuriyetlerin bütünleşme süreci örneğinde kendini kanıtlamaktadır. Örneğin,

kültürel işbirliği eğitimdeki işbirliğini otomatik olarak etkilemektedir. Yeni İşlevselci bakış açısının bir diğer argümanı, ekonomik işbirliğinin başka işbirliği alanları yaratarak veya geliştirerek entegrasyonu daha da zorlamasıdır. Türk Devletleri Teşkilatı örneğinde ekonomik işbirliğinin ulaştırma ve turizmde işbirliği gibi diğer birçok işbirliği alanını etkilediği analiz edilebilir. Bu tezdeki temel argüman, Türk Devletleri Teşkilatı'nın, gelecekte üyeler arasındaki ilişkileri başarılı bir şekilde geliştireceği ve Yeni İşlevselci bir bakış açısıyla bölgesel entegrasyonu daha fazla geliştireceğidir.

Anahtar kelimeler: Yeni işlevselcilik, Türk Devletleri Teşkilatı, bölgesel entegrasyon

To my family

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

First of all, I would like to thank my supervisor Assoc. Prof. Dr. Işık Kuşçu for her guidance and patience. I have learned much from her.

Also, I would like to thank Prof. Dr. Oktay Tanrısever for his useful suggestions and support. He has helped me a lot in this process.

Also, I would like to express my gratitude for Assoc. Prof. Dr. Sezgin Mercan for his help.

As a matter of fact, all the academicians I have met during my MA have helped me learn new literature and widened my view. My journey in MA provided me to extend my knowledge of the field.

Finally, I have to express my gratitude for my parents, Demet and Osman Can Ünver, and my grandmother, Reşide Uysal, for their never-ending support and care. Without their support and care, I couldn't have completed this thesis.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PLAGIARISM	iii
ABSTRACT	iv
ÖZ.....	vi
DEDICATION	viii
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.....	ix
TABLE OF CONTENTS	x
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xii
CHAPTERS	
1. INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1. The Scope and Objective of the Thesis	3
1.2. Literature Review	4
1.3. Argument.....	18
1.4. Research Method.....	19
1.5. Organization of the Thesis	19
2. THE HISTORY OF THE INTEGRATION PROCESS OF THE ORGANIZATION OF TURKIC STAGES	21
2.1. Early History and the First Stage of Integration	21
2.2. The Second Stage (2001-2010) of the Turkic Integration Process	34
2.3. The Third Stage of The Turkic Integration (2010-Present)	42
3. CULTURAL COOPERATION	67
3.1. TURKSOY	71
4. COOPERATION IN ECONOMY	81
5. COOPERATION IN EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY	90
5.1. International Turkic Academy	96
5.2. The Orkhun Exchange Program.....	101
6. COOPERATION IN POLITICS.....	106
6.1. Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic Speaking Countries (TÜRKPA)	111

7. CONCLUDING REMARKS	123
REFERENCES.....	126
APPENDICES	
A. TURKISH SUMMARY / TÜRKÇE ÖZET	141
B. THESIS PERMISSION FORM / TEZ İZİN FORMU.....	158

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

BTC	Baku-Tbilisi-Ceyhan Pipeline
BRI	Belt and Road Initiative
BSEC	Black Sea Economic Cooperation
SAM	Center for Strategic Research
CICA	Conference on Interaction and Confidence Building Measures in Asia
CIS	Commonwealth of Independent States
CSCE	Conference on Security and Cooperation in Europe
CCTS	Cooperation Council for Turkic States
CoE	Council of Elders
CoE	Council of Europe
CFM	Council of Foreign Ministers
CHS	Council of Heads of States
ECO	Economic Cooperation Organization
EC	European Commission
EP	European Parliament
EU	European Union
ECSC	European Coal and Steel Community
DEIK	Foreign Economic Relations Abroad
GUAM	Georgia, Ukraine, Azerbaijan and Moldova
IRCICA	Research Center for Islamic History, Art and Culture
ICT	Information and Communication Technologies
ICOM	International Council of Museums
ICTM	International Council of Traditional Music
IPI	International Parliamentary Institution
IPU	Inter Parliamentary Union
ISME	International Society for Music Education
ISESCO	Islamic World Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

OSCE	Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe
OSCEPA	Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe Parliamentary Assembly
OIC	Organization of Islamic Cooperation
OTS	Organization of Turkic States
YTB	Presidency for Turks Abroad and Related Communities
SOC	Senior Officials Committee
SEA	Single European Act
SMEs	Small and Medium Sized Enterprises
TAP	Trans Adriatic Pipeline
TANAP	Trans Anatolian Natural Gas Pipeline
TİKA	Turkish Cooperation and Coordination Agency
THE	Times Higher Education
TRACECA	Transport Corridor Europe-Caucasus-Asia
TDK	Turkish Language Association
TRNC	Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus
Turkic Universiade	Turkic Universities Sports Games
TURKUNIB	Turkic Universities Union
TWESCO	International Turkic Academy
TURKSOY	International Organization for Turkic Culture
TURKPA	Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic Speaking States
USSR	Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
UN	United Nations
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
WCO	World Customs Organization

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

After the dissolution of the USSR in 1991, the independence of Turkic Republics opened a pathway for the integration and international cooperation of the Turkic countries. The five Turkic countries, which are Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Turkmenistan, Uzbekistan and Kyrgyzstan, constituted a special importance for Türkiye as they share common language and culture with Türkiye. For this reason, Türkiye quickly took action and recognized the newly independent Turkic Republics right after their establishment. In this sense, the relations between Türkiye and the Turkic Republics have started to improve after this recognition. The foreign policy elite, bureaucrats and journalists made several visits to the region in 1990s as a result of this new interest to the region. The visit of Former President Turgut Özal to the region was significant as it demonstrated the importance of the region in the foreign policy of Türkiye, in particular. Therefore, Turkish media started to attach importance to the region by making headlines about Central Asia and Azerbaijan.

In this regard, Türkiye needed to conduct its relations with the Turkic Republics in a multilateral platform, which can provide various cooperation areas and improve ties between Türkiye and the Turkic Republics. Ankara Agreement in 1992 initiated multilateral cooperation among the Turkic countries of Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Turkmenistan, Uzbekistan and Azerbaijan with Türkiye by starting the Summits of Heads of Turkic Speaking States. Also, this Agreement is significant in terms of starting a new era in the relations of Türkiye and Turkic republics in a multilateral platform. Then, the Nakhchivan Agreement made another turning point for the Turkic integration by enabling the full institutionalization of the Organization. As a matter of fact, the efforts of the member countries during the time period between the

Nakhchivan Agreement till now is important in terms of analyzing the progress it has made.

Since 1992, the member countries have been cooperating in many areas, such as economy, education, culture and political cooperation. Its progress so far indicates the importance of the region and the Turkic countries. The current and future impact of the Organization is also significant both for member states and for the great actors of the region, such as Russia and China. Since 1991, there had been various integration efforts in the region which involved the Turkic states of Eurasia along with Russia and China. An in-depth analysis of the Organization of Turkic States (OTS) as an attempt to ensure an institutionalized multilevel cooperation among Turkic states in various areas through the lenses of neofunctionalist theory will enable us to understand the role and relevance of the OTS.

This thesis aims to examine the process of integration between Türkiye and the Turkic Countries with the argument that neofunctionalist theory, with its emphasis on functional spillover concept, which suggests that one area of cooperation affects other areas of cooperation and pushes for further integration, is a proper analytical framework. In the case of the Organization of the Turkic States, the functional spillover exists in many areas. In particular, cooperation in culture prompted more cooperation in education. The efforts of TURKSOY, the Turkic Academy, Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation serves not only in one area but in multiple areas. It can be analyzed that efforts of those organizations serve both cultural and educational cooperation and further pushes for integration. In this sense, it can be argued that the efforts of umbrella institutions of the OTS are a good indicator of the functional spillover concept in Neofunctional theory. Besides, it can be argued that economic cooperation among member countries affects and generates other cooperation areas such as the cooperation in transport and energy. Within this context, it can be argued that Neofunctionalism is an appropriate theory for explaining the gradual process of integration within the Organization of Turkic States.

Another crucial finding of this thesis is that the OTS has made progress in many areas, including political cooperation. The member countries have increased their

level of political cooperation through the Summits and the work of TURKPA. The biggest indicator of this fact is that the member states has shown solidarity and unity with each other in international relations issues such as the riots in Kazakhstan in 2022, the Karabakh Conflict and the acceptance of Cyprus to the OTS and TURKPA as observer members. Indeed, it is noteworthy that Türkiye has gained supporters in the Cyprus issue through the OTS. Thus, despite being geographically far from the region, Türkiye has increased its influence in the region through the OTS.

1.1. The Scope and Objective of the Thesis

This thesis examines the integration process of Türkiye and the Turkic countries through the Organization of Turkic States (OTS) since the collapse of the USSR in 1991. This study begins with the year 1991 since it constitutes a milestone for the integration of Türkiye and the Turkic republics. In this sense, this thesis focuses on the aftermath of the dissolution of the USSR and development of the relations between Türkiye and the Turkic Republics; as the aforementioned relation leads to the formation of the Organization of Turkic States. Then, it analyses the history of the integration efforts of the Turkic countries and Türkiye through the efforts of the OTS.

Before giving brief information on the efforts of Türkiye to build ties with the Turkic countries, this study focuses on the history of the formation of the OTS in three phases. Those phases are the first phase (1992-2001), the second phase (2001-2010) and the third phase (2010-present). This framing of the phases is done on the basis of the particularly important dates in the evolution of the Organization of Turkic States. In this sense, the first phase pertains to the period from the 1992 Ankara Agreement, which is the beginning of the Summits of the Heads of States of Turkic Speaking States, to the 2001 when the regular high-level meetings (Summits) transformed into a fully institutionalized frame with the establishment of intergovernmental organization named Turkic Council". The second phase covers the period until the signing of the Nakhchivan Agreement in 2009, which changed the name as the Organization of Turkic States (OTS) and established a further institutionalized form. Following this, the third stage of the integration phase from 2009 up until now is

analyzed. The activities of the Organization and the critical decisions during the Summits are in the scope of this thesis.

Thus, the cooperation in culture, economy, education and politics are discussed throughout the thesis. The main reason behind this motivation is to demonstrate the relevance of Neofunctionalism and the Organization of Turkic States. As a matter of fact, the objective of this thesis is to prove that Neofunctionalism explains the formation of the Organization of Turkic States since there exists many examples of functional spillover in the history and activities of the Organization.

1.2. Literature Review

Neofunctionalism is the grand theory of the European Union and several other regional integration attempts¹. It is regarded as the first European integration theory by scholars of the European Union². Neofunctionalism is, as defined by Schmitter (2002), "A theory of regional integration that places major emphasis on the role of non-state actors especially, the secretariat of the regional organization involved and those interest associations and social movements that form at the level of the region-in providing the dynamic for further integration³". To clarify, it can be suggested that it is a theory based on actors, such as societal groups or institutions, making pragmatist moves to fulfill their interests⁴.

The aim of Neofunctionalism can be summarized as understanding the reasons, processes and consequences which resulted in regional integrati⁵. "Neofunctionalism endeavours to understand the variables that lead to regional integration⁶...".

¹ Zeynep Ozan, "A Neofunctionalist Approach to the EU's External Border Management: The Case of Frontex", *Middle East Technical University* (2021): 19.

² Carsten Stroby Jensen, "Neo-functionalism." *European Union Politics* 4 (2013): 54.

³ Philippe C Schmitter, "Neo-Neofunctionalism", *European Integration Theory* Vol. 6. No. (2004): 2.

⁴ Ben Rosamond, "The uniting of Europe and the foundation of EU studies: revisiting the Neofunctionalism of Ernst B. Haas." *Journal of European Public Policy* 12.2 (2005): 242.

⁵ Zeynep Ozan, "A Neofunctionalist Approach to the EU's External Border Management: The Case of Frontex", 20.

Neofunctionalism was adopted explicitly to challenge classical realism and idealism in the 1950s⁷. It has the assumptions of democratic pluralism in policy formulations of international matters by splitting the state into its actor components⁸. Thus, it is noteworthy that the idea of reconstruction built the framework of Neofunctionalism⁹. The intellectual bases of Neofunctionalism are functionalist, federalist and communication theories and group theories of American politics, which indirectly affect the theory itself¹⁰. Neofunctionalism and intergovernmentalism, which were studied by Andrew Moravschik (98), have minimal differences when analyzed at a metatheoretical level¹¹. Indeed, Neofunctionalism has several similarities with those base theories in this sense. For instance, economic interdependence was necessary for member states' preferences for both Liberal Intergovernmentalists and Neofunctionalists¹². Also, as another example, just as functionalism, Neofunctionalism attributes tremendous importance to mechanisms of decision-making, incremental change and learning process¹³.

The ontology of Neofunctionalism is soft rational choice, and it is about actors trying to realize their interests and do whatever means to reach this goal by the prevailing democratic order¹⁴.

⁶ Lee McGowan, "Theorising European Integration: revisiting Neofunctionalism and testing its suitability for explaining the development of EC competition policy?." *European Integration Online Papers* 11.3 (2007): 12.

⁷ Ernst B. Haas, "The Uniting of Europe and the Uniting of Latin America." *J. Common Mkt. Stud.* 5 (1966): xiv.

⁸ *Ibid*, xiv.

⁹ Jeffrey C. Alexander and Paul Colomy, "2. Neofunctionalism Today: Reconstructing a Theoretical Tradition." *Frontiers of Social Theory. the New Syntheses*. Columbia University Press, (1990): 46.

¹⁰ Arne Niemann, "Neofunctionalism", *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Politics* (2017): 15.

¹¹ Ben Rosamond, "The uniting of Europe and the foundation of EU studies: revisiting the Neofunctionalism of Ernst B. Haas.", 243.

¹² Thomas Risse, "Neofunctionalism, European identity, and the puzzles of European integration." *The Disparity of European Integration*. Routledge (2013): 299.

¹³ Arne Niemann, "Neofunctionalism", 15-16.

¹⁴ Ernst B. Haas, "The Uniting of Europe and the Uniting of Latin America", xv.

Neofunctionalism, born out of the European integration, can be thoroughly analyzed by analyzing the political science atmosphere of the 1950s¹⁵. The theory was built mainly by Ernst Haas, Leon Lindberg, and Philippe Schmitter in the 1950s and 1960s in response to the formation of the European Coal and Steel Community (ECSC) and the European Commission (EC)¹⁶. Another crucial figure in the intellectual inheritance of the theory is Jean Monnet, as he emphasized the significance of functional spillover even before it was mentioned in a theory¹⁷. Besides, the 1950s and 1960s were the times accepted as the heydays of this theory; since the development of the European integration seemed to be comprehended mostly by Neofunctionalism¹⁸. Again, until the mid-1970s, the theory was widely popular among researchers¹⁹. Thus, from its golden days in the 1960s, till the mid-1970s, this theory was modified to apply outside Western Europe²⁰. Indeed, between 1960 and 1980, in the first phase, the main argument of political scientists and international relations scholars was whether supranational institution building could be explained better by intergovernmentalism of Neofunctionalism²¹.

However, by the mid-1970s, Neofunctionalism was considered an outdated and almost dead theory, and even Haas stated that Neofunctionalism is obsolete²². The reason for this can probably be understood by the fact that in the 1970s, economic growth slowed worldwide, negatively affecting Europe's economy as well. As a result, "unprecedented economic growth" is necessary for regional integration.

¹⁵ Wolfgang Wessels, "Cleavages, controversies and convergence in European Union Studies." *Palgrave Advances in European Union Studies*. Palgrave Macmillan (2006): 243.

¹⁶ Arne Niemann, "Neofunctionalism", 1.

¹⁷ *Ibid*, p.16.

¹⁸ Arne Niemann, "Neofunctionalism", 1.

¹⁹ Carsten Stroby Jensen, "Neofunctionalist theories and the development of European social and labour market policy", *Common Mkt. Stud.* 38 (2000): 72.

²⁰ Philippe C Schmitter, "Neo-Neofunctionalism", *European Integration Theory*, 3.

²¹ Wiener, Antje. "Constructivism and sociological institutionalism." *Palgrave advances in European Union studies*. Palgrave Macmillan (2006): 48.

²² Arne Niemann, "Neofunctionalism", 8.

Thus, in the 1980s, the theory came back with the revival of the European integration²³. Philippe Schmitter started to reformulate Neofunctionalism at the beginning of the 1970s and returned to doing this in the 2000s²⁴. Schmitter added the role of exogenous factors, endogenous tensions and contradictions of regional integration projects to Neofunctionalism²⁵. Nevertheless, for instance, the work of Schmitter did not make any assumptions about the automaticity of the spillover. After the 1990s, the theory was revived²⁶ for several reasons. First, the theory became strong due to the general developments in the European Community²⁷. In the mid-1980s, the Single European Act (SEA) and the establishment a single market caused more economic and political cooperation in Western Europe²⁸.

There exist three characteristics of Neofunctionalism. First of all, the core concept of this theory is spillover²⁹. Spillover is the most popular concept in theory³⁰. As a matter of fact, Tannam (2006) describes the spillover as the central concept of the Neofunctionalist Theory³¹. Despite having many variants, spillover is generally considered the process in which political cooperation with a specific aim result in the adaptation of new goals. This situation necessitates more political cooperation³². "Haas' (1958) definition of spillover assumes that the creation and deepening of

²³ *Ibid*, p. 1.

²⁴ *Ibid*, p. 9.

²⁵ *Ibid*, p. 9.

²⁶ Carsten Stroyby Jensen, "Neo-functionalism", *European Union Politics* 4 (2013) :55.

²⁷ Carsten Stroyby Jensen, "Neo-functionalism", 61.

²⁸ *Ibid*, p. 61.

²⁹ *Ibid*, p. 54.

³⁰ Carsten Stroyby Jensen, "Neofunctionalist theories and the development of European social and labour market policy", 73.

³¹ Tannam, Etain. "Cross-border co-operation between Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland: Neofunctionalism revisited." *The British Journal of Politics and International Relations* 8.2 (2006): 257.

³² Carsten Stroyby Jensen, "Neofunctionalist theories and the development of European social and labour market policy", 73.

integration in one economic sector would create pressures for further economic sectors and greater authoritative capacity at the European level³³". In general, for Neofunctionalists, spillover is the mechanism and dynamism of regional integration, and the integration process is triggered by supranational actors rather than nation states³⁴. Thus, cooperation in one field means cooperation in another due to the spillover effect³⁵.

There are three types of spillover: functional, political and cultivated. First of all, functional or technical spillover takes place when a specific area of cooperation occurs; it triggers other areas of cooperation. In other words, for example, when a move to remove border controls happens in a specific region, it automatically triggers other areas of cooperation by placing new items on the agenda, such as crime prevention, immigration control and measures to prevent the spread of infectious diseases, etc.³⁶. An important example of functional spillover is the case of a single market that resulted from a situation in which one area of cooperation triggered another area of cooperation³⁷. Also, in the case of the European integration, when a cooperation started in the coal sector, it automatically pushes the cooperation in the energy sector³⁸.

Secondly, there is political spillover. In this type of spillover, actors take political actions and agendas form politically in some instances, as suggested by Neofunctionalists³⁹. This kind of spillover takes place in a more deliberated process.

³³ Zeynep Ozan, "A Neofunctionalist Approach to the EU's External Border Management: The Case of Frontex", 24

³⁴ *Ibid*, p. 24.

³⁵ Carsten Stroby Jensen, "Neo-functionalism", 54.

³⁶ Carsten Stroby Jensen, "Neofunctionalist theories and the development of European social and labour market policy", 74.

³⁷ Carsten Stroby Jensen, "Neo-functionalism", 57.

³⁸ Anastassia Obydenkova. "Comparative regionalism: Eurasian cooperation and European integration. The case for Neofunctionalism?." *Journal of Eurasian Studies* 2.2 (2011): 90.

³⁹ Carsten Stroby Jensen, "Neofunctionalist theories and the development of European social and labour market policy", 24.

It occurs when actors, such as political elites or interest groups, take action for supranational cooperation, which is necessary to solve the problems⁴⁰. Haas also suggested that political spillover exists when a shift of loyalties and attitudes occur among political actors⁴¹. Furthermore, it has to be included that this type of spillover is closely linked with the elite socialization process of the theory in furthering the integration⁴².

The last spillover type of Neofunctionalism is the cultivated spillover. "Cultivated spillover (Nye, 1971; Tranholm-Mikkelsen, 1991) is the term applied to integration processes in which specific issues are linked together for political rather than functional reasons⁴³". In other words, it happens when supranational actors, such as the European Commission (EC), further pursue integration when mediating between member states⁴⁴. In this type of spillover, the supranational institutions become an agent for integration as the authority they receive increases⁴⁵. The supranational institutions may promote the integration process by giving initiatives, being mediators, being policy entrepreneurs, etc.⁴⁶.

In addition, the role of social groups is another crucial factor in the process of integration⁴⁷. While governments may not demand further integration, it is, in fact, groups which may push for more integration in order to realize their goals⁴⁸. Haas

⁴⁰ Carsten Stroby Jensen, "Neo-functionalism", 57.

⁴¹ *Ibid*, p. 56.

⁴² Zeynep Ozan, "A Neofunctionalist Approach to the EU's External Border Management: The Case of Frontex", 26.

⁴³ Carsten Stroby, Jensen, "Neofunctionalist theories and the development of European social and labour market policy", 74.

⁴⁴ Carsten Stroby Jensen, "Neo-functionalism", 57-58.

⁴⁵ Zeynep Ozan, "A Neofunctionalist Approach to the EU's External Border Management: The Case of Frontex", 27.

⁴⁶ *Ibid*, p. 29.

⁴⁷ Carsten Stroby Jensen, "Neo-functionalism", 54.

⁴⁸ *Ibid*, p. 54.

suggested that interest groups and political parties would be the leads in further integration⁴⁹.

Another noteworthy feature of Neofunctionalism is that the integration occurs quasi-automatically due to the spillover effect and change in the loyalties of actors.

Furthermore, one aspect of Neofunctionalism is its characterization of the elitist approach to the European integration⁵⁰. To make it clear, it can be said that the role of a small group is essential for integration, and integration occurs due to functional and technical needs⁵¹. The theory emphasizes elite socialization, another aspect of the theory, which includes the learning process of officials and politicians in the decision-making process and societal groups in search of realizing their interests⁵².

Neofunctionalism happens when societal actors followed supranational rather than their governments to realize their interests⁵³. In turn, the supranational institutions would increase authority and legitimacy since they would be the sources of policies that satisfy social actors' demands⁵⁴.

Indeed, supranational institutions attribute particular importance to Neofunctionalists' view. The reason for this is the fact that those institutions drive forward the integration process⁵⁵.

Moreover, the second crucial aspect of the theory of Neofunctionalism is the development of supranational loyalties of actors, who are officials and politicians, in

⁴⁹ *Ibid*, p. 54.

⁵⁰ Carsten Stroby Jensen, "Neo-functionalism", 54.

⁵¹ *Ibid*, p. 54.

⁵² Zeynep Ozan, "A Neofunctionalist Approach to the EU's External Border Management: The Case of Frontex", 21-22.

⁵³ Ernst B. Haas, "The Uniting of Europe and the Uniting of Latin America", xiv.

⁵⁴ *Ibid*, p. xiv.

⁵⁵ Carsten Stroby Jensen, "Neo-functionalism", 58.

the integration process⁵⁶. However, it must be known that supranational institutions do not only consist of civil servants and bureaucrats⁵⁷. For instance, according to this theory, people involved in the supranational policy process would eventually develop European loyalties and preferences in the case of European integration⁵⁸. In this context, the Neofunctionalist view suggests that the integration process would create elites loyal to the supranational institution; therefore, they will try to convince national elites to more integration⁵⁹. Yet, those elites and interest groups can pressure governments to accelerate the integration process⁶⁰. The reason for this attitude, the loyalty transfer, can be explained by the fact that elites and interest groups chase their interests. There are several reasons, such as actors' admiration of the new attachment center or the pressure of supranational institutions on actors to conform⁶¹.

Nevertheless, the loyalty transfer of actors does not necessitate repudiation of the national state or elites, as described by Haas⁶². Indeed, the main reason for this is that actors can have multiple identities, and this causes multiple loyalties.

On the other hand, Neofunctionalism was criticized for many reasons. As a matter of fact, this is among the most criticized European integration theories⁶³. After its popular days in the 1960s, the theory was heavily criticized by intergovernmentalists and the Neofunctionalism sides⁶⁴. The critiques of Neofunctionalism suggested that the theory does not account for unintended consequences and that the loyalties of

⁵⁶ *Ibid*, p. 58.

⁵⁷ Carsten Stroby, Jensen, "Neofunctionalist theories and the development of European social and labour market policy", 76.

⁵⁸ Carsten Stroby Jensen, "Neo-functionalism", 58.

⁵⁹ *Ibid*, p. 59.

⁶⁰ *Ibid*, p. 59.

⁶¹ Thomas Risse, "Neofunctionalism, European identity, and the puzzles of European integration", 293.

⁶² *Ibid*, p. 293.

⁶³ Arne Niemann, "Neofunctionalism", 6.

⁶⁴ *Ibid*, p. 6.

actors can be multiple⁶⁵. Another criticism of Neofunctionalism was that the theory could not comprehend European integration by all means. It is limited to the number of necessities, such as all countries in the integration process are democracies. Those countries are developed and diversified in their productive systems⁶⁶. In addition to those, both liberal intergovernmentalist and liberal interdependence theorists criticized the theory by claiming that spillover may not take place and that the Neofunctionalism mindset is dependent mainly on economic determinism⁶⁷.

Moreover, Neofunctionalism was contested due to its actor-centeredness⁶⁸. As a matter of fact, it is true that Neofunctionalists have comprehended the importance of political and economic elites in creating integration as well as harnessing these elite activities by the nation states⁶⁹. Thus, it was declared by intergovernmentalists that Neofunctionalist theory does not recognize the importance of sovereignty consciousness and nationalism as an impediment to regional integration, systematically and naively⁷⁰. Another set of arguments was that Neofunctionalism assumes that economic growth will continue uninterrupted⁷¹. However, it can only be accepted as over-optimism since, in the 1970s, the falling growth rates and rising unemployment demonstrated that unprecedented economic growth was impossible⁷², despite the optimistic views of the 1950s and 1960s. A final criticism of Neofunctionalism was that the theory neglects the political processes and structures⁷³. Another criticism about the Neofunctionalists is that they do not

⁶⁵ *Ibid*, p. 6.

⁶⁶ Arne Niemann, "Neofunctionalism", 6.

⁶⁷ *Ibid*, p. 4.

⁶⁸ *Ibid*, p. 7.

⁶⁹ Etais Tannam, "Cross-border co-operation between Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland: Neofunctionalism revisited", 257.

⁷⁰ Arne Niemann, "Neofunctionalism", 7.

⁷¹ *Ibid*, p. 7.

⁷² *Ibid*, p. 7.

⁷³ Arne Niemann, "Neofunctionalism", *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Politics* (2017): 8.

consider exogenous shocks, or the outside world, as they only analyze the internal dynamics⁷⁴. For this reason, the concept of exogenous spillover was put forward by Niemann (2006) as a response to this criticism⁷⁵.

From the 1950s to the mid-1970s, it was popular among scholars and students in EU studies. However, in the 1970s, it lost its popularity due to the deteriorating economy and loss of economic development as Neofunctionalism took unprecedented economic growth as granted for regional integration. Neofunctionalism has three important spillover types, and those are functional, political and cultivated spillovers⁷⁶. According to this theory, economic cooperation triggers other areas of cooperation, providing the regional integration process. Another important aspect of this theory is the royalty transfers of elites and other actors. The elites push for integration more as they pursue their interests in integration. Due to criticisms, Neofunctionalism was handled by scholars such as Niemann (2017), and it was revised. Despite the criticisms, the theory skillfully analyzes the European integration process.

In this sense, actors have multiple loyalties. For instance, a Kazakh or a Turkmen does not need to object to the will of local politicians or their governments to fulfill the demands of the Organization of the Turkic States. On the other hand, this process does not require a shift in loyalties as multiple loyalties exist, and actors do not need to unrecognize the will of national elites to push for further integration.

Throughout this thesis, I will use the qualitative analysis method. This work is inspired by the Neofunctionalist approach and will apply the theory on the case of OTS and its integration process.

⁷⁴ Zeynep Ozan, "A Neofunctionalist Approach to the EU's External Border Management: The Case of Frontex", 28.

⁷⁵ *Ibid*, p. 29.

⁷⁶ Abdülkadir Çalışır, "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler İşbirliği Konseyi: Orta Asya'da Bölgesel İşbirliği ve Entegrasyon", Diss. *Anadolu University* (2021): 36.

The literature on Neofunctionalism is extensive but throughout this thesis, I utilized, to a great extent, the works of the following scholars: Haas (1968), Niemann (2017), Rosamond (2005), Alexander and Colomy(2005), Risse (2005), Scatter (2002), Jensen (2000, 2007), Wiener (2006), Wessel (2006) and Ozan (2021), Şener (2021), Erol (2007), McGowan (2007), Tannam (2006) and Obydenkova (2011). More specifically, the works of Niemann (2017), Haas(1968) and Jensen (2000, 2007) inspired this study with its through explanation of the questions of what Neofunctionalism is and how it is implemented. Also, the dissertations of Çalışır (2021) and Ozan (2021) assisted in answering those questions.

Despite the fact there exists various scholarly works on the history of the establishment of the Organization of Turkic States, the literature explaining the process before 2000 is limited. Also, there exists no access to the Declarations of the Summits before 2000s. Nevertheless, the studies of Fidan (2010) were useful in terms of describing the period of building relations with Türkiye and the Turkic Republics. Also, the articles of Somuncuoğlu (2017) and Dal and Erşen (2014) were useful in terms of understanding the media's views on the 1990s. Gündoğdu and Güler (2017)' and İpek's (2015)' works have particularly useful in this chapter in order to understand the establishment, aim and activities of TİKA, which was used as an instrument by Türkiye to reach out to the region. Thus, it can be added that the period between 1992 and 2001, the first stage of integration, was described by the works of Shadybekov (2019), Kasseinov (2019), Tanrısever and Ulutaş (2019), Amirbek, Anuarbekuly and Makhanov, (2017), Durmuş and Yılmaz (2012), Yılmaz (2019), Bıyıklı (2019), Kydralı (2013) and Karın (2015).

In the second stage of the integration, the literature describing the Summits and Declarations are more than the ones describing the first phase. Again, it can be said that Amirbek, Anuarbekuly and Makhanov, (2017) describes the second stage of the history of the OTS in detail. For this reason, I wielded from this article in explaining the Summits and the decisions taken in the second stage of integration. Besides, the Summit Declarations, which are available on the website of the Organization of Turkic States, are beneficial for this literature. Furthermore, there exists many works on Nakhchivan Agreement, which is significant for the OTS as it gave the

organization its current name and its institutional structure. It can be added that Sapiyev (2017) and Amrayev's (2019) piece has proved to be particularly useful while discussing the particular role and importance of the Nakhchivan Agreement for the integration of Turkic Speaking Countries. The article of Kydralı (2013) has also been an importance source establishing the role of the Nakhchivan Agreement for the Organization in terms of gaining its structural form.

In the third stage of the history of the OTS, the work of Shadybekov (2019) is beneficial on understanding the First, the Third and the Fifth Summits and the decisions that were taken on those Summits. For this reason, it contributed to this thesis. In addition to this, the work of Shakuenova (2019) and Sapiyev (2017) gives detailed information about the Second Summit of the Turkic Council and I wielded from their work. The works of Idrissov (2015), Akhmethkaliyeva, Amirbek, Parkhomchik and Şimşek (2015) and Çora, Hamzaoğlu and Eren (2022) are important in analyzing the importance of the Fourth, the Fifth and the Seventh Summits of the Turkic Council. Also the official documents as well as the articles of Kydralı (2013), Yesevi (2019) are also used in order to explain the structure of the Organization after the Nakhchivan Agreement. Apart from those, 2016 and 2017 activity reports of the Organization are wielded in order to further analyze the structure of the OTS.

In the chapter on cultural cooperation, Sapiyev (2021) emphasizes that before 1991 the Turkic population in the USSR was raised with only the Soviet ideology and it was not possible for Türkiye to have an influence on the people there (6-7). In this sense, the work of Sapiyev (2021) is beneficial in this literature. Purtaş (2017) described the idea that built the TURKSOY, which is organization promoting the common language, culture and history ties. Besides, the articles of Aliyi, Çakıcı and Keskin (2022) and Akıllı (2019), discuss the activities of TURKSOY. Apart from those, the articles of Shaukenova (2019) and Afandiyeva (2015) describe the Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation, which strengthens the cultural cooperation among the member activities.

Thus, in the TURKSOY Chapter, Purtaş (2017) and Aliyi, Çakıcı and Keskin (2022) which analyzes the establishment of TURKSOY, its activities and its function are wielded. Also, the article of Akıllı (2019) is beneficial in understanding TURKSOY, its members and its establishment aim. Further, the website of TURKSOY, which I used among those articles, gives detailed information about the activities of TURKSOY.

In the Chapter on Cooperation in Economy, the works of Kuskumbayev and Musabekova (2022), describe the core values of cooperation in economy, which are the market values, and Shaukenova (2019) is beneficial for describing the aims of the economic cooperation. Therefore, Kaygusuz (2021) and Keser, Çütçü, Eren (2021) contribute to this literature by giving information about the Turkic Business Council. It can be added that the article of Chaix (2019) assists to explain the economic cooperation furthermore. Thus, it is noteworthy that economic cooperation promotes other areas of cooperation in the case of the Turkic integration. For this, examples of energy cooperation, in which Sapiyev (2017), Afandieva (2015) and Shadybekov (2019) explain in detail, is narrated in this thesis. In the end of the chapter, the economic analysis of members and the OTS are discussed and the work of Chaix (2019) and Bagirov (2022) are used, while doing so.

In Chapter 5 of the thesis on the cooperation in education, language and science, the works of Candan and Şahin (2018) and Sapiyev (2021) are utilized in order to explain the Association of Turkic Union and Turkic Research Fund. The works of Kalambekova (2022) and Budak and Terzi (2021) are beneficial in terms of analyzing the scholarship and exchange programs while studying the cooperation in education and science among the member countries of the OTS. There are many articles on the International Turkic Academy. The articles of Karın (2015), Shaukenova (2019), Bıyıklı (2016), Sapiyev (2017) and Kydralı (2019) are beneficial in explaining the Academy. Furthermore, the Joint Universities and the Nomad Games are explained by Sapiyev (2021). At the end of the chapter, the evaluation of Balcı, Dündar and Gürbüz (2020) on the level of education in the member countries is used.

Nevertheless, in the following sub chapter, the Turkic Academy is discussed more elaborately. Kydralı (2015) gives detailed information about the establishment, opening and activities of the International Turkic Academy in the following sub-chapter. The units of the International Turkic Academy are explained in the article of Alyılmaz (2016). Moreover, the activities of the Academy are explained in the article of Kydralı (2019) and Bıyıklı (2021).

In the sub-chapter of the same chapter, the Orkhun Exchange Program, which was designed to provide cooperation in education among the member countries of the OTS, is analyzed. While studying the Orkhun Exchange Program, I used the analysis of Balcı and Dündar (2020) and Akıllı (2019) particularly, with regard to the history of it. In addition to those articles, the websites providing information about the program are used in order to further explain the Program.

Then, in Chapter 6 on political cooperation, the article of Yesevi (2022) and Sapiyev (2021) are wielded to discuss what the Organization is doing for political cooperation. The activities of election observation missions are explained in detail in the article of Sapiyev (2017). Also, the collective identity of the member countries and the problems in which the members show solidarity with each other are discussed extensively in the study of Yesevi (2022).

In the following sub-chapter, TURKPA is evaluated. In this chapter, the works of Durdular (2017) are used in analyzing the history and activities of the TURKPA. Besides, Arslan (2019) gives insights of the history of the TURKPA and Erdoğan (2014) gives information about the interior units of TURKPA. Furthermore, I benefitted from the websites of TURKPA while writing about its activities and the recent news about the institution. Despite the fact that the literature analyzing the TURKPA is limited, the website provided me with detailed information about the institution.

Finally in the concluding part, the analysis of Demir (2022) is used. This section analyses the pros and cons of the Organization of Turkic States. In this chapter, the relevance of the formation of the Organization of Turkic States is demonstrated

through several examples of Functional spillover that exist in the Turkic integration. In addition, I discussed how the OTS has progressed since the 1990s and the members of the OTS have started to show collective identity in many of the international relations issues and conflicts. The Karabakh Problem and the Riots in Kazakhstan are two of the challenges that member countries showed solidarity. Yet, the acceptance of TRNC as an observer member to both the OTS and TürkPA is a significant development in terms of solidarity and cooperation with Türkiye and the TRNC in international political issues

1.3. Argument

There exists several arguments and findings in this thesis. The main argument in this thesis is that the Neofunctionalism explains the establishment of the Organization of the Turkic States and the Turkic integration. Many examples throughout the thesis are provided to confirm this finding. First of all, functional spillover explains the many cases of cooperation between the member countries of the OTS. For instance, cultural cooperation between the member countries automatically affects the cooperation in member countries and this leads to more integration. More specifically, it can be said that when TURKSOY makes publications about the common culture and history of the Turkic people, it also, means an effort in cooperation in education as this will be a scholarly contribution. In addition to this, when the Turkic Academy organize conferences on Turkic culture, this effort develops cooperation in both education and culture. In this sense, one area of cooperation affects the other areas of cooperation.

Another argument is that economic cooperation among the member countries of the OTS leads to improvement in other areas of cooperation, in particular. For instance, the establishment of natural gas pipelines such as the Baku-Tbilisi-Ceyhan promotes to the cooperation both in energy and economy among the member countries. Again, it can be included that this is an example of functional spillover as one form of cooperation pushes for cooperation in other areas and this results with more integration. In addition to this, another example is that the idea of increasing trade among members (or improving economic cooperation) results with increasing

cooperation in transportation such as developing the Sister Ports Projects. Within this regard, Neofunctionalism explains the integration of Turkic countries and the formation of the OTS.

Thirdly, the final argument of this thesis is that the Organization of Turkic States has made institutional progress since its establishment in 1992. Apparently, the Organization has developed its capacity through the efforts of its members and umbrella institutions. As a matter of fact, this analysis can be made by the increasing activities of the Organization and its umbrella institutions. Besides, Hungary's acceptance as an observer country proves this argument as it is a clear indicator that the Organization has increased international standing as well. Apart from those, the Organization has improved its political cooperation through the efforts of member countries and TürkPA. Indeed, the Organization can show collective identity in many world issues. For instance, the OTS has showed solidarity in the riots in Kazakhstan in 2022 as well as in the Karabakh Conflict. Yet, the greatest example is that the Member Countries of the OTS showed solidarity with the Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus (TRNC) by accepting the TRNC as an observer member to the Organization and to the TürkPA.

1.4. Research Method

Qualitative analysis method is used in this thesis. In addition to academic articles, this study uses news articles about the Organization in addition to Organization's website. Apart from those, current news about the Organization of Turkic States, as well as the declarations and written statements by people in charge of umbrella institutions of the Organization were used in this study. It can be added that some politicians' declarations were also considered in this study. Thus, the websites of umbrella institutions are also wielded. Furthermore, some statistics and economic variables were taken into consideration.

1.5. Organization of the Thesis

In the introduction section, the topic and research question of the thesis are explained. Therefore, the *Scope and Objective*, *Literature Review*, *Argument*, *Research Method* and *Organization of Thesis* are discussed briefly in sub-chapters.

The historical process of the formation of the Organization of Turkic States, with its turning points, is explained in the second chapter. The crucial summit declarations and the decisions taken in those summits are examined in detail in this chapter.

Cultural cooperation among the member countries was analyzed in Chapter 3. In this chapter, the activities done to promote cultural Cooperation were depicted. In this context, the International Organization for Turkic Culture (TURKSOY) was particularly emphasized as it serves as an institution to organize and manage cultural activities among members.

Chapter 4 evaluates the economic cooperation among the member countries. This chapter handled economic relations, and the umbrella institutions providing economic activities among members, such as the Business Council, are examined.

Then, cooperation in education, science and technology was analyzed in the next chapter. In this chapter, the progress in this cooperation field was presented. Also, the Orkhun Exchange Program and the International Turkic Academy were analyzed by giving insights into their history and activities under the Organization of Turkic States umbrella.

In Chapter 6 on political cooperation was handled by explaining the activities of member countries in the political field. Besides, the history and activities of TURKPA were further expounded.

In the conclusion part, a general discussion of the findings of the thesis is provided. Besides, the relationship between the Organization and with Neofunctionalist Approach was evaluated through examples. Finally, in this part, the pros and cons of the Organization and its future were evaluated.

CHAPTER 2

THE HISTORY OF THE INTEGRATION PROCESS OF THE ORGANIZATION OF TURKIC STAGES

2.1. Early History and the First Stage of Integration

The integration process of the Turkic speaking countries did not start until the dissolution of the USSR in 1991. In this sense, it can be said that the dissolution of the USSR constitutes the first turning point for the integration of Turkic speaking countries. With this turning point, a window of opportunity opened for Turkey to fill the empty place in Central Asia which was left by the USSR⁷⁷.

It is, also, significant to remember that the presence of Türkiye was supported by the West and Western institutions. For instance, former US President George Bush (Sr) stressed that Türkiye stands as a model for the Turkic speaking post-Soviet countries while Former NATO Secretary General Manfred Wörner located Türkiye as an example to those newly established countries with its secular society and anti-radical politics⁷⁸. Therefore, these kinds of statements found its place in the Western press. For example, in 1991, the Associated Press made headlines about Türkiye being a model country for the newly established Turkic Republics while the Economist mentioned Türkiye as an epicenter in the region⁷⁹. Thus, other media outlets such as

⁷⁷ Zeeshan Fida, "Central Asia's Place in Turkey's Foreign Policy." *Policy Perspectives: The Journal of the Institute of Policy Studies* 15.1 (2018): 113.

⁷⁸ Hakan Fidan, "Turkish foreign policy towards Central Asia." *Journal of Balkan and Near Eastern Studies* 12.1 (2010): 113.

⁷⁹ Emel Parlar Dal and Emre Erşen, "Reassessing the "Turkish model" in the post-cold war era: A role theory perspective." *Turkish Studies* 15.2 (2014): 264.

Newsweek, Le Monde, Die Welt and The Washington Post were making the same headlines at that period⁸⁰. The main reason for this was the idea that Türkiye can reach through the region easily through common culture and language and combat Russian, Chinese and Iranian influence.

On the other hand, Türkiye would be supportive for those newly established Turkic Republics. The Turkic Republics made their voice hard in the Council of Europe, OECD, IMF, EU and NATO through Türkiye⁸¹. Therefore, Türkiye supported those Turkic Countries in their membership process in the Economic Cooperation Organization (ECO)⁸².

However, the communication channels, economies, industries, transportation and education systems of the Central Asian Countries had been structured mainly during the USSR period. As a matter of fact, those countries had turned dependent on Russia⁸³. Within this regard, Turkic speaking countries could not form a strong base of integration until the breakup of their dependencies from their Soviet past and the development of mutual relations among them⁸⁴. Therefore, in the early 1990s, the seeds of integration efforts were dispersed through relations between Türkiye and the Turkic republics in direct bilateral relations in areas as diverse as communication, transport, culture, education, trade and economy⁸⁵.

As a matter of fact, the 1990s marked a turning point for Türkiye's foreign policy and views towards the region. For this reason, several differences have occurred in Türkiye's Central Asia and Caucasia policy. For instance, the media coverage, which used to neglect the region before the 90s, started to assess and give place to the news

⁸⁰ *Ibid*, p. 264.

⁸¹ Hakan Fidan, "Turkish foreign policy towards Central Asia", 114.

⁸² *Ibid*.

⁸³ Aidarbek Amirbek, Almasbek Anuarbekuly, and Kanar Makhanov. "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Entegrasyonu: Tarihsel Geçmişi ve Kurumsallaşması." *Bölgesel Araştırmalar Dergisi* 1.3 (2017): 165.

⁸⁴ *Ibid*, p. 165.

⁸⁵ *Ibid*, p. 165.

concerning the region with great interest⁸⁶. Also, the Turkish International Cooperation and Development Agency (TİKA) was established on January 24, 1992, under the umbrella of the Turkish Ministry of Foreign Affairs, in order to send development assistance to the Turkic speaking countries, in particular⁸⁷. The main aim of TİKA can be summarized as coordinating the cooperation of Türkiye in the fields of economics, education, culture, art, history, research, language and alphabet, ethnography, tourism, administration, justice, security, communication, environment, science, and technology⁸⁸. As mentioned in the official website of the TİKA, the activities of the Organization turned more to long term projects and cooperation based on development than assistance⁸⁹. Throughout the 1990s, the economic interests in energy resources, pipeline projects in Central Asia and Caucasus and the threat of decreasing trade due to the ethnic conflict in the Balkans were on the agenda of the TİKA⁹⁰. The activities of TİKA have been continuing in Central Asia and Caucasia and it has extended its activities with more programs and more countries. As of 2023, TİKA has 63 offices in 61 countries⁹¹ and it has continued its assistance and projects in the culture, education, industry and health sectors⁹². As of 2022, TİKA had 118.075.915 TL of total budget for only projects in Central Asia and Caucous⁹³.

⁸⁶ B. Tümen Somuncuoğlu, "The 25th Anniversary of the Turkic Republics' Independence: A View from Turkey." *25th Anniversary of the Independence of Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan, and Turkey's Contribution to Development and Cooperation in the Turkic Region* (2016): 95.

⁸⁷ Abdullah Gündoğdu and Cafer Güler. "Kazakistan'ın Bağımsızlığının Tanınma Süreci Ve Türk Kamuoyundaki Yankıları." *Tarih Araştırmaları Dergisi* 36.61 (2017): 89.

⁸⁸ Hakan Fidan, "Turkish foreign policy towards Central Asia", 113.

⁸⁹ "About US", *TİKA*, https://www.tika.gov.tr/en/page/about_us-14650

⁹⁰ Pinar İpek, "Ideas and Change in Foreign Policy Instruments: Soft Power and the Case of the Turkish International Cooperation and Development Agency", *Foreign Policy Analysis* 11.2 (2015): 180.

⁹¹ "Türk İşbirliği ve Koordinasyon Ajansı- Faaliyet Raporu 2022", *TİKA*, <https://www.tika.gov.tr/upload/old/2023/FAAL%C4%B0YET%20RAPORU/T%C4%B0KA%202022%20%C4%B0dare%20Faaliyet%20Raporu.pdf>

⁹² *Ibid.*

⁹³ *Ibid.*

In general, the establishment of TİKA is significant as it constitutes importance for institutionalizing the regional policy and political orientation of Türkiye⁹⁴. In particular, through the activities of TİKA, Türkiye has increased its visibility and earn people's trust⁹⁵. Besides, TİKA assistance, which was used as a public diplomacy tool, provided cooperation between Türkiye and the Turkic states.

However, other instruments were quickly established in order to form areas of cooperation between Türkiye and the Turkic Republics other than TİKA. In 1992, the Black Sea Economic Cooperation Organization (BSEC) was established⁹⁶ with the member states of Türkiye, Azerbaijan, Albania, Georgia, Moldova, Romania, Serbia, Ukraine, Armenia, Bulgaria, Greece, North Macedonia and the Russian Federation⁹⁷. This was another effort of Türkiye to reach through the region.

Moreover, Turkish foreign policy elites attribute great importance to the region⁹⁸. It can be explained by the fact that relations with the Turkic countries were crucial in the Turkish foreign policy agenda after the dissolution of the USSR⁹⁹. In particular, Turgut Özal, the 8th president of Türkiye, was the one to give great effort and importance to the region in order to build and develop strong relations with the Turkic Countries¹⁰⁰.

It is noteworthy that Türkiye became the first country to recognize the independence of those Turkic countries after the collapse of the USSR¹⁰¹. Following this incident,

⁹⁴ Hakan Fidan, "Turkish foreign policy towards Central Asia", 113.

⁹⁵ Pinar İpek, "Ideas and Change in Foreign Policy Instruments: Soft Power and the Case of the Turkish International Cooperation and Development Agency", 188.

⁹⁶ Pınar Bilgin and Ali Bilgiç, "Turkey's" new" Foreign Policy Toward Eurasia." *Eurasian Geography and Economics* 52.2 (2011): 186.

⁹⁷ "Member States", *BSEC*, <http://www.bsec-organization.org/member-states>

⁹⁸ Hakan Fidan, "Turkish foreign policy towards Central Asia", 110.

⁹⁹ B. Tümen Somuncuoğlu, "The 25th Anniversary of the Turkic Republics' Independence: A View from Turkey", 95.

¹⁰⁰ *Ibid*, p. 95.

¹⁰¹ Zeeshan Fida, "Central Asia's Place in Turkey's Foreign Policy", 117.

the then Foreign Minister of Türkiye, Hikmet Çetin, made visits to all of the Turkic Republics and Ukraine between February 28 and March 6, 1992¹⁰². His visits were followed by the then President Süleyman Demirel's tour to all Central Asian Countries¹⁰³. Therefore, Türkiye became the first country to open diplomatic missions in those Turkic countries. Thus, in the beginning of 1992, Türkiye had signed more than 140 bilateral agreements and more than 1170 Turkish delegations had visited the Turkic countries¹⁰⁴. In this sense, it can be concluded that Türkiye has a strong wish to make contact and build ties with the Turkic countries.

Nevertheless, it is also significant to note that the integration efforts took some time and happened in various stages. In particular, the development stages of Turkic integration can be classified into three stages¹⁰⁵. The first stage, which comprises the efforts towards integration in the period of 1992- 2001, is when the actors sought for mutual interests and values, established modes of cooperation, and stressed unified positions in certain areas¹⁰⁶. The second stage (2001-2010) can be classified as the period when the actors aimed to advance and strengthen cooperation, looked for points of unity, and sought new impulses for the processes of integration¹⁰⁷. Finally, the third stage, which consists of the period from 2010 until today, can be defined as a period of establishing pragmatic relations implementation of joint scientific projects and building cooperation on a new stage of integration¹⁰⁸. The third stage can be defined more as building political and economic relations between member countries in a pragmatic base.

¹⁰² Mustafa Aydın, "Kafkasya ve Orta Asya ile İlişkiler", *Türk Dış Politikası, İletişim Yayınları* (2004): 4.

¹⁰³ *Ibid*, p. 4.

¹⁰⁴ Emel Parlar Dal and Emre Erşen, "Reassessing the "Turkish model" in the post-cold war era: A role theory perspective", 266.

¹⁰⁵ Kuvanchybek Shadybekov, "The Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States: Main Stages and Prospects of Development." *Turkic Council* (2019): p. 95.

¹⁰⁶ *Ibid*, p.95.

¹⁰⁷ Kuvanchybek Shadybekov, "The Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States: Main Stages and Prospects of Development", 95.

¹⁰⁸ *Ibid*, p.95.

"Following political, economic and inter-societal contacts which started in 1992, the first presidential summit held in Ankara on October 31, 1992, had paved the way towards a joint political will of Turkic republics regarding their mutual cooperation in all fields as well as their integration¹⁰⁹". This was also suggested by Tanrıseven and Ulutaş (2019): "Diplomatic, economic and cultural cooperation started quickly as the leaders of the Turkic-speaking states met in Ankara in October 1992¹¹⁰".

In this sense, with being the first step of the integration among Turkic speaking countries, the Ankara Summit, which was realized with the participation of the Presidents of Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan and hosted by the then Turkish President Turgut Özal in 1992¹¹¹ constituted a significant turning point for the integration of Turkic speaking countries. It was in the Ankara Summit that the reinforcement of the feeling of belonging to the same community, stressing the advantages of working together as one community and considering future joint projects started to form¹¹². In addition, participant countries agreed that the transportation capacities of the Turkic speaking countries should be improved so that the economies of those countries can have a more significant impact¹¹³. Therefore, President Özal stressed at the Summit that a strong union must be established on the example of a common market. Thus, he added that impediments that prevent the development of economic relations must be eliminated, and customs regimes must be united¹¹⁴. The Ankara Declaration, which included all

¹⁰⁹ Dysen Kasseinov, "The Importance of TURKSOY on the 10th Anniversary of the Nakhchivan Agreement." *Turkic Council* (2019): 42.

¹¹⁰ Ufuk Ulutaş and Oktay F. Tanrıseven. "The Turkic Council on the 10th Anniversary of the Nakhchivan Agreement: A View from Turkey." *Turkic Council* (2019): 113.

¹¹¹ *Ibid*, p. 113.

¹¹² Aidarbek Amirbek, Almasbek Anuarbekuly, and Kanar Makhanov, "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Entegrasyonu: Tarihsel Geçmişi ve Kurumsallaşması", 166.

¹¹³ Ufuk Ulutaş and Oktay F. Tanrıseven. "The Turkic Council on the 10th Anniversary of the Nakhchivan Agreement: A View from Turkey.", 113.

¹¹⁴ Aidarbek Amirbek, Almasbek Anuarbekuly, and Kanar Makhanov. "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Entegrasyonu: Tarihsel Geçmişi ve Kurumsallaşması", 167.

of these, was published by the Organization's member countries after the Ankara Summit.

Despite being a crucial step towards integration, it can be said that the Ankara Summit showed that the leaders of the Turkic speaking countries were less enthusiastic about integration than Türkiye; as they rejected integration projects such as Turkic Common Market and a Turkic Development and Investment Bank¹¹⁵. This can be the case at the beginning of the integration efforts, which had various reasons.

Yet, between 1994 and 2001, six meetings took place under the name of Turkic Speaking Countries' Heads of State Meetings. The joint discussions of those meetings were about reestablishing the ancient Silk Road, improving the comparative transportation networks and connecting natural gas and oil pipelines to the world via Türkiye¹¹⁶.

The second Summit of the Organization was agreed to happen in Baku in 1993. However, this day was coincided the same day with the planned meeting of the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS)¹¹⁷. In addition, this was the period when the Karabakh issue and the conflict between Azerbaijan and Armenia were prominent for Azerbaijan and the rest of the members. For those, the second Summit of the Turkic Speaking Countries took place in Istanbul in 1994. The participants were Azerbaijan's Head of State, Geidar Aliev, Kazakhstan's Head of State, Nursultan Nazarbayev, Kyrgyzstan's Head of State, Askar Akayev, Uzbekistan's

¹¹⁵ Şirin Akıner, "Regional cooperation in Central Asia." *School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London* (2007):196.

¹¹⁶ Aidarbek Amirbek, Almasbek Anuarbekuly, and Kanar Makhanov. "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Entegrasyonu: Tarihsel Geçmişi ve Kurumsallaşması", 168.

¹¹⁷ Mustafa Durmuş and Hakan Yılmaz, "Son yirmi yılda Türkiye'nin Orta Asya'ya yönelik dış politikası ve bölgedeki faaliyetleri" , *Bağımsızlıklarının Yirminci Yılında Orta Asya Cumhuriyetleri Türk Dilli Halklar-Türkiye ile İlişkileri Ankara: Atatürk Kültür Merkezi Yayınları* (2012): 488-489.

Head of State İslam Karimov and Turkmenistan's Head of State Saparmurad Niyazov and the Summit was hosted by the then Turkish President Süleyman Demirel¹¹⁸.

At the İstanbul Summit, the themes of independence, sovereignty, respect for territorial integrity and non-interference in internal affairs were the topics that were considered. According to the Declaration of the İstanbul Summit, the participants agreed on several points. Those points included, providing solidarity and joint action of the member countries in international organizations, the United Nations (UN) and the Conference on Security and Cooperation in Europe (CSCE) in particular, the importance of finding a peaceful resolution to the conflict between Azerbaijan and Armenia, which takes the UN Security Council values as the base, and pursuing student exchange programs with scholarships¹¹⁹. In addition, Azerbaijan, Türkiye, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan agreed that joint projects on natural gas and oil, managing vast natural resources and transporting them to the world markets, must be developed and realized¹²⁰. Furthermore, the development of the ancient Silk Road, the development of trade between Turkic-speaking countries, and the establishment of the Turkish Cooperation and Coordination Agency (TIKA) and Foreign Economic Relations Abroad (DEİK) and Eximbank were stated in the İstanbul Summit in 1993¹²¹. Thus, the member countries talked about developing the current air, sea and highways and establishing new transportation routes¹²². The final point of the İstanbul Summit was the backing of TURKSOY, which was established in Almaty in 1993¹²³.

¹¹⁸ Zirveler, *Organisation of Turkish Speaking Countries*, December 14, 2021, <https://www.turkkon.org/tr/zirveler>

¹¹⁹ Aidarbek Amirbek, Almasbek Anuarbekuly, and Kanar Makhanov. "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Entegrasyonu: Tarihsel Geçmişi ve Kurumsallaşması", 170.

¹²⁰ *Ibid*, p. 170.

¹²¹ Aidarbek Amirbek, Almasbek Anuarbekuly, and Kanar Makhanov. "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Entegrasyonu: Tarihsel Geçmişi ve Kurumsallaşması", 171.

¹²² *Ibid*, p. 171.

¹²³ *Ibid*, p. 171.

It is noteworthy that the Turkic speaking countries preferred Türkiye's offer of help to train their bureaucrats. This can be interpreted as a move to strengthen their independence against Russia and an investment in future generations to deter the Soviet understanding and build their historical identities within this perspective¹²⁴.

Therefore, it can be seen from the İstanbul Summit that the first step towards institutionalization happened with the joint decision of foreign ministers of participant countries or designated officers to gather in order to reconsider the decisions of the previous meeting and prepare for the next Summit¹²⁵.

At İstanbul Summit, "the Turkic speaking countries of Central Asia have started to embrace more to the world by developing mutual relations with the international organizations, with the help of Türkiye¹²⁶". Thus, those countries demanded to grow the new generation which would elude from the Soviet identity but instead have their own identity and start their education system which does not carry the Soviet elements¹²⁷. For this purpose, they sought the aid of Türkiye to open new universities in Turkic speaking Countries¹²⁸.

Then, the third Summit of the Turkic Speaking Countries' Heads of State took place in Bishkek in 1995¹²⁹. The participants were the Presidents of Azerbaijan, Türkiye, Kazakhstan, Uzbekistan and Turkmenistan¹³⁰. The talks at the Summit concerned developing cultural, economic and scientific ties between the member countries. For

¹²⁴ *Ibid*, p. 171.

¹²⁵ *Ibid*, p. 171.

¹²⁶ *Ibid*, p. 171.

¹²⁷ *Ibid*, p. 171.

¹²⁸ Aidarbek Amirbek, Almasbek Anuarbekuly, and Kanar Makhanov. "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Entegrasyonu: Tarihsel Geçmişi ve Kurumsallaşması", 171.

¹²⁹ Darkhan Kızıralı, Türk Konseyi (Türk Keneşi), *Türk Cumhuriyetleri ve Topluluğu Yılığ*ı Ankara: Hoca Ahmet Yesevi Üniversitesi Yayınları (2013): 578.

¹³⁰ *Ibid*, p. 578.

instance, providing direct transportation, enabling free circulation, improving the working hours of businessmen, removing the impediments of mutual trade, banking and insurance activities were discussed in the field of economy, in Bishkek Summit¹³¹. In addition to those, establishing mutual education institutions in order to improve cultural and humanitarian ties, organizing cultural days and feast were on the agenda in the field of culture and education¹³². Thus, the Heads of States of the Member Countries appreciated the establishment of joint universities, which are Kazakh-Turkish and Kyrgyz-Turkish Universities¹³³. Furthermore, it was stressed at the Summit that regional Cooperation in the field of information must be strengthened¹³⁴.

Furthermore, there were topics on security at the Bishkek Summit. Providing a peaceful resolution for the conflict between Azerbaijan and Armenia in accordance with the UN Security Council, backing the efforts of the states of the UN and OSCE to be more active in this issue, encouraging member countries to follow a single policy to combat illegal drug and human trafficking and finally, providing an international cooperation in order to combat terrorism were discussed in the field of security and stability¹³⁵.

Meanwhile, in 1996, the fourth Summit of the Turkic Speaking Heads of States took place in Tashkent¹³⁶. All of the member states attended the Tashkent Summit¹³⁷. In

¹³¹ Mustafa Bıyıklı, "Kırgızistan Dış Politikasında Türk Konseyi/Keneşi'nin Yeri." *Kırgızistan Araştırmaları* (2019): 147.

¹³² *Ibid*, p. 147.

¹³³ *Ibid*, p. 147.

¹³⁴ Aidarbek Amirbek, Almasbek Anuarbekuly, and Kanar Makhanov. "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Entegrasyonu: Tarihsel Geçmişi ve Kurumsallaşması", 173.

¹³⁵ Aidarbek Amirbek, Almasbek Anuarbekuly, and Kanar Makhanov. "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Entegrasyonu: Tarihsel Geçmişi ve Kurumsallaşması", 173-174.

¹³⁶ Darkhan Kydralı, "Türk Konseyi (Türk Keneşi)", *Türk Cumhuriyetleri ve Topluluğu Yıllığı Ankara: Hoca Ahmet Yesevi Üniversitesi Yayınları* (2013): 578.

¹³⁷ *Ibid*, p. 578.

this summit, it was agreed to establish the Secretariat of Turkic Speaking States' Summit and to prepare its charter¹³⁸. Those decisions were crucial since those were the first steps for the Organization towards institutionalization and the beginning of the Turkic integration to have an intergovernmental structure or identity.

Besides, there were several tasks given to the Secretariat of the Organization in the Bishkek Summit. Those tasks were the ensuring of the coordination of the documents which will be served to the officials of the Foreign Ministries and Heads of States and preparation of them; organizing seminars, conferences and symposiums in order to present the cultures, languages and successes of the member countries, and researching the historical records of the Turkic peoples and compilation as well as preparation of those records for publication¹³⁹. Moreover, it was discussed at the Summit that the Organization could form programs to develop appropriate infrastructure and tourism routes and make efforts to introduce the history of Turkic speaking countries and internalize it in the societies¹⁴⁰. Apart from those, it was talked in the Summit that the efforts regarding the realization of Central Asia-Afghanistan-Pakistan transportation route to the Indian Ocean as part of the Transport Corridor Europe-Caucasus-Asia (TRACECA) Project¹⁴¹. Finally, the last topic discussed at the Tashkent Summit was the increasing Cooperation among Turkic speaking states to fight terrorism, which can be said a mutual concern for the member countries since it is regularly mentioned in the rest of Summits.

After the Tashkent Summit, the fifth Gathering of the Heads of the States of Turkic Speaking Countries was hosted in Astana in 1998¹⁴². It has to be noted that

¹³⁸ *Ibid*, p. 578.

¹³⁹ Aidarbek Amirbek, Almasbek Anuarbekuly, and Kanar Makhanov, "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Entegrasyonu: Tarihsel Geçmişi ve Kurumsallaşması", 175.

¹⁴⁰ Aidarbek Amirbek, Almasbek Anuarbekuly, and Kanar Makhanov. "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Entegrasyonu: Tarihsel Geçmişi ve Kurumsallaşması", 176.

¹⁴¹ *Ibid*, p. 176.

¹⁴² Presidential Summits, *Organization of Turkic Speaking States*, <https://www.turkkon.org/en/zirveler>

Uzbekistan and Turkmenistan were not represented as Heads of State in this Summit, as they were more obscure to the integration, while the other members did so. The reason of this is the “active neutrality” policy Turkmenistan followed at that period¹⁴³. The final decisions of the Astana Summit were: the admission of the Charter of the Organization; pursuing and intensifying economic relations among the member countries and reviving the ancient Silk Road, in this context; making in order to reach the energy resources of the region to the world markets; giving support to the international conference on the development of Europe, Caucasia and Asia transportation corridor; promoting joint consortium on industry, agriculture, transportation and communication infrastructure; supporting the efforts of Kazakhstan to initiate Conference Building Measures with Asia, supporting to find a peaceful resolution of the conflict between Azerbaijan and Armenia, within the framework of the relevant resolution decisions of the UN Security Council and the three principles of the OSCE Lisbon Summit; and finally, increasing international cooperation in order to combat terrorism, separatism and fundamentalism¹⁴⁴.

The Sixth Summit of the Heads of the States of Turkic Speaking Countries was hosted by Azerbaijan, in Baku, in 2000¹⁴⁵. In this Summit, Uzbekistan and Turkmenistan were represented as parliamentary speakers whereas the presidents of the other members attended in this summit¹⁴⁶. The remarkable point of the Baku Summit was the establishment of the Permanent Secretariat in Türkiye¹⁴⁷ in response to the 15th article of the Baku Declaration.

¹⁴³ Baha Ahmet Yılmaz, "Soğuk Savaş Sonrası Türk-Orta Asya İlişkilerinde Türk Keneşi'nin Rolü: Dönemler ve Değişim Dinamikleri." *Barış Araştırmaları ve Çatışma Çözümleri Dergisi* 7.1 (2019): 10.

¹⁴⁴ Aidarbek Amirbek, Almasbek Anuarbekuly, and Kanar Makhanov. "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Entegrasyonu: Tarihsel Geçmişi ve Kurumsallaşması", 176-177.

¹⁴⁵ Darkhan Kydralı, "Türk Konseyi (Türk Keneşi)", *Türk Cumhuriyetleri ve Topuluğu Yıllığı Ankara: Hoca Ahmet Yesevi Üniversitesi Yayınları* (2013): 578.

¹⁴⁶ *Ibid*, p. 578.

¹⁴⁷ Mustafa Durmuş and Hakan Yılmaz, "Son Yirmi Yılda Türkiye'nin Orta Asya'ya Yönelik Dış Politikası ve Bölgedeki faaliyetleri" , 489.

The themes of the Sixth Summit were primarily political and cultural Cooperation, energy and trade. It was discussed at the Summit that the Turkic speaking countries can develop and strengthen Cooperation in science, culture, education and information exchange¹⁴⁸. Further, President Nursultan Nazarbayev of Kazakhstan proposed the foundation of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Turkic Speaking States, which could work with the Council of Elders¹⁴⁹. In addition to this, it was stressed in the Baku Summit that the member countries of the Turkic speaking countries could form an effective mechanism for international Cooperation in order to combat terrorism, fundamentalism and separatism, and therefore, the member countries can provide information network for this field¹⁵⁰. Further, another political discussion of the Summit was about maintaining cooperation between the parliaments and central and local bodies and non-governmental institutions¹⁵¹. Apart from those, "supporting the peaceful resolution of the conflict between Azerbaijan and Armenia within the framework of the relevant resolutions of the UN Security Council and the three principles of the OSCE Lisbon Summit¹⁵²," was another theme of discussion in the Baku Summit.

The topics of the economy were salient in the Baku Summit. For instance, it was mentioned that the revival of the ancient Silk Road strengthened the economic relations of the countries in the region based on mutual interests¹⁵³. Also, another topic of discussion was to realize agreements to provide a free transition of exports

¹⁴⁸ Aidarbek Amirbek, Almasbek Anuarbekuly, and Kanar Makhanov. "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Entegrasyonu: Tarihsel Geçmişi ve Kurumsallaşması", 179.

¹⁴⁹ Yerlan Karın, "The Evolution of Turkic Integration: An Institutional Foundation for Interstate Relations." *Fifth Summit of the Turkic Council: A rising actor in regional cooperation in Eurasia*. Ankara: Center for Strategic Research 11 (2015): 43.

¹⁵⁰ Aidarbek Amirbek, Almasbek Anuarbekuly, and Kanar Makhanov. "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Entegrasyonu: Tarihsel Geçmişi ve Kurumsallaşması", 180.

¹⁵¹ *Ibid*, p. 180.

¹⁵² *Ibid*, p. 180.

¹⁵³ *Ibid*, p. 179.

and imports from the Europe-Caucasia- Asia Corridor¹⁵⁴. Thirdly, realizing economic reforms and information and experiencing a transition to developing scientific and technic cooperation in large and middle-sized corporations were stated¹⁵⁵.

In terms of energy, there were two discussions at the Baku Summit. The first one was about the extraction and management of natural gas and oil of the member countries while backing private financial corporations to use the hydroelectric resources. In addition to this, the importance of establishing of Europe-Caspian Transit Natural Gas Pipeline and the forming cooperation to establish this pipeline was stressed¹⁵⁶.

2.2. The Second Stage (2001-2010) of the Turkic Integration Process

The Second Stage of the Turkic integration started with the 2001 İstanbul Summit, the seventh Summit of the Turkic Speaking Heads of State¹⁵⁷. In the seventh Summit, Uzbekistan was represented as the President of the Assembly¹⁵⁸ as different than the other member countries. In the İstanbul Summit the name change of the Organization from the Summit of the Turkic Speaking States to the Turkic Language Speaking Countries was approved¹⁵⁹. Besides, it was proposed by the former Kazakh President Nazarbayev to establish TürkPA and the Council of Elders¹⁶⁰.

¹⁵⁴ *Ibid*, p. 179.

¹⁵⁵ *Ibid*, p. 180.

¹⁵⁶ Mustafa Bıyıklı, "Kırgızistan Dış Politikasında Türk Konseyi/Keneşi'nin Yeri." *Kırgızistan Araştırmaları* (2019): 147.

¹⁵⁷ Presidential Summits, *Organization of Turkic Speaking States*, <https://www.turkkon.org/en/zirveler>

¹⁵⁸ Aidarbek Amirbek, Almasbek Anuarbekuly, and Kanar Makhanov. "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Entegrasyonu: Tarihsel Geçmişi ve Kurumsallaşması", 180.

¹⁵⁹ *Ibid*, p. 180.

¹⁶⁰ Mustafa Durmuş and Hakan Yılmaz, "Son Yirmi Yılda Türkiye'nin Orta Asya'ya Yönelik Dış Politikası ve Bölgedeki faaliyetleri", 489.

After the İstanbul Summit, the Organization's next Summit happened five years later. The reason of this can be explained by the Near Abroad Policy of the Russian Federation¹⁶¹. Indeed, Moscow implemented this policy in Central Asia in early 2000s and this resulted the Summits of Turkic Speaking Countries to not take place until 2006. In 2006, the eighth Summit of the Organization was held in Antalya¹⁶². Apart from those, Heads of State of Türkiye, Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan participated in the eight summits. Uzbekistan did not attend the Antalya Summit, and Turkmenistan was represented by its Ankara Ambassador¹⁶³.

At the end of the Antalya Summit, the Antalya Declaration was published. In this Declaration, the cooperation on the formation of stability and peace in the area of Turkic speaking Countries, assuring the fundamental rights and freedoms of the Turkic Speaking people in Iraq and lastly, fighting together against terrorism, separatism, radicalism, drug trafficking, weapon trafficking and human trafficking were emphasized in the fields of security¹⁶⁴.

In addition to those, supplying the support of the private sector for enhancing cooperation; supporting the joint projects on the industry, agriculture, transportation and tourism; increasing joint efforts on diversifying energy routes; realizing of Baku-Tbilisi-Ceyhan gas pipeline and procuring the complementation of the Baku-Tbilisi-Erzurum gas pipeline were stressed in the fields of economy and energy; implying the project of Kars-Ahılkelek-Tbilisi-Baku railroad and adding Bishkek route to İstanbul- Almati rail line¹⁶⁵. Thus, it can be added that the effort to fasten and ease

¹⁶¹ Aidarbek Amirbek, Almasbek Anuarbekuly, and Kanar Makhanov. "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Entegrasyonu: Tarihsel Geçmişi ve Kurumsallaşması", 180.

¹⁶² Presidential Summits, *Organization of Turkic Speaking States*, <https://www.turkkon.org/en/zirveler>

¹⁶³ Aidarbek Amirbek, Almasbek Anuarbekuly, and Kanar Makhanov. "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Entegrasyonu: Tarihsel Geçmişi ve Kurumsallaşması", 183.

¹⁶⁴ *Ibid*, p. 183.

¹⁶⁵ *Ibid*, p. 183.

visa procedures between member countries was also mentioned at the Antalya Summit¹⁶⁶.

Furthermore, themes on political and cultural subjects were handled in the eighth summit. For instance, promoting the continuation of TÜRKSÖY in the fields of cultural cooperation and promoting common Turkic culture; backing the presidency of Kazakhstan in OSCE; advocating a comprehensive solution to the Cyprus issue¹⁶⁷ were declared in the Antalya Declaration. Moreover, extended cooperation within the Islamic Conference Organization; backing the candidacy of Türkiye in the 2009-2010 period, Kazakhstan in the 2010-2011 period and Kyrgyzstan in the 2012-2013 period for the UN Security Council; encouraging a peaceful solution for the Karabakh Conflict within the independence and immunity of Azerbaijan¹⁶⁸ were discussed in this Summit.

Then, the Nakhchivan Summit, which can be accepted as a milestone for the integration of the Turkic speaking countries, took place in 2009. This Summit is a milestone for the Turkic integration for two reasons. First, the Organization took the name of the Turkic Council in Nakhchivan Summit¹⁶⁹. As a matter of fact, "The Cooperation Council of Turkish Speaking States (Turkic Council) has been established by the Nakhchivan Agreement in 2009 and takes the form of an intergovernmental organization bringing together Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Türkiye¹⁷⁰". Also, concerning this, a new institutional foundation of

¹⁶⁶ *Ibid*, p. 183.

¹⁶⁷ *Ibid*, p. 184.

¹⁶⁸ Aidarbek Amirbek, Almasbek Anuarbekuly, and Kanar Makhanov. "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Entegrasyonu: Tarihsel Geçmişi ve Kurumsallaşması", 184.

¹⁶⁹ Yerkebulan Sapiyev, "Kazakhstan's Role In Strengthening The Turkic Council And Regional Cooperation In Central Asia", Diss. Istanbul Aydın University Institute Of Social Sciences (2017): 38.

¹⁷⁰ Pierre Chaix, "The Turkic Council's Policy in Central Asia and the Caucasus: Assessment and Prospects", *Avrasya Dünyası* 4 (2019): 40.

the Turkic Countries was provided with establishing the Cooperation Council of the Turkic Council¹⁷¹.

The participants of the Nakhchivan Summit were the heads of state of Kyrgyzstan, Kazakhstan, Azerbaijan and Türkiye, whom signed the Nakhchivan Agreement¹⁷². All members except Uzbekistan attended the Nakhchivan Summit¹⁷³. Also, Turkmenistan was represented at the level of vice-president.

In Nakhchivan Agreement, the establishment of the Cooperation Council of the Turkic Speaking States was decided, with the initiative of the First President of Kazakhstan, Nursultan Nazarbayev. This can be considered a crucial achievement for the Turkic integration as well as the future of the Turkic cooperation¹⁷⁴. It was stated that the Nakhchivan Agreement is coherent with the principles of international law and aims to intensify the level of cooperation among the Turkic Speaking countries and make efforts for peace and stability in the region¹⁷⁵.

In the strategic paper of the Nakhchivan Agreement, the purposes of the Cooperation Council of the Turkic speaking states were defined. Extending mutual confidence, friendship and good friendship between member countries; pursuing peace as well as extending security and confidence in the region; looking for typical mainstays in common foreign policy problems; acting together to fight against international terrorism, separatism, illegal drug and human trafficking; providing cooperation in the fields of politics, trade, economics and in the fields of military-technology, education, culture, energy, transportation, credit and finance were clarified in the

¹⁷¹ Yerlan Karın, “The Evolution of Turkic Integration: An Institutional Foundation for Interstate Relations”, 41.

¹⁷² Yerkebulan Sapiyev, “Kazakhstan’s Role In Strengthening The Turkic Council And Regional Cooperation In Central Asia”, 38.

¹⁷³ Mustafa Durmuş and Hakan Yılmaz, “Son Yirmi Yılda Türkiye’nin Orta Asya’ya Yönelik Dış Politikası ve Bölgedeki Faaliyetleri”, 490.

¹⁷⁴ Baghdad Amreyev, “The Turkic Council Begins A New Decade.” *Turkic Council*(2019): 27.

¹⁷⁵ *Ibid*, p. 27-28.

Nakhchivan Declaration¹⁷⁶. In addition to those, it was accepted in the same declaration that a better setting for trade and environment must be created, and simplification of customs, transit procedures and financial and banking procedures to be promoted as the mission of the Cooperation Council¹⁷⁷. Creating comprehensive and stable economic growth and social and cultural development in the area, performing joint actions was defined as another purpose of the Organization¹⁷⁸. Furthermore, increasing the level of interaction in science, technology, education, health, culture, sport and tourism and at the same time, bolstering the interaction of the mass media and interaction of the parties in order to spread and popularize the Turkic Culture¹⁷⁹ were among the purposes of the Cooperation Council of the Organization. Further aims of the Cooperation Council can be listed as conferring about the issues of how to provide a better rule of law, good governance, human rights and fundamental rights within the context of international law with the member countries; and promoting cooperation on an exchange of legal information to enhance better knowledge on the improvement of interaction, mutual legal assistance and cooperation¹⁸⁰. In general, the Second Article of the Nakhchivan Agreement summarizes the aims of the Cooperation Council as "encouraging effective regional and bilateral cooperation in political, commercial, economic issues and law enforcement, environment, culture, scientific-technical, military-technical education, energy, transport, credit and finance areas and other fields of common interest¹⁸¹". Nevertheless, the aim of the CCTS and the overall Turkic integration can

¹⁷⁶Nakhchivan Agreement, [turkkon.org,https://www.turkkon.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/nakhchivan-agreement-on-the-establishment-of-the-cooperation-council-of-turkic-speaking-states-1-en.pdf](https://www.turkkon.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/nakhchivan-agreement-on-the-establishment-of-the-cooperation-council-of-turkic-speaking-states-1-en.pdf)

¹⁷⁷ *Ibid.*

¹⁷⁸ *Ibid.*

¹⁷⁹ Nakhchivan Agreement, [turkkon.org,https://www.turkkon.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/nakhchivan-agreement-on-the-establishment-of-the-cooperation-council-of-turkic-speaking-states-1-en.pdf](https://www.turkkon.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/nakhchivan-agreement-on-the-establishment-of-the-cooperation-council-of-turkic-speaking-states-1-en.pdf)

¹⁸⁰ *Ibid.*

¹⁸¹ Ahmet Keser, İbrahim Çütcü, and Mehmet Vahit Eren, "Does country-level governance matter for national development? An analysis on the founding states of Turkic council." *Applied Economics* 54.5 (2022): 523.

be summarized as providing the development of member countries and the well-being of their citizens by deepening confidence, friendship and good neighborliness as well as ensuring peace, security and balance through cooperation and fighting against terrorism, separatism, radicalism and human and drug trafficking¹⁸².

With the Nakhchivan Agreement, the Organization gained an intergovernmental identity regarding its operational structure. Apart from defining the aims of the Cooperation Council, in the Nakhchivan Meeting, the structure and the functioning of the Organization was defined. Within this regard, it can be said that the institutional features of the Organization became clear. From Article 5 to Article 10 of the Nakhchivan Agreement, the purposes and structure of those organizations and their way of working were identified¹⁸³.

As mentioned by the Nakhchivan Agreement, the functioning of the Organization is realized through several organs and umbrella institutions. The Organization of the Turkic Council has five central bodies: the Council of Heads of State, the Council of Foreign Ministers, the Council of Elders, the Secretariat and lastly, the Senior Officials Committee¹⁸⁴.

First of all, the Heads of Council is the main body, chaired by the member country being the chairmanship in office at the time being, according to alphabetical order, is the main body responsible for taking decisions¹⁸⁵. The current Chair is Uzbekistan, and the former President of Uzbekistan, Shavkat Mirziyoyev, has been the current chairperson in the office¹⁸⁶. The Head of the Council is the main body that leads the

¹⁸² Kuvanchybek Shadybekov, "The Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States: Main Stages and Prospects of Development", 97.

¹⁸³ Nakhchivan Agreement, [turkkon.org,https://www.turkkon.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/nakhchivan-agreement-on-the-establishment-of-the-cooperation-council-of-turkic-speaking-states-1-en.pdf](https://www.turkkon.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/nakhchivan-agreement-on-the-establishment-of-the-cooperation-council-of-turkic-speaking-states-1-en.pdf)

¹⁸⁴ Çağla Gül Yesevi "Examining the Organization of Turkic States: A Teacher and Norm-Creator." *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 27.1 (2022): 7.

¹⁸⁵"Organization Chart", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/organizasyon-semasi>

motivations and activities of the Organization¹⁸⁷. Also, this Body adopts the summit declarations, evaluates past activity and brings new ideas for the next year¹⁸⁸.

Therefore, the Council of Foreign Ministers (CFM) is responsible for considering the Organization's current activities, collecting international issues for discussion in the meetings and ratifying the staff matrix and financial report of the Secretariat¹⁸⁹. The CFM meets regularly and annually before the Summits take place.

Furthermore, the Organization of Turkic States has a different body called the Council of Elders (CoE). The Council of Elders, which holds meetings semi-annually, the duty of the CoE can be summarized as submitting its opinions, proposals, and political advice to the CFM and the CHS¹⁹⁰.

Thus, the activities of the Organization are led by the Secretariat, which is located in Istanbul¹⁹¹. The Secretariat, which consists of 4 personnel from the member countries, is responsible of coordinating the cooperation processes of the Organization¹⁹².

The current Chair is from Uzbekistan. The former Kyrgyzstan Ambassador to Ankara, Kubanychbek Omuraliev, was appointed as the Secretary General of the

¹⁸⁶ "Chairman", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/baskan>

¹⁸⁷ "Annual Report 2017", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/yayinlar/turk-konseyi-2017-faaliyet-raporu-8-en.pdf>

¹⁸⁸ *Ibid.*

¹⁸⁹ "Annual Report 2016", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/yayinlar/turk-konseyi-2016-faaliyet-raporu-6-en.pdf>

¹⁹⁰ *Ibid.*

¹⁹¹ Darkhan Kydrali, "Türk Konseyi (Türk Keneşi)", *Türk Cumhuriyetleri ve Topluluğu Yıllığı* Ankara: Hoca Ahmet Yesevi Üniversitesi Yayınları (2013): 579.

¹⁹² *Ibid.*, p. 579.

Secretariat of the Organization of Turkic States by the Council of Heads of State at the 9th Summit of the Organization¹⁹³.

Thus, the Senior Officials Committee (SOC) is the official decision-making Body of the Organization¹⁹⁴. Coordinating the activities of the Secretariat, considering and ratifying draft documents, and evaluating those documents before the submission for the CFM and ratification by the CHS takes place¹⁹⁵.

Apart from those, the Organization of Turkic States has several umbrella organizations such as TURKSOY, TURKPA, International Turkic Academy, Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation and Turkic Chamber of Commerce and Industry to provide cooperation in different fields¹⁹⁶. Through those umbrella institutions, the Organization strengthens relations between the member countries and includes collaboration in culture, politics, education and economy.

Thus, in Article 4 of the Nakhchivan Agreement, to further intensify the Cooperation on science, education, and culture and strengthen cultural ties, the member countries decided to cooperate under the umbrella of TURKSOY¹⁹⁷.

Moreover, Article 11 states that the Organization has its budget, which was decided in another treaty, while Article 12 is about the members of the delegation and

¹⁹³“Ambassador Kubanychbek Omuraliev”, *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/genel-sekreter>

¹⁹⁴“Annual Report 2016”, *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/yayinlar/turk-konseyi-2016-faaliyet-raporu-6-en.pdf>

¹⁹⁵ *Ibid.*

¹⁹⁶“Organization Chart”, *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/organizasyon-semasi>

¹⁹⁷Nakhichevan Agreement, [turkkon.org, https://www.turkkon.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/nakhchivan-agreement-on-the-establishment-of-the-cooperation-council-of-turkic-speaking-states-1-en.pdf](https://www.turkkon.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/nakhchivan-agreement-on-the-establishment-of-the-cooperation-council-of-turkic-speaking-states-1-en.pdf)

participants in the sessions having host party privileges¹⁹⁸. Thus, it can be understood from Article 13 of the Nakhchivan Agreement that the permanent representatives to the Secretariat can be appointed through national legislation¹⁹⁹. Then, in Article 14 of the Nakhchivan Agreement, the parties of the member countries can cooperate with the relevant ministries to conduct work. At the same time, Article 15 suggests that the CCTS can communicate and build dialogue with international organizations²⁰⁰. Following this, the observer status for the countries was defined in Article 16. According to Article 17, both English and the dialects of the member countries are accepted as working languages of the CCTS²⁰¹. The remaining articles of the Nakhchivan Agreement are about the rules of procedure, its relations with other treaties, the times of settlement of disagreements, its amendments and additions and finally, the Nakhchivan Agreement's validity, entry into force and its accession²⁰².

It must be remembered that, in many ways, Nakhchivan Agreement is a milestone for the Organization of Turkic States as it not only gave the intergovernmental structure of the Organization but also showed the determination of the Turkic World to improve cooperation. It can be seen from the fact that more than 60 ministerial and 150 expert-level meetings took place after the Nakhchivan Agreement²⁰³, which indicates that the Turkic countries can enhance their ties more in the future.

2.3. The Third Stage of The Turkic Integration (2010-Present)

On September 16, 2010, the 10th Summit of the Heads of States of Turkic speaking countries took place in İstanbul²⁰⁴ and the İstanbul Declaration was signed by the

¹⁹⁸ *Ibid.*

¹⁹⁹ *Ibid.*

²⁰⁰ *Ibid.*

²⁰¹ *Ibid.*

²⁰² Nakhichevan Agreement, [turkkon.org,https://www.turkkon.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/nakhchivan-agreement-on-the-establishment-of-the-cooperation-council-of-turkic-speaking-states-1-en.pdf](https://www.turkkon.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/nakhchivan-agreement-on-the-establishment-of-the-cooperation-council-of-turkic-speaking-states-1-en.pdf)

²⁰³ Baghdad Amreyev, "The Turkic Council Begins A New Decade", 28.

²⁰⁴ Kuvanchybek Shadybekov, "The Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States: Main Stages and Prospects of Development", 97.

parties. İstanbul Summit, which started a new period for Turkic Integration, mainly was about member countries discussing their views on peace and security, improvement of economic Cooperation, activities of the CCTS Secretariat, the Council of Elders and the Academy of Turkic Peace and the organizational construction of the Turkic Cooperation²⁰⁵. At the end of the Summit, İstanbul Declaration was signed.

Then, the next Summit, which was called the First Summit of the CCTS, was realized in Almaty on October 21, 2011²⁰⁶. The main topic of the Almaty Meeting was dedicated to "Economic Cooperation of Turkic Speaking Countries²⁰⁷". The Presidents of Kazakhstan, Azerbaijan, and Kyrgyzstan, and then the Prime Minister of Türkiye attended this Summit²⁰⁸. Also, Dyusen Kasseinov, TURKSOY Secretary General and Ramil Hassanov, the Secretary General of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Turkic Speaking Countries (TÜRKPA) participated the Almaty Summit²⁰⁹. At this Summit, issues regarding Cooperation at the international and regional levels and extending cooperation in the fields of trade, economics, culture and issues related to humanity among the member countries²¹⁰.

The topics discussed by the member countries can be summarized under seven core themes: general issues, economic issues, international projects, security issues, social and cultural Issues, cooperation within international organizations and other Issues.

²⁰⁵ *Ibid*, p. 97.

²⁰⁶ Kuvanchybek Shadybekov, "The Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States: Main Stages and Prospects of Development", 98.

²⁰⁷ *Ibid*, p. 98.

²⁰⁸ "The First Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States was held in Almaty on October 20-21, 2011", *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkkon.org/en/haberler/the-1st-summit-of-the-cooperation-council-of-turkic-speaking-states-was-held-in-almaty-on-october-20-21-2011_144

²⁰⁹ *Ibid*.

²¹⁰ Yerkebulan Sapiyev, "Kazakhstan's Role In Strengthening The Turkic Council And Regional Cooperation In Central Asia", 47.

Primarily, under the theme of general issues, the member states emphasized that the Almaty Summit marks a new era for the Turkic World. Therefore, the member countries of the Turkic World are encouraged to enhance mutual interests, ties and unity due to their shared history, language and culture²¹¹. Besides, the member states expressed the importance of the mass media. For this reason, the member countries expressed gratitude for establishing the Media Platform of the Turkic Speaking States²¹². Furthermore, the member states identified the significant role of the Secretariat of the Turkic Council and remarked that the activities of the Council would provide dynamism for the Cooperation of the member countries²¹³.

For the topics on economy, the member countries first stated their intention to further build economic ties within themselves and emphasized the necessity of improving investment ties among the member states²¹⁴. Also, in the Almaty Declaration, it can be seen that the parties agreed on encouraging efforts to grant visas and work permits, especially for Turkic people in business and reinforce their wills on the foundation of an Insurance Company to secure trade transactions²¹⁵. Additionally, the member states "Noted efforts towards the Harmonization of Property acquisition legislation intending to remove of property acquisition barriers which negatively affect investors²¹⁶". Thus, the Organization offered its support to back the pioneering projects in the Public-Private Partnership Model and insisted that support must be given to the Ministers of economy, together with the Turkic Council, to form joint projects"²¹⁷.

²¹¹"Declaration of the First Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States", Organization of Turkic States, October 21, 2011, https://www.turkkon.org/assets/dokuman/Declaration_ENG.pdf

²¹² "Declaration of the First Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States", Organization of Turkic States, October 21, 2011, https://www.turkkon.org/assets/dokuman/Declaration_ENG.pdf

²¹³ *Ibid.*

²¹⁴ *Ibid.*

²¹⁵ *Ibid.*

²¹⁶ *Ibid.*

²¹⁷ *Ibid.*

Under the theme of international projects, the parties agreed on building a new railroad which passes through Baku, Tbilisi and Kars²¹⁸. Besides, increasing the potential of the Baku, Tbilisi, and Ceyhan pipeline was also a discussion point, as it is an essential source of energy for not only providing global energy security but also supporting sustainable development for the member countries²¹⁹.

Furthermore, several debates were made under the topic of security. First of all, the member countries expressed their commitment to sustain national and regional security, stability and peace in the region with their commitments to core values such as democracy, human rights, the rule of law, fundamental rights, etc.²²⁰. In addition to this, member countries restated their position on the change of borders by using force and added that fight against terrorism by the international community, sovereignty and territorial unity are significant indicators of security²²¹. Apart from those, member countries stressed the necessity of solidarity and joint action in fighting against terrorism, separatism, and human and drug trafficking; while emphasizing that the UN's role must be strengthened to solve the global and strategic challenges to sustain international security²²². Thus, in this Summit, the member countries declared their endorsements for providing international security with the achievement of arms control and non-proliferation of Weapons of Mass Destruction²²³. The peaceful settlement of the Nagorno-Karabakh Issue and Armenia-Azerbaijan conflict was handled in the Almaty Summit²²⁴, as well, as a top

²¹⁸ *Ibid.*

²¹⁹ "Declaration of the First Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States", Organization of Turkic States, October 21, 2011, https://www.turkkon.org/assets/dokuman/Declaration_ENG.pdf

²²⁰ *Ibid.*

²²¹ *Ibid.*

²²² *Ibid.*

²²³ *Ibid.*

²²⁴ *Ibid.*

security challenge. Additionally, support for the UN on the Resolution of the Cyprus conflict, backing the territorial integrity of Afghanistan, drawing attention to the need to pursue Iraq's sovereignty and territorial unity and ensuring the rights of Turkmans within this respect²²⁵. Finally, the member countries "welcomed effective actions of the Kyrgyz Republic in the reconstruction of the South of the Kyrgyz Republic after the tragic events in June 2010²²⁶".

For the social and cultural Issues, the decisions taken can be summarized as member states stating their satisfaction on the second plenary meeting of TURKPA, praising the work of TURKSOY, backing the proposal of TURKSOY to announce Eskişehir as the capital of Turkic Culture for the year 2013 and emphasizing the need for international cooperation for the efficient use of water²²⁷. Additionally, member countries expressed their wish to improve their cooperation in climate change and environmental challenges²²⁸. Thus, the establishment of a "Turkic Research Fund" was agreed upon between the parties to increase the research and development potential of the Turkic World. The establishment of the Turkic University Union was decided to develop further scientific development of the Turkic World²²⁹.

In cooperation within international organizations realm, the member countries first stated their strong support for Türkiye's accession process to the EU. They stressed the need for strengthening ties and solidarity within the Organization of Islamic Cooperation²³⁰. Besides, it was stressed that the Turkic Council should give support to the Conference of Interaction and Confidence Building Measures in Asia (CICA)

²²⁵ *Ibid.*

²²⁶ "Declaration of the First Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States", Organization of Turkic States, October 21, 2011, https://www.turkkon.org/assets/dokuman/Declaration_ENG.pdf

²²⁷ *Ibid.*

²²⁸ *Ibid.*

²²⁹ *Ibid.*

²³⁰ *Ibid.*

and that the observer status of the Turkic Council in the UN General Assembly should be improved more in the future²³¹. Also, the institutional cooperation between the Turkic Council and the Economic Cooperation Organization was welcomed. At the same time, the member countries also declared their wish to cooperate with the Council of Europe²³². Moreover, the rest of the decisions can be listed as inviting the Ministers of Foreign Affairs to meet regularly, encouraging the participation of the Turkic Council Secretariat to international organizations as an observer²³³. Finally, it can be said that the member states backed the decision to cooperate more with other international organizations to make the name and reputation of the Turkic Council to be more known²³⁴.

Then, under the item of "Other Issues", the member countries welcomed the results of the elections in Kyrgyzstan reinstating organization's support to the Kyrgyz Republic as well as congratulating Kazakhstan on the starting of its Chairmanship role in the Office of the Turkic Council²³⁵. Furthermore, the Council expressed its gratitude to Kazakhstan for hosting the Astana OSCE Summit on June 28-30, 2011 and therefore, the Almaty Summit ended with the decision of the Second Summit in 2012 to be held in Kyrgyzstan²³⁶.

In general, the member countries mostly talked about international and regional challenges, ways of strengthening cooperation in the fields of trade and economics and increasing cultural and humanitarian collaboration between the member

²³¹ *Ibid.*

²³² "Declaration of the First Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States", Organization of Turkic States, October 21, 2011, https://www.turkkon.org/assets/dokuman/Declaration_ENG.pdf

²³³ *Ibid.*

²³⁴ *Ibid.*

²³⁵ *Ibid.*

²³⁶ *Ibid.*

countries²³⁷. Above all, one of the most specific aims of the Almaty Session was to build mutual confidence between the member countries, provide political unity, develop economic and technical ties, increase popular relations among the member countries and continue the efforts on cultural and linguistic works²³⁸. After the end of the meeting, a final document named the Almaty Declaration was signed between the member countries²³⁹.

After the Almaty Summit, the Second Summit of the CCTS took place in Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan, on August 23, 2012, and it was "Cooperation in Education, Science, and Culture²⁴⁰". The Presidents of Kazakhstan, Türkiye, and Kyrgyzstan and the Prime Minister of Azerbaijan attended this Summit²⁴¹.

At the end of the Summit, parties signed the Bishkek Declaration along with the Agreement on the Financial Rules of the Secretariat of the Turkic Council, the Agreement on the Establishment of the International Turkic Academy and finally, the Agreement on the Establishment of the Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation²⁴².

Thus, the participants of the Summit signed a protocol on establishing a railway corridor, which passes through Kars, Baku, Tbilisi, Caspian Sea, Kazakhstan,

²³⁷“The First Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States was held in Almaty on October 20-21, 2011”, *Organization of Turkic States*.

²³⁸ *Ibid.*

²³⁹ “The First Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States was held in Almaty on October 20-21, 2011”, *Organization of Turkic States*.

²⁴⁰“Bishkek hosted the Second Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States”, *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkkon.org/en/haberler/bishkek-hosted-the-second-summit-of-the-cooperation-council-of-turkic-speaking-states> 98

²⁴¹ Zarema Shaukenova, “Turkic Council: Achievements and Prospects”, *Turkic Council* (2019): 84.

²⁴² *Ibid*, p. 84.

Kyrgyzstan and China²⁴³. Decisions were also taken at this Summit on the transportation field, as it drives economic Cooperation. The member countries of the CCTS discussed the issues of physical barriers to trade, bureaucratic impediments and other obstacles that can hinder trade²⁴⁴. Another topic that was talked about related to the economic field was ways to improve the current infrastructure of the member countries in order to increase economic cooperation²⁴⁵. Furthermore, it has to be noted that the Bishkek Summit adopted a protocol for the meeting of transport ministries of the member countries at the end of the Summit²⁴⁶.

The Third Summit of the CCTS, the topic of which was "Cooperation in the field of Transport and Communications", came after the Bishkek Summit and took place in Gabala, Azerbaijan, on August 16, 2013²⁴⁷. The Heads of State of Kazakhstan, Azerbaijan, Türkiye, and Kyrgyzstan attended the third Summit²⁴⁸ and the parties signed the Joint Gabala Declaration at the end of the Summit²⁴⁹.

At this Summit, the member countries also signed the "Convention of Cooperation among the Ministries of Foreign Affairs of the Turkic Council"²⁵⁰. Furthermore, the decision to extend the office of the Secretary General of the Turkic Council Halil Akıncı for one year was made by the member countries of the CCTS²⁵¹.

²⁴³ Yerkebulan Sapiyev, "Kazakhstan's Role In Strengthening The Turkic Council And Regional Cooperation In Central Asia", 49-50.

²⁴⁴ *Ibid*, p. 49.

²⁴⁵ Yerkebulan Sapiyev, "Kazakhstan's Role In Strengthening The Turkic Council And Regional Cooperation In Central Asia", 49.

²⁴⁶ Kuvanchybek Shadybekov, "The Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States: Main Stages and Prospects of Development", 99.

²⁴⁷ *Ibid*, p. 99.

²⁴⁸ Zarema Shaukenova, "Turkic Council: Achievements and Prospects", 84.

²⁴⁹ *Ibid*, p. 84.

²⁵⁰ Yerkebulan Sapiyev, "Kazakhstan's Role In Strengthening The Turkic Council And Regional Cooperation In Central Asia", 49.

²⁵¹ Zarema Shaukenova, "Turkic Council: Achievements and Prospects", 84.

After this, the Fourth Summit of the CCTS was realized in Bodrum, Türkiye, on June 2014, with the topic of "Cooperation in the Field of Tourism"²⁵². The leaders of Kazakhstan, Azerbaijan, Kyrgyzstan, Türkiye and Turkmenistan participated, respectively²⁵³. At the end of the Summit, Bodrum Declaration was signed by the parties²⁵⁴.

"The Decision of the heads of Member States on the appointment of a new Secretary General of the Turkic Council and his two deputies were signed following the meeting"²⁵⁵. Also, "At the summit, specific directions for deepening cooperation were worked out for the creation of a joint investment fund for the Turkic states, transport opportunities, tourism under the Silk Road brand, and the intensification of humanitarian cooperation"²⁵⁶. It has to be noted that for the first time in its history, Turkmen President Gurbanguly Berdimuhammedov attended the Summit of the Turkic Council²⁵⁷. In this sense, the expansion of the Organization started with his participation.

A discussion on establishing a joint TV Channel which gives the news on the global Turkic world was held during this Summit²⁵⁸. It was, as a matter of fact, Kazakh President Nursultan Nazarbayev who proposed to open a TV Channel that can enhance communication in the Turkic world²⁵⁹. Thus, again President Nazarbayev

²⁵² Kuvanchybek Shadybekov, "The Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States: Main Stages and Prospects of Development", 99.

²⁵³ Zarema Shaukenova, "Turkic Council: Achievements and Prospects", 85.

²⁵⁴ *Ibid*, p. 85.

²⁵⁵ *Ibid*, p. 85.

²⁵⁶ Kuvanchybek Shadybekov, "The Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States: Main Stages and Prospects of Development", 99-100.

²⁵⁷ Yerkebulan Sapiyev, "Kazakhstan's Role In Strengthening The Turkic Council And Regional Cooperation In Central Asia", 50.

²⁵⁸ Kuvanchybek Shadybekov, "The Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States: Main Stages and Prospects of Development", 100.

²⁵⁹ Erlan İdrissoy, "The Turkic Council: Engine of Turkic Integration." Fifth Summit of the Turkic Council: A rising actor in regional cooperation in Eurasia, *Center for Strategic Research* 11 (2015): 12.

stressed that the Turkic Academy could fund a program to provide better integration among the Turkic world²⁶⁰.

According to this Declaration, it can be understood that the member countries are adamant about developing fields of cooperation, such as economy, and trade, following the core principles of equality and mutual benefit²⁶¹.

Moreover, again in Astana, the Fifth Summit of the CCTS took place on September 11, 2015, with the agenda of "Cooperation in the Field of Information"²⁶² and the Presidents of Kazakhstan, Azerbaijan, Kyrgyzstan, the Deputy Prime minister of Turkmenistan and the Speaker of the Assembly of Turkish Republic attended²⁶³. In addition to the Astana Declaration, the member countries in the Summit decided to appoint the Deputy Secretary of the Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation²⁶⁴.

In the Astana Declaration, several decisions were taken in the fields of security, economy, culture, education and science.

First of all, in the field of economy and security, the decisions can be summarized as acting in concert on the fight against terrorism, puritanism and discrimination; exerting effort to provide peace and balance in the region; adopting a common language and attitude against challenges coming from the geopolitical environment; realizing the potential of being a transit corridor of the Caspian Sea; strengthening and encouraging cooperation in the economic area in the Silk Road region and building the intercontinental Eurasia Transport Corridor, which passes through the

²⁶⁰ *Ibid*, p. 12.

²⁶¹ "The First Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States was held in Almaty on October 20-21, 2011", *Organization of Turkic States*.

²⁶² Kuvanchybek Shadybekov, "The Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States: Main Stages and Prospects of Development", 100.

²⁶³ Zarema Shaukenova, "Turkic Council: Achievements and Prospects", 85.

²⁶⁴ *Ibid*, p. 86.

member countries of the CCTS; maintaining the efforts on the foundation of the joint Turkic Investment Fund; providing a solution to the Nagorno Karabakh issues about the sovereignty and territorial unity of the Azerbaijan Republic; capitalizing the efforts to gain the observer status of the United Nations for the Turkic Council²⁶⁵.

Besides, in the field of culture and education, the International Turkic Academy published a textbook named "A Common Turkic History Textbook", which is about the history of Turkic geography up until the 15th Century²⁶⁶. Thus, in this Summit, the decision to establish a TV Channel called "International Turkic News Channel" was taken in order to build a platform to convey news on typical Turkic Culture and information²⁶⁷. Furthermore, it was proposed by Kazakh President Nursultan Nazarbayev that it is necessary for Turkic Speaking Countries to cooperate more on education and science and for this purpose, the Akhmet Yassawi University can be turned into the First Joint University for the member countries²⁶⁸.

It was followed by the Sixth Summit, which took place in Cholpon Ata, Kyrgyzstan, on September 3, 2018, with the theme of "Cooperation in the Field of National Sports and Youth"²⁶⁹. The heads of the Kyrgyz Republic, Azerbaijan Republic, Kazakhstan Republic and Turkish Republic participated in the Cholpon Ata Summit²⁷⁰. It has to be noted that this Summit was the first Summit in which the

²⁶⁵ Lidiya Parkhomchik, Hayal Ayça Şimşek, Saule Akhmetkalyeva and Aidarbek Amirbek, "V Summit of the Turkic Council: Common Information Space and Enhancing Multilateral Cooperation", *Eurasian Research Institute* 33, September 2015, <https://eurasian-research.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/aae-bulten-en-33.pdf>

²⁶⁶ *Ibid.*

²⁶⁷ *Ibid.*

²⁶⁸ *Ibid.*

²⁶⁹ Kuvanchybek Shadybekov, "The Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States: Main Stages and Prospects of Development", 100.

²⁷⁰ *Ibid*, p.100.

heads of the Republic of Uzbekistan and the Prime Minister of Hungary attended the Summit with the status of Honorary guests²⁷¹.

One of the decisions that were taken in the sixth Summit was giving Hungary observer status in the CCTS²⁷². Thus, the parties agreed to appoint the Secretary General of the CCTS and his Deputy²⁷³.

During the Cholpon Ata Summit, the Chairmanship of the Turkic Council passed from Kazakhstan to Kyrgyzstan, and the parties summarized the activities of the Organization during 2014-2018²⁷⁴. Thus, Recep Tayyip Erdoğan of Türkiye proposed de-dollarization between the member countries in the Cholpon-Ata Summit²⁷⁵.

At the end of the Summit, the Cholpon-Ata Declaration was signed by the member countries. In this Declaration, the member countries took many decisions on politics, trade, culture and economy.

Apart from the Cholpon-Ata Declaration, several documents were signed by the member countries. These were named "The Concept of Integration of the Turkic Speaking States, the Decision to Strengthen Efforts for the Turkic Council's Obtaining an Observer Status at the United Nations General Assembly (UNGA) and the Joint Statement on the Development of Cooperation in the Field of National Sports and Youth Policy²⁷⁶".

²⁷¹ *Ibid*, p.100.

²⁷² Kuvanchybek Shadybekov, "The Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States: Main Stages and Prospects of Development", 102.

²⁷³ Zarema Shaukenova, "Turkic Council: Achievements and Prospects", 86.

²⁷⁴ Lidiya Parkhomchik, Dauren Aben and Kanat Makhanov, "The Sixth Summit of the Turkic Council: A New Era", *Eurasian Research Institute*, <https://eurasian-research.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/Weekly-e-bulletin-18-09-2018-24-09-2018-No-178.pdf>

²⁷⁵ *Ibid*.

²⁷⁶ Lidiya Parkhomchik, Dauren Aben and Kanat Makhanov, "The Sixth Summit of the Turkic Council: A New Era", *Eurasian Research Institute*, <https://eurasian-research.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/Weekly-e-bulletin-18-09-2018-24-09-2018-No-178.pdf>

Another notable announcement of the Cholpon-Ata Summit was the establishment of a joint tour package called the "Modern Silk Road", which can be identified as a tourist project in order to represent the shared cultural and historical past of the member countries in the ancient Silk Road²⁷⁷.

Moreover, the CCTS adopted a joint statement on the 90th Anniversary of writer and philosopher Chyngyz Aytmatov²⁷⁸.

The Seventh Summit of the Organization took place in Baku, on October 15, 2019²⁷⁹. The participants were Turkish President Recep Tayyip Erdoğan, Kazakhstan's President Nursultan Nazarbayev, Kyrgyzstan President Sooronbay Ceenbekov, Uzbekistan President Şevket Mirziyoyev and Hungarian Prime Minister Viktor Orbán²⁸⁰. Also, Turkmenistan was represented at the level of Deputy Prime Minister²⁸¹. Apart from those, representatives of the umbrella organizations, such as TURKSOY, TURKPA, Turkic Academy and the Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation, were in the Baku Summit²⁸².

Baku Declaration was published after the summit. Several decisions were under the headings of Cooperation in Economy, Foreign Policy/Security Issues and Relations with International Organizations, Social and Cultural Affairs, Education and Science, Institutional Cooperation in the Turkic World and organizational Issues²⁸³. In

²⁷⁷ Kuvanchybek Shadybekov, "The Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States: Main Stages and Prospects of Development", 106.

²⁷⁸ *Ibid*, p.106.

²⁷⁹ Halit Hamzaoglu, Hakan Çora, and Elnur Hasan Mikail, "Institutional Development and Cooperation Mechanisms of the Organization of Turkic States." *China-USA Business Review* 21.2 (2022): 66.

²⁸⁰ *Ibid*, p. 66.

²⁸¹ *Ibid*, p. 66.

²⁸² *Ibid*, p. 66.

²⁸³ "Declaration of The Seventh Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States", *Organization of Turkic*

economic cooperation, member countries agreed to be committed to create favourable conditions for mutual trade and investment²⁸⁴. In addition to this, the member countries welcomed the signing of “Memorandum of Understanding on Information and Experience Sharing on Various Types of Economic Zones”²⁸⁵. Therefore, the successful command of Investment and Business Forums on 5 October 2019 in Tashkent and Business Forum to be held on 14 October were agreed in the Baku Meeting²⁸⁶. Thus, it was stressed in the final declaration that the member countries support the decisions to hold the Fifth Meeting of the Ministry of Transport in Budapest, next year²⁸⁷. Moreover, it was mentioned in the Baku Declaration that the Organization supports the further intensification of customs cooperation among member countries²⁸⁸. Furthermore, it was decided that the Organization would support the action to have a joint satellite operation and welcome the implementation of decisions taken at the Third Meeting of the Ministers in charge of Information and Communication Technologies (ICT)²⁸⁹. Thus, it was declared that the member countries support organizing joint cyber security exercises as well as promoting startups in cyber security related fields²⁹⁰. Finally, it was instructed that the preparation of the Geo-economic Atlas of the Turkic World to be realized by Official Foreign Policy Centers²⁹¹. Apart from those, the former actions done in the economic field were appreciated by the member countries in Baku Declaration.

States,https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/seventh-summit-declaration-14-en.pdf

²⁸⁴ “Declaration of The Seventh Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States”, *Organization of Turkic*

States,https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/seventh-summit-declaration-14-en.pdf

²⁸⁵ *Ibid.*

²⁸⁶ *Ibid.*

²⁸⁷ *Ibid.*

²⁸⁸ *Ibid.*

²⁸⁹ *Ibid.*

²⁹⁰ *Ibid.*

²⁹¹ *Ibid.*

In Foreign Policy/Security Issues and Relations with International Organizations, the member countries appreciated the efforts of Member countries in active cooperation on foreign policy and security issues²⁹². In addition to this, the joint work program prepared by the Organization and the Economic Cooperation Organization (ECO) on 7-8 April 2019 was approved²⁹³. Moreover, the member states gave their support to Azerbaijan due to Nagorno Karabakh Conflict²⁹⁴. Furthermore, it was stressed in this declaration that the member countries should pursue close cooperation with World Customs Organization (WCO) through organizing events such as Organization of the Turkic Council Regional Workshop²⁹⁵. Finally, it was called on member countries to intensify their efforts on combatting all kinds of terrorism, separatism, extremism, discrimination, xenophobia and Islamophobia²⁹⁶. Apart from those, the past effort in this field were praised by the member countries in the Baku Declaration.

In Social and Cultural Affairs, it was declared that the member countries support the decision to realize the Turkic Council Second Diaspora Forum to be organized by the Presidency of the Turks Abroad (YTB)²⁹⁷. Also, it was stressed in the Baku Declaration that the decision of realizing the Second Meeting of Ministers in Charge of Information and Media of the Turkic Council on May 7, 2019 in Baku was supported by the members²⁹⁸. According to another article of the Baku Declaration, the member countries commended “the successful organization and contributions of the events held under the auspices of UNESCO, “International Maqom Art Festival”

²⁹²“Declaration of The Seventh Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States”, *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/seventh-summit-declaration-14-en.pdf

²⁹³ *Ibid.*

²⁹⁴ *Ibid.*

²⁹⁵ *Ibid.*

²⁹⁶ *Ibid.*

²⁹⁷ *Ibid.*

²⁹⁸ *Ibid.*

in 2018, International Music Festival²⁹⁹ ...” etc. Thus, it was mentioned in the Declaration that it is necessary to form cooperation between national TV Channels and news agencies³⁰⁰. In the 61th Article of the Baku Declaration, the organization of events by the Turkic Academy in 2019 in honor of important dates of the Turkic World, like 950th Anniversary of Yusuf Balasagun’s “Kutadgu Bilig”³⁰¹. It can be added that the member countries decided to support the decision of dedicating 2019 to the commemoration of 650th birthday of the Azerbaijani poet Imadeddin Nesimi and 125th anniversary of the birthday of Aşık Veysel for the TURKSOY’s Commemorative Year Program³⁰². The need to protect the common culture, history and gastronomy of the Turkic people was once again emphasized in this summit³⁰³. Apart from those, the need to finalize the work on the “Atlas of Sacred Places of the Turkic World” by the Turkic Academy and the need to intensify cooperation with World Ethnosport Confederation and Islamic Cooperation Youth Forum were emphasized in the Baku Declaration³⁰⁴.

Therefore, the Declaration mentioned several actions for cooperation in Education and science, such as backing the Third Student Exchange Program among secondary and high schools of the Member Countries and the enlargement of the Orkhun Exchange Program³⁰⁵. Also, it was tasked the finalization of the “Common Turkic History from Ancient Times till 15th Century Textbook” to the Turkic Academy and

²⁹⁹“Declaration of The Seventh Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States”, *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/seventh-summit-declaration-14-en.pdf

³⁰⁰ *Ibid.*

³⁰¹ *Ibid.*

³⁰² *Ibid.*

³⁰³ *Ibid.*

³⁰⁴ *Ibid.*

³⁰⁵“Declaration of The Seventh Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States”, *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/seventh-summit-declaration-14-en.pdf

the relevant authorities³⁰⁶. Furthermore, Member states expressed their pleasure with the participation of new universities from Türkiye and Hungary in TURKUNIB³⁰⁷. Thus, it was emphasized the need to the formation of exchange program in Turkic Council Secretariat, TURKPA, TURKSOY, Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation and Turkic Academy³⁰⁸.

Even after the emergence of COVID-19 Pandemic, the member countries gathered for the first time at an Extraordinary Summit in a video conference, upon the request of Azerbaijan President İlham Aliyev, on April 10, 2020³⁰⁹. The participants were President of Kazakhstan Kassym-Jomart Tokayev, President of the Kyrgyz Republic Sooronbay Zheenbekov, President of Türkiye Recep Tayyip Erdoğan, President of Uzbekistan Shavkat Mirziyoyev, President of Turkmenistan Gurbanguly Berdimuhamedov, Prime Minister of Hungary Viktor Orbán and Baghdad Amreyev, Secretary General of the Turkic Council³¹⁰.

After this video conference, Baku Declaration was adopted. In this declaration, the member countries agreed on fighting the pandemic together as well as supporting the international community on combatting this global catastrophe³¹¹. Also, it was emphasized in this declaration that the member countries are in view of supporting the UN and World Health Organization (WHO) by all means in its fight against

³⁰⁶ "Declaration of The Seventh Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States", *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/seventh-summit-declaration-14-en.pdf

³⁰⁷ *Ibid.*

³⁰⁸ *Ibid.*

³⁰⁹ Ömer Kocaman, "Adjusting to the "New Normal" of Post COVID-19: The Role of Organization of Turkic States in Multilateral Cooperation." *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 26.2 (2021): 193.

³¹⁰ "Baku Declaration of the Extraordinary Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States", *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/extraordinary-summit-baku-declaration-2020-17-en.pdf

³¹¹ *Ibid.*

pandemic³¹². The decisions published in the declaration were about fighting against the pandemic as 2020 marks the history with COVID-19.

On November 12, 2021, the Ninth Summit of the Organization was held in İstanbul³¹³. In the first parts of the İstanbul Declaration, it was confirmed that the Organization's name was changed to Organization of Turkic States from the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States³¹⁴. Besides, Turkic Word Vision 2040 was adopted by the Member countries³¹⁵. Thirdly, the member states emphasized the importance of fighting against terrorism, xenophobia, discrimination and Islamophobia³¹⁶. Thus, it was instructed by the Member countries that the security consultations should continue³¹⁷.

In the second part, named Economic and Sectoral Cooperation, it was instructed the finalization of the establishment Agreement of the Turkic Investment Fund, finalization of the "Trade Facilitation on Strategy Paper" in order to establish Turkic Trade Houses, initiation of cooperation on green technologies and smart cities, reinforcement of multilateral cooperation for sustainable agricultural development and stable food supply, finalization of "Agreement on the International Combined Freight Transport within the Organization", easing the customs and administrative procedures in order to benefit the Trans Caspian International East West Middle

³¹² "Baku Declaration of the Extraordinary Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States", *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/extraordinary-summit-baku-declaration-2020-17-en.pdf

³¹³ Halit Hamzaoglu, Hakan Çora, and Elnur Hasan Mikail, "Institutional Development and Cooperation Mechanisms of the Organization of Turkic States." *China-USA Business Review* 21.2 (2022): 66.

³¹⁴ "Declaration Of The Eight Summit Of The Organization Of Turkic States", *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/eighth-summit-declaration-15-en.pdf

³¹⁵ *Ibid.*

³¹⁶ "Declaration of The Eight Summit Of The Organization Of Turkic States", *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/eighth-summit-declaration-15-en.pdf

³¹⁷ *Ibid.*

Corridor with full potential, establishment of cooperation and coordination in the field of Space Technology Projects within the OTS and finally, initiation and promotion of cultural routes in order to travel and discover the heritage of the member countries³¹⁸.

Also, in this part, the Organization declared that the member countries promoted to prepare to work on proposals in order to increase trade turnover between members on pandemic constraints, provide further cooperation in tourism sector and working on this matter, develop the cooperation in science and technology by backing research, development and innovative projects, pursue out joint projects with WHO and health authorities, to encourage the Joint Declaration, which stressed the significance of global solidarity and cooperation in the field of health, on October 29, 2021, and, the practicing of the MoU among the Government Bodies of the Member countries regarding Information and experience sharing in the field of various types of economic zones³¹⁹.

In the next part, under People-to-People Cooperation, it was instructed to the relevant authorities of the member countries to back each other in the communication and public diplomacy areas for further improvement in relations, to form the exchange and experience programs among the Diaspora Institutions of the member countries and the Capacity Building Training Programs for the Diasporas of the member countries³²⁰. Therefore, it was instructed by the OTS to adopt the Regulation on the Alisher Novoi International Prize for the Organization, to organize the Ethno Folklore Festival “Uzgen-Munara-2021” in Kyrgyzstan, on September 17, 2021 and finally, to establish the production of the joint documentary film “Seven Facets of the

³¹⁸ “Declaration of The Eight Summit Of The Organization Of Turkic States”, *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/eighth-summit-declaration-15-en.pdf

³¹⁹ *Ibid.*

³²⁰ *Ibid.*

Great Steppe”, to establish a joint television project Korkyt Ata and the Turkish-Uzbekh Mendirman Jelaliddin TV Series³²¹.

Furthermore, in this part, it was mentioned that the member countries declared to cooperate further in media platforms, organize the Second Turkic University Sports Games in Kazakhstan, in 2022, and to pursue the convening role of the member countries in intercultural dialogue and back Azerbaijan’s work through Baku process³²².

Moreover, it was approved that the Member countries backed further improvement of communication amongst the Turkic Cooperation and work for the implementation of the common Turkic cooperation agenda, the improvement of the structural organization and rising its efficiency, the realization of election observation missions and referenda in member countries through TURKPA and the OTS and finally, organization of “Silk Road Rally from the Danube River to the Orkhun Valley” in 2022, through TURKSOY³²³.

Concerning the Cooperation with External Parties, it was confirmed to consolidate the active cooperation if member countries at international sphere encourage each other’s’ membership in international organizations and to back the Secretariat to develop cooperation with international organizations such as the UN and its agencies³²⁴.

In this Summit, Türkiye passed the chairmanship to Uzbekistan and Samarkand Declaration was published as a result. Then, the latest Summit of the Organization of Turkic States took place in Samarkand, Uzbekistan, on November 11, 2022, with the

³²¹ “Declaration of The Eight Summit Of The Organization Of Turkic States”, *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/eighth-summit-declaration-15-en.pdf

³²² *Ibid.*

³²³ *Ibid.*

³²⁴ *Ibid.*

theme of “A New Era of Turkic Civilization: On the Way to Common Development and Prosperity”³²⁵. The Presidents of Uzbekistan, Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Türkiye as well as the Prime Minister of Hungary were among the participants³²⁶. The Speaker of the Upper Parliament of Turkmenistan was there as well³²⁷.

In the Samarkand Declaration there were several main titles such as Cooperation in Political, Foreign Policy and Security Issues, Economic and Sectoral Cooperation, People-to-People Cooperation, Institutional Cooperation in the Turkic World, Cooperation with External Parties, and Organizational Issues³²⁸.

In the first part, it was instructed to continue security consultations among member countries, encourage Asia Anew Strategy of Türkiye and support an “inclusive and representative political system in Afghanistan”³²⁹.

In addition to those, it was agreed on signing the Protocol on amendments to the Nakhchivan Agreement on the Establishment of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States, implementing the “OTS Strategy for 2022-2026” and realizing the goals of “Turkic World Vision 2040”, accepting Turkish Cypriots as part of the Turkic World and adopting the new “Rules of Procedure of the Organization of Turkic States”³³⁰. Moreover, it was expressed to back the efforts of Kyrgyzstan in finding a peaceful solution to the issue of Kyrgyz-Tajik border conflict and to show

³²⁵ Elena Teslova, “Summit of Organization of Turkic States Kicks off in Samarkand, Uzbekistan”, Anadolu Agency, November 11, 2022, <https://www.aa.com.tr/en/asia-pacific/summit-of-organization-of-turkic-states-kicks-off-in-samarkand-uzbekistan/2735044>

³²⁶ *Ibid.*

³²⁷ *Ibid.*

³²⁸ “Samarkand Declaration Of The Ninth Summit Of The Organization of Turkic States”, *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/ninth-summit-declarataion-16-en.pdf

³²⁹ “Samarkand Declaration Of The Ninth Summit Of The Organization of Turkic States”, *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/ninth-summit-declarataion-16-en.pdf

³³⁰ *Ibid.*

the readiness of member countries to provide reconstruction and reintegration efforts of Azerbaijan³³¹.

Apart from those, in the Samarkand Summit, it was expressed to support the normalization process of Azerbaijan and Armenia and to call Samarkand as the “Capital of the Turkic Civilization”³³². Finally, it was declared that the member countries decided to search for cooperation opportunities to fight against irregular migration, migrant smuggling and human trafficking and improve their fight against terrorism, extremism, drug trafficking, separatism, racism, discrimination, xenophobia, Islamophobia, hate speech and disinformation³³³.

In the second part on economic and sectoral cooperation, first of all, it was decided to make efforts on providing favorable conditions for trade and investments among the member states and the relevant institutions to give support to projects in order to increase trade complementariness and projects aiming to remove tariff and non-tariff barriers among the Member States and instruct the relevant officials to complete the work to continue discussions on the Free Trade Agreement on Services and Investments and to finalize the Digital Economy Partnership Agreement³³⁴.

Also, it was declared that the Member States would support the effort of Kazakhstan to create the “TURANSEZ” special effort in order to enhance economic cooperation and connectivity among the Member Countries, the result of the ad hoc gathering of the Transport Coordination Committee and the 6th Meeting of Ministers of Transport on August 12 and October 28, 2022, the outcomes of the 8th Meeting of the Heads of Customs Administration, took place on June 8-9, 2022, in Bishkek, the ad hoc Meeting of the Ministers in charge of Information and Communication Technologies

³³¹ “Samarkand Declaration Of The Ninth Summit Of The Organization of Turkic States”, *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/ninth-summit-declarataion-16-en.pdf

³³² *Ibid.*

³³³ *Ibid.*

³³⁴ *Ibid.*

(ICT), the First Meeting of Ministers in charge of Agriculture and the formation of sub-groups on R&D, economic relations in agricultural goods, implementation of agriculture techniques and projects, the outcomes of the Seventh Gathering of the Ministers in charge of Tourism and the creation of the “Tabarruk Ziyorat” or “Best Tourism Villages of the Turkic States” and establishment of the cooperation in improving winter and golf tourism³³⁵. Therefore, it was agreed to back the efforts of Member Countries to open the Zangezur Corridor as well as increasing the potential of the “Baku-Tbilisi-Kars” Railway Line, and the establishment of “Uzbekistan-Kyrgyzstan-China” and “Termez-Mazar-i Shariff- Kabul-Peshawar” Railway Line³³⁶. Thus, it was instructed to encourage national civil aviation authorities cooperate and enhance a liberal air transport policy in order to increase trade volume, number of passengers and tourism, apply the decisions of the Fourth Meeting of Ministers in Charge of ICT, took place on October 26, 2022, in Samarkand, the development of multilateral cooperation in agricultural development³³⁷.

Moreover, it was stressed the necessity of improving cooperation in digital economy and the 4th Industrial Revolution, to pursue the implementation of the “Ca-ravanserai Project”, which will contribute to the attractiveness of the Trans-Caspian International East West Middle Corridor³³⁸.

Apart from those, the Member States suggested that they support the liberalization of transport by removing or rising number of transit permits and removing other non-physical impediments, the implementation of joint projects in infrastructure and developing a “Digital Innovation Catalogue of the OTS” and “Common Mobile Device Registration System”, the promotion of cooperation in healthcare area and

³³⁵ “Samarkand Declaration Of The Ninth Summit Of The Organization of Turkic States”, *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/ninth-summit-declarataion-16-en.pdf

³³⁶ *Ibid.*

³³⁷ *Ibid.*

³³⁸ *Ibid.*

finally, to take an active role in the 8th Meeting of the Ministers of Tourism of the OTS³³⁹.

In the next part, *People-to- People Cooperation*, it was stated that the Member Countries back the decisions taken in the 4th Meeting of Ministers and Heads of Institutions in Charge of Diaspora Affairs of the OTS, on November 19, 2021 and therefore, to realize the Second Turkic University Sports Games (Turkic Universiade) in Kazakhstan in 2023, the efforts to create a Turkic site Managers Network, that will improve the cooperation among monuments directing bodies of Member and Observer States and make the effort on joining projects³⁴⁰. Also, Member States expressed their gratitude on the high-level organization of the Fourth World Nomad Games in Türkiye, on 29 September-2 October 2022 and on the successful organization of the International Sports Tournaments in 2022 and Islamic Solidarity Games in Konya³⁴¹. Additionally, it was decided to improve cooperation among the relevant authorities of the Member States in the fields of public diplomacy, communication and media³⁴². Thus, Member States expressed their pleasure with the successful organization of the First Youth Voluntarism Training Program as well as the First Multilateral Youth Exchange Program of the Organization³⁴³.

In the next part, *Institutional Cooperation in the Turkic World*, it was emphasized that the member countries support the further activities of umbrella institutions among the Organization such as TURKPA, TURKSOY and support the

³³⁹ "Samarkand Declaration Of The Ninth Summit Of The Organization of Turkic States", *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/ninth-summit-declarataion-16-en.pdf

³⁴⁰ *Ibid.*

³⁴¹ *Ibid.*

³⁴² *Ibid.*

³⁴³ *Ibid.*

improvement of cooperation among the Turkic Cooperation Organizations³⁴⁴. Therefore, member countries praised the discovery of the ritual complex located in Nomgon Valley of Mongolia and establishment of “Seven Beauties” Classical Music Group³⁴⁵. Thus, the member countries expressed their pleasure with the year 2022, as the first year of Turkic Academy³⁴⁶.

In *Cooperation with External Parties*, it was decided to support the effort of Kyrgyzstan on the declaration of 2023-2027 “Five Years of action for Mountain Development” and Secretariat’s efforts to intensify its relations with relevant international and financial institutions, such as UN, OIC, etc.³⁴⁷. Also, it was expressed to encourage the beginning of transformation of CICA into a full-fledged international institution³⁴⁸.

³⁴⁴Samarkand Declaration Of The Ninth Summit Of The Organization of Turkic States”, *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/ninth-summit-declarataion-16-en.pdf

³⁴⁵ *Ibid.*

³⁴⁶ *Ibid.*

³⁴⁷Samarkand Declaration Of The Ninth Summit Of The Organization of Turkic States”, *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/ninth-summit-declarataion-16-en.pdf

³⁴⁸ *Ibid.*

CHAPTER 3

CULTURAL COOPERATION

In the Soviet Union period, Türkiye couldn't even build cultural relations with the Turkic Soviet Republics³⁴⁹. The main issue was that all citizens of the USSR were raised with the notions of the Soviet ideology, and they were thought to be Soviet men, part of the Soviet Community and Soviet nation³⁵⁰. However, after the dissolution of the USSR, Turkic identity became solid in the official discourse and turned more salient³⁵¹. Only after the dissolution of the USSR the road for cultural unity was opened for the Turkic countries.

For this reason, the Organization of Turkic States has been trying to increase cultural cooperation among member countries. Yet, it needs special emphasis that cultural cooperation was first to build between the member countries. The main reason for this was the fact that the Organization was built upon common culture, language and history. In this sense, it was easier to build cultural cooperation among the member countries.

The Organization of Turkic States makes cultural contributions through affiliated umbrella institutions such as TURKSOY, Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation and Turkic Academy³⁵². Both of those umbrella institutions need to be analyzed in

³⁴⁹ Yerkebulan Sapiyev, "Turkey and Turkic-Speaking States", *Anadolu Strateji Dergisi* 3.2 (2021): 6.

³⁵⁰ *Ibid*, p. 6.

³⁵¹ Yerkebulan Sapiyev, "Turkey and Turkic-Speaking States", 7.

³⁵² Çağla Gül Yesevi, "Examining the Organization of Turkic States: A Teacher and Norm-Creator", *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 27.1 (2022): 6.

detail as they promote the cultural cooperation between the member countries through various efforts.

First of all, the member countries' central pillar of cultural cooperation is the Organization of Turkic Culture (TURKSOY). The main idea that laid the groundwork for TURKSOY was strengthening cooperation through providing cultural revival, integration and consciousness and establishing a platform for collaboration³⁵³. TURKSOY has a vital role as an institution which is active in conserving and promoting the cultural heritage of the member countries as well³⁵⁴. TURKSOY, usually considered as the UNESCO of the Turkic-speaking countries, was established in 1993³⁵⁵. This Foundation discovers the Turkic-speaking people's shared culture, history, language, literature and art³⁵⁶.

TURKSOY has been doing many activities to increase cultural cooperation among member countries and present it to the world. First of all, commemorating the famous personalities from the Turkic world, who have made significant contributions to Turkic culture, and transferring this to younger generations is the task of TURKSOY, which attributes great importance to this³⁵⁷. The other efforts of TURKSOY can be listed as holding art and culture events to present the culture of the Turkic speaking people to the world, celebrating Nawruz events as a cultural day, publishing about the art, culture and history of the region and participating in international events hosted by International Organizations. Indeed, TURKSOY has organized cultural events in a variety of different countries such as Europe, the US, Eurasian and the Islamic World with the motivation of extending its influence

³⁵³ Fırat Purtaş, "Cultural diplomacy initiatives of Turkic Republics", *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 22.1 (2017): 92.

³⁵⁴ Yerkebulan Sapiyev, "Kazakhstan's Role In Strengthening The Turkic Council And Regional Cooperation In Central Asia", 42.

³⁵⁵ Çağla Gül Yesevi, "Examining the Organization of Turkic States: A Teacher and Norm-Creator", 10.

³⁵⁶ *Ibid*, p. 10.

³⁵⁷ Nihal Keskin, Fatih Aliyi, and Bilal Çakıcı, "Turkic Republics on the 30th Anniversary of Their Independence and TURKSOY", *Bölgesel Araştırmalar Dergisi* 6.1: 139.

throughout the world and forming partnerships with various international organizations in different countries³⁵⁸.

In addition, it is noteworthy that the cultural and value-based activities of TURKSOY promote relations between the member countries³⁵⁹. In other words, thanks to the actions of TURKSOY, a mutual ground of shared cultural values was established for members and all Turkic speaking peoples and cultural diplomacy activities were promoted³⁶⁰.

Another umbrella institution to promote cultural cooperation among the member countries is the Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation. The Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation was founded in 2012 upon the proposal of the President of Azerbaijan³⁶¹. Yet, the Foundation began its activities after the decisions on September 11, 2015, at Astana Summit³⁶². The aim of the Foundation is to preserve, study and promote the Turkic culture and heritage with backing and financing activities, projects and programs³⁶³. To do so, the Turkic Cultures and Heritage Foundation organizes seminars, workshops, conferences, congresses, field studies and exhibitions³⁶⁴. Besides, the Foundation assists in funding the training of experts to protect, restore and promote the Turkic culture³⁶⁵. Thus, the Foundation supports funding artists and artisans to defend their intellectual property rights and finance

³⁵⁸ *Ibid*, p. 134.

³⁵⁹ Akilli, Erman. "TURKSOY, Turkic Council and Cultural Diplomacy: Transactionalism revisited." *Bilig 91* (2019): 3.

³⁶⁰ *Ibid*, p. 13.

³⁶¹ Zarema Shaukenova, "Turkic Council: Achievements and Prospects", 90.

³⁶² "Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation", *Organization of Turkic States*, https://turkicstates.org/en/iliskili-kurumlar/turkic-culture-and-heritage-foundation_5

³⁶³ "Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation", *Organization of Turkic States*, https://turkicstates.org/en/iliskili-kurumlar/turkic-culture-and-heritage-foundation_5

³⁶⁴ *Ibid*.

³⁶⁵ *Ibid*.

cultural activities to promote cultural cooperation among members³⁶⁶. Lastly, the Foundation makes publications about Turkic culture. It must be noted that the Foundation has joined and assisted the Organization of many international events, conferences, exhibitions and forums to preserve culture and enhance the unity among the member countries³⁶⁷. In this sense, it has international recognition in the world.

The current President of the Foundation is Ambassador Günay Afandiyeva, described the aim and the activities of the Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation in the Strategic Paper published by SAM in 2015. She stated that, "The Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation, by supporting cooperation among the Turkic peoples in the priority areas such as culture, heritage, literature, language, education, science, information and communication, tourism and others, can become one of the largest platforms of cooperation among the Turkic peoples in the future³⁶⁸".

Furthermore, the Organization of Turkic States uses scholarship and exchange programs as cultural diplomacy tools to deepen cultural cooperation between the members. In this sense, the Orkhun Exchange Program, which provides circulation of students and academic staff between the universities of member countries, is a leading model when the cultural diplomacy basis is considered³⁶⁹. This program is significant as it creates an opportunity to form a mutual cultural and academic ground for the members³⁷⁰.

Moreover, the efforts of the Turkic Academy can be considered as another cultural cooperation tool as well as promoting cooperation in education for the Organization

³⁶⁶ *Ibid.*

³⁶⁷ Zarema Shaukenova, "Turkic Council: Achievements and Prospects", 90.

³⁶⁸ Günay Afandiyeva, "Cooperation Between Turkic Speaking Countries as One of The Factors Strengthening Unity Of The Turkic World", Fifth Summit of the Turkic Council: A rising actor in regional cooperation in Eurasia, *Center for Strategic Research* 11 (2015): 37.

³⁶⁹ Erman Akıllı, "TURKSOY, Turkic Council and Cultural Diplomacy: Transactionalism revisited", 3.

³⁷⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 3.

for Turkic States. The Turkic Academy publishes books, creates websites, conducts sociological and archaeological research, hosts international forums and conferences and currently, and is making an effort to create a standard alphabet and terminology to promote cultural as well as educational cooperation. Therefore, the efforts of the Turkic Academy do not only contribute to the cultural cooperation but also serves the cooperation in education among member countries. Within this regard, it can be stated that its efforts in culture improves the culture in education. Apparently, there exists functional spillover in this case since one area of cooperation develops other areas of cooperation.

It can be said that the Organization of Turkic States contributes to cultural cooperation through its umbrella institutions such as TURKSOY and Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation. In addition to those umbrella institutions, the mechanisms such as Turkic Academy and Orkhun Exchange Program promote cultural cooperation, enhancing educational collaboration. Thus, it can be included that the Organization is strong in cultural cooperation as it is the main area and ground that creates ties between member countries. The cooperation process and relations were born from shared culture, language and history among member countries. Thus, it can be included that the efforts of those umbrella organizations improve other areas of cooperation such as cooperation in education. In this context, it can be argued that the functional spillover, which was the main spillover type in Neofunctionalism, is clear. The efforts in cultural cooperation creates other areas of cooperation and pushes for more integration, which is the main case in the cultural cooperation among the member states.

3.1. TURKSOY

After the First Summit of the Turkic Republics' Leaders in 1992, the establishment process of the TURKSOY began³⁷¹. Then, TURKSOY, or the Organization of Turkic Culture, was established in 1993 by its founding members Türkiye Azerbaijan,

³⁷¹ Fırat Purtaş, "Cultural diplomacy initiatives of Turkic Republics", 92.

Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan³⁷². Apart from those six members, the Altai Republic, the Republic of Bashkortostan, the Autonomous Territorial Unit of Gagauzia, the Khakas Republic, the Republic of Sakha Yakutia, the Republic of Tatarstan and the Tuva Republic are the observer members of the TURKSOY³⁷³. With the inclusion of these autonomous members of the Russian Federation, TURKSOY proved that it has been providing the preservation and promotion of the common Turkic culture and history even among the relatively small Turkic communities³⁷⁴. Thus, the Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus became a member of the Organization in 1993³⁷⁵. It is worth mentioning that each member country is represented at the level of minister of culture³⁷⁶.

The TURKSOY coordinator is elected among the Ministers of Culture of the member countries for six months by alphabetical order. Mehmet Nuri Ersoy, the Minister of Culture of Türkiye, is the term coordinator right now³⁷⁷, and Sultan Raev has become the Secretary General of TURKSOY since March 31, 2022³⁷⁸.

Thus, it is worth mentioning that one of the significant features of the Organization is that it values equal participation and mutual interests of the member countries³⁷⁹. One prominent signifier of this fact is that the headquarters of the Organization is

³⁷² *Ibid*, p. 91.

³⁷³ Erman Akıllı, "TURKSOY, Turkic Council and Cultural Diplomacy: Transactionalism revisited", 3.

³⁷⁴ Fırat Purtaş, "Cultural diplomacy initiatives of Turkic Republics", 95.

³⁷⁵ "TÜRKSOY (Joint Administration of Turkic Culture and Art)", *Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Türkiye*, https://www.mfa.gov.tr/turksoy-joint-administration-of-turkic-culture-and-art_en.mfa

³⁷⁶ Erman Akıllı, "TURKSOY, Turkic Council and Cultural Diplomacy: Transactionalism revisited", 92.

³⁷⁷ "Term Coordinator", *TURKSOY*, <https://www.turksoy.org/en-US/term-coordinator>

³⁷⁸ "Sultan Raev", *TURKSOY*, <https://www.turksoy.org/en-US/secretary-general>

³⁷⁹ Fırat Purtaş, "Cultural diplomacy initiatives of Turkic Republics", 98.

based in Ankara, the capital of Türkiye, yet, Türkiye has no dominance or hierarchical superiority in TURKSOY³⁸⁰.

TURKSOY, often mentioned as the UNESCO of the Turkic countries, is an international organization based on cultural cooperation between its members³⁸¹. Therefore, it is mentioned as a cultural diplomacy institution structured after UNESCO to consolidate ties within the Turkic countries³⁸². The aim of the Organization can be summarized as reducing common heritage among its members and representing and promoting the Turkic culture to the rest of the world³⁸³. "In other words, TURKSOY's activities can be summarized as practicing Cultural Diplomacy in the sphere of the Turkic world³⁸⁴". More specifically, TURKSOY organizes activities in order to promote typical art, cultural figures, values and heritages of the member countries³⁸⁵.

As mentioned, TURKSOY is established upon common language, history and cultural values and aims to strengthen the ties between member countries through those values³⁸⁶. To do so, TURKSOY does commemorative events for people known as the cornerstone figures of Turkic culture and history³⁸⁷. The prominent examples of those events include commemorative events of essential personalities of Turkic Culture and history such as Abay, Manas, Magtymguly, Ali Shir Neva'i, Nizami,

³⁸⁰ *Ibid*, p. 98.

³⁸¹ Erman Akıllı, "TURKSOY, Turkic Council and Cultural Diplomacy: Transactionalism revisited", 3.

³⁸² Nihal Keskin, Fatih Aliyi, and Bilal Çakıcı, "Turkic Republics on the 30th Anniversary of Their Independence and TURKSOY", 133.

³⁸³ Erman Akıllı, "TURKSOY, Turkic Council and Cultural Diplomacy: Transactionalism revisited", 3.

³⁸⁴ *Ibid*, p. 3.

³⁸⁵ Erman Akıllı, "TURKSOY, Turkic Council and Cultural Diplomacy: Transactionalism revisited", 3-4.

³⁸⁶ *Ibid*, p. 12.

³⁸⁷ *Ibid*, p. 12.

Ganjavi, Dede Korkut and Koroghlu³⁸⁸. Indeed, TURKSOY declares commemorative years for the memory of those distinguished authors, artists, theatre actors, playwrights, musicians and composers from the Turkic countries to honour them and represent them to the younger generations of the Turkic world³⁸⁹. In 2010, the first commemorative year was declared in honour of Zeki Velidi Togan³⁹⁰. Then, in 2011, it was reported the year of Abdullah Tukay, a Tatar poet³⁹¹. The following year was declared the year of Mirza Fatali Ahundzade, an Azerbaijani playwright, to honor the 200th anniversary of his birthday³⁹². Then, the year of Mukan Tulubayev, Magtumguly Pyragy, Haldun Taner, Yusuf Khass Hajib, Molla Panah Vagif, Chingis Aitmatov, Aşık Veysel and Abay Kunanbay were declared from 2013 to 2020, respectively³⁹³. Finally, 2022 was displayed as the year of Suleyman Celebi for the 600th anniversary of his birthday³⁹⁴. In these commemorative events, the headquarters of TURKSOY usually hosts the opening of the memorial years. Therefore, the term coordinator of TURKSOY, ministers of culture and senior officials of the related country are among the participants of those events³⁹⁵.

In addition to the commemorative years, TURKSOY organizes several art events to represent and promote typical Turkic art. According to the understanding of TURKSOY, art is an essential instrument of dialogue for the Turkic countries³⁹⁶.

³⁸⁸ Fırat Purtaş, "Cultural diplomacy initiatives of Turkic Republics", 93.

³⁸⁹ *Ibid*, p. 101.

³⁹⁰ Nihal Keskin, Fatih Aliyi, and Bilal Çakıcı, "Turkic Republics on the 30th Anniversary of Their Independence and TURKSOY", 139.

³⁹¹ "Traditional Events", *TURKSOY*, <https://www.turksoy.org/en-US/traditional-events>

³⁹² *Ibid*.

³⁹³ "Traditional Events", *TURKSOY*, <https://www.turksoy.org/en-US/traditional-events>

³⁹⁴ *Ibid*.

³⁹⁵ Nihal Keskin, Fatih Aliyi, and Bilal Çakıcı, "Turkic Republics on the 30th Anniversary of Their Independence and TURKSOY", 139.

³⁹⁶ Fırat Purtaş, "Cultural diplomacy initiatives of Turkic Republics", 98.

Within this context, TURKSOY has organized many art activities and events which can be counted as best-practice examples of cultural diplomacy and dialogue³⁹⁷. From its establishment until 2019, TURKSOY has organized "19 opera days, ten photographer's gatherings, five sculpturer gatherings, seven congresses of literary journals of the Turkic world, three Kashgarly Mahmut Short Story Competitions, and five seminars on intangible cultural heritage³⁹⁸". The events and organizations of TURKSOY have achieved to bring together many artists and scholars from the member countries³⁹⁹. The artists' gatherings have become a tradition of the Organization. For instance, the TURKSOY painter's gatherings have occurred since 1993⁴⁰⁰.

Therefore, TURKSOY organizes cultural events to promote dialogue and communication between its member countries⁴⁰¹. One significant example is the declaration of cultural capitals, which hosts many events throughout the year, such as artistic gatherings, theatre and classical music performances and cultural tourism organizations. TURKSOY proposed an implementation offer similar to the European Capital Culture at the 10th Summit of the Heads of Turkic Speaking States in Istanbul in 2010⁴⁰². After accepting the proposal of TURKSOY, Astana was selected as the cultural capital of the Turkic World for 2012⁴⁰³. Then, Eskişehir in 2013, Kazan in 2014, Merv in 2015, Stekin in 2016, Turkistan in 2017, Kastamonu in 2018, Osh in 2019, Khiva in 2020 and Bursa in 2022 were declared as the cultural

³⁹⁷ *Ibid*, p. 99.

³⁹⁸ Erman Akıllı, "TURKSOY, Turkic Council and Cultural Diplomacy: Transactionalism revisited", 13.

³⁹⁹ Fırat Purtaş, "Cultural diplomacy initiatives of Turkic Republics", 99.

⁴⁰⁰ Nihal Keskin, Fatih Aliyi, and Bilal Çakıcı, "Turkic Republics on the 30th Anniversary of Their Independence and TURKSOY", 141.

⁴⁰¹ Erman Akıllı, "TURKSOY, Turkic Council and Cultural Diplomacy: Transactionalism revisited", 13.

⁴⁰² Nihal Keskin, Fatih Aliyi, and Bilal Çakıcı, "Turkic Republics on the 30th Anniversary of Their Independence and TURKSOY", 136.

⁴⁰³ Fırat Purtaş, "Cultural diplomacy initiatives of Turkic Republics", 100.

capitals of the Turkic World⁴⁰⁴. "...the Institution managed to create an original innovation by realizing the implementation of Turkic Culture capitals in the field of cultural diplomacy⁴⁰⁵".

Another important activity of the TURKSOY is the Nevruz Celebrations. Even though there were doubts about the Nevruz Celebrations even in Türkiye because of the political situation, today, Nevruz feasts have become a tradition with the contributions of TURKSOY member countries⁴⁰⁶. In this context, Nevruz celebrations of TURKSOY occurred at UNESCO headquarters in Paris in 2010⁴⁰⁷. In 2011, Nevruz was celebrated in the United Nations General Assembly Hall in New York and Lincoln Theater in Washington DC, respectively⁴⁰⁸. Then, in 2013, it was celebrated in Trinity College, England, and the following year, a celebration took place in Eskişehir, Türkiye⁴⁰⁹. From 2015 to 2016, Nevruz was celebrated at the UNESCO Headquarters in Paris, Stadthalle Mülheim in Germany, Hofburg Imperial Palace in Austria, United Nations General Assembly Hall in the US, and Warner Theater in the US⁴¹⁰. In 2017, it was celebrated in Kazakhstan, Türkiye, Romania, Kyrgyzstan and Gagauzia and in 2018, Nevruz celebrations took place in Balkan Countries⁴¹¹. Finally, Brussels and Berlin hosted the Nevruz celebrations in 2019⁴¹².

⁴⁰⁴ Nihal Keskin, Fatih Aliyi, and Bilal Çakıcı, "Turkic Republics on the 30th Anniversary of Their Independence and TURKSOY", 138.

⁴⁰⁵ Muharrem Ekşi, "Türkiye'nin Türk dünyasına yönelik kamu diplomasisi: yeni araç ve mekanizmalar", *Türk Dünyası İncelemeleri Dergisi/Journal of Turkish World Studies* (2017): 16.

⁴⁰⁶ Nihal Keskin, Fatih Aliyi, and Bilal Çakıcı, "Turkic Republics on the 30th Anniversary of Their Independence and TURKSOY", 136.

⁴⁰⁷ "Traditional Events", *TURKSOY*, <https://www.turksoy.org/en-US/traditional-events>

⁴⁰⁸ *Ibid.*

⁴⁰⁹ *Ibid.*

⁴¹⁰ *Ibid.*

⁴¹¹ "Traditional Events", *TURKSOY*, <https://www.turksoy.org/en-US/traditional-events>

⁴¹² *Ibid.*

Thus, "The biggest Nevruz Celebration of TURKSOY was held in Turkistan, the cultural capital of the Turkic World 2017 in Kazakhstan in cooperation of TURKSOY with TIKA, the Turkish Cooperation and Coordination Agency and the Yunus Emre Institute with the contribution of nearly 20 artists from 22 countries"⁴¹³.

Furthermore, TURKSOY has organized many academic conferences and events in order to promote intellectual work in the Turkic world. In this context, TURKSOY organized the Pioneers of the Turkic World conference series in 2017, with the participation of academics from the member countries⁴¹⁴.

At first, the Organization focused only on cultural diplomacy with its member countries from 1993 to the mid-2000s⁴¹⁵. Then, TURKSOY turned its face to the global. The understanding of the Organization changed after the mid-2000s as the newly independent Turkic countries started to control the problems they had been facing⁴¹⁶. Apart from those, TURKSOY has many cooperations with its member countries and educational and artistic institutions with the understanding of having no borders⁴¹⁷. Notably, TURKSOY has already done joint work with institutions based in the US, Europe, Iran, China, South Korea, Morocco and others⁴¹⁸. In this sense, the Organization does joint work with international organizations which share similar values with itself, like the United Nations, UNESCO, the Council of Europe, EU Parliament, Islamic World Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (ISESCO), Research Center for Islamic History, Art and Culture (IRCICA), etc⁴¹⁹.

⁴¹³ Nihal Keskin, Fatih Aliyi, and Bilal Çakıcı, "Turkic Republics on the 30th Anniversary of Their Independence and TURKSOY", 137.

⁴¹⁴ Nihal Keskin, Fatih Aliyi, and Bilal Çakıcı, "Turkic Republics on the 30th Anniversary of Their Independence and TURKSOY", 139.

⁴¹⁵ *Ibid*, p. 134.

⁴¹⁶ Nihal Keskin, Fatih Aliyi, and Bilal Çakıcı, "Turkic Republics on the 30th Anniversary of Their Independence and TURKSOY", 134.

⁴¹⁷ Fırat Purtaş, "Cultural diplomacy initiatives of Turkic Republics", 97.

⁴¹⁸ *Ibid*, p. 97.

⁴¹⁹ Nihal Keskin, Fatih Aliyi, and Bilal Çakıcı, "Turkic Republics on the 30th Anniversary of Their Independence and TURKSOY", 134.

Further, TURKSOY has been working with distinguished international NGOs and academic organizations, including the International Council of Traditional Music (ICTM), the International Council of Museums (ICOM), and the International Society for Music Education (ISME) in its projects⁴²⁰. In this context, TURKSOY coordinates with the umbrella institutions of the Organization of Turkic States, such as the Turkic Academy and the Turkic Culture and Heritage Organization, to further realize its aims⁴²¹.

Moreover, TURKSOY has been initiating and organizing youth projects. One of the prominent examples of those projects is the Youth Chamber of TURKSOY, established in 2015⁴²². The Youth Orchestra of TURKSOY has performed many concerts in the US and European countries for 12 years⁴²³. In addition, the Youth Chamber Choir of TURKSOY convokes young artists from the conservatoires of Turkic Republics⁴²⁴. The Youth Chamber Choir successfully represented the Turkic countries with 32 students from 5 member countries, Türkiye, Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Turkmenistan⁴²⁵. Frankly, 32 students were gathered from the member countries to represent the music of the Turkic countries⁴²⁶.

Another cooperation example of TURKSOY is its support to Eurasian Authors' Union. This NGO, working on literature for more than ten years, hosted a competition of Short Stories in 2008 and dedicated it to Kashgarly Mahmut⁴²⁷. Then,

⁴²⁰ Fırat Purtaş, "Cultural diplomacy initiatives of Turkic Republics", 99.

⁴²¹ Nihal Keskin, Fatih Aliyi, and Bilal Çakıcı, "Turkic Republics on the 30th Anniversary of Their Independence and TURKSOY", 134.

⁴²² Fırat Purtaş, "Cultural diplomacy initiatives of Turkic Republics", 99.

⁴²³ *Ibid*, p. 99.

⁴²⁴ Fırat Purtaş, "Cultural diplomacy initiatives of Turkic Republics", 100.

⁴²⁵ *Ibid*, p. 100.

⁴²⁶ *Ibid*, p. 101.

⁴²⁷ *Ibid*, p. 101.

the Eurasian Authors' Union organized the Competition of Theatre Plays in 2015, which was dedicated to Haldun Taner for his 100th birthday⁴²⁸.

Therefore, it has to be mentioned that cooperating with universities is among the top priorities of TURKSOY⁴²⁹. For this reason, TURKSOY Chair was established like the UNESCO Chair⁴³⁰. In this sense, the Organization's first Chair was founded in 2010 at Bashkort State University in Ufa⁴³¹. Then, other chairs, which organized academic activities to promote and preserve the Turkic culture, were arranged in Kazakhstan and TRNC⁴³². Thus, it can be added that the Organization also values cooperating with museums.

Furthermore, to preserve, promote and introduce the Turkic culture to the world, TURKSOY has been publishing books. TURKSOY published the Manas Legend, which is on UNESCO's list of Intangible Cultural Heritage, as its first publication⁴³³. Besides, the Organization published other significant legends and stories of the Turkic World, such as Dede Korkut, Kultigin, Ural Batır and Huban Arıǵ⁴³⁴.

In general, it can be said that TURKSOY has played a vital role in reviving cultural interaction among the Turkic countries as a post-Soviet Institution⁴³⁵. It can be understood that the Organization fills the gap by strengthening cultural and historical ties between the member countries through organizing Nevruz Celebrations, art and culture events, commemorative year and publications. Besides, the activities of TURKSOY assist the Turkic people in getting informed about the Turkic countries'

⁴²⁸ *Ibid*, p. 102.

⁴²⁹ *Ibid*, p. 102.

⁴³⁰ Fırat Purtaş, "Cultural diplomacy initiatives of Turkic Republics", 102.

⁴³¹ *Ibid*, p. 102.

⁴³² *Ibid*, p. 102.

⁴³³ *Ibid*, p. 102.

⁴³⁴ *Ibid*, p. 102.

⁴³⁵ *Ibid*, p. 94-95.

cultural events, artists, and influential personalities. For instance, a Kyrgyz can learn about Haldun Taner through the activities of TURKSOY. In contrast, a Turk can learn about famous Kazakh author Muhtar Avezov, thanks to the efforts of TURKSOY. The steps of TURKSOY nourish the bond between the member countries and encourage new dialogue mechanisms. In this context, TURKSOY plays a crucial role in cultural cooperation between the member countries. Moreover, the efforts of TURKSOY serves not only cultural cooperation but also cooperation in education since it has done publications. In this context, its effort also creates Functional spillover sand push for more integration.

CHAPTER 4

COOPERATION IN ECONOMY

Economic cooperation is among the main cooperation areas of the Organization⁴³⁶. Mutually beneficial economic cooperation is regarded as the core of the Organization⁴³⁷. Sustainable growth and equal partnership were defined in the core aims and values of the Organization⁴³⁸. In this regard, the Secretariat organizes training and experience-sharing programs, regularly gathers private sector officials from the member countries through technical visits for investors and people in business, organizes business forums sessions of the Turkic Business Council and Round Table meetings for people in the industry in order to increase the economic cooperation among member countries of the Organization of Turkic States⁴³⁹. In this context, 11 ministerial and 13 working group meetings have been organized since the beginning of the cooperation process of the member countries⁴⁴⁰. It is, indeed, working groups and Ministerial Meetings that contribute to the strengthening of economic cooperation⁴⁴¹. In line with this, several Memorandum of Understanding was signed since the beginning of the cooperation in this regard⁴⁴².

⁴³⁶ Pierre Chaix, "The Turkic Council's Policy in Central Asia and the Caucasus: Assessment and Prospects", *Avrasya Dünyası* 4 (2019): 42.

⁴³⁷ "Areas of Cooperation- Economic Cooperation", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-alarlari#2-economic-cooperation>

⁴³⁸ Sanat Kushkumbayev and Aliya Mussabekova, "New Kazakhstan and the Future of the Organization of Turkic States". *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 27.1 (2022): 87.

⁴³⁹ "Areas of Cooperation- Economic Cooperation", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-alarlari#2-economic-cooperation>

⁴⁴⁰ *Ibid.*

⁴⁴¹ Zarema Shaukenova, "Turkic Council: Achievements and Prospects", 87.

Also, the Organization has emphasized the importance of economic cooperation and has made efforts in the financial field in many of its meetings. For instance, in the first meeting of the Cooperation Council of the Turkic Council, ensuring the free movement of goods, money, services and technologies was defined as the critical direction of economic cooperation⁴⁴³ in 2011. Again, in this declaration, the improvement of the investment environment, precautions for the diversification of the economy, improvement of transportation and establishment of working groups in the field of entrepreneurship were emphasized⁴⁴⁴. In another annual session, On October 15, 2019, the Organization gathered with a theme "Developing Small and Medium-sized Enterprises" (SMEs) 2019⁴⁴⁵. As another example, on September 10, 2021, the Tenth Meeting of the Ministers in Charge of Economy of the Organization of Turkic States was realized with an economic agenda such as a feasibility study, establishment of the Turkic Investment Fund, other activities of the Tenth Meeting of the Ministers in Charge of Economy of the Organization of Turkic States, etc.⁴⁴⁶.

In this regard, the Cooperation Council has three working groups which work on economic cooperation, such as diversifying the economies of the member countries, promoting entrepreneurship and developing the investment climate⁴⁴⁷.

Turkic Business Council is an umbrella institution to provide economic integration between member countries. The history of the Turkic Business Council dates back to 2011. As a matter of fact, the establishment of the Turkic Council was realized in the First Summit of the Turkic Council, whose theme was "Cooperation in Economy and

⁴⁴² "Areas of Cooperation- Economic Cooperation", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-alanlari#2-economic-cooperation>

⁴⁴³ Zarema Shaukenova, "Turkic Council: Achievements and Prospects", 87.

⁴⁴⁴ Yeşim Kaygusuz, "Kuruluşunun 10. Yılında Türk Konseyi'nin Türkiye İle Diğer Üye Ülkeler Arasındaki Ticarete Etkileri", *TESAM Akademi Dergisi* 8.1: 216.

⁴⁴⁵ "Areas of Cooperation- Economic Cooperation", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-alanlari#2-economic-cooperation>

⁴⁴⁶ *Ibid.*

⁴⁴⁷ Pierre Chaix, "The Turkic Council's Policy in Central Asia and the Caucasus: Assessment and Prospects", *Avrasya Dünyası* 4 (2019): 42.

Trade” and took place in Almaty⁴⁴⁸. Initially, the decision to its establishment was made by four founding member countries, which are Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Turkey⁴⁴⁹. It plays a vital role in the actions of the Organization of Turkic States⁴⁵⁰ due to its aim.

Therefore, the establishment of the Turkic Business Council aims to contribute to the economic cooperation of the Member Countries. Thus, ”The activity of the Council is designed to strengthen productive interaction between the business communities of the Turkic Speaking States⁴⁵¹ “. Furthermore, Turkic Business Council unites business people from the member countries and promotes partnerships between them under the umbrella of the Organization⁴⁵². Another aim of the Turkic Business Council was to remove trade and economic relations impediments, such as customs barriers and to plan new initiatives for cooperation⁴⁵³. So far, six Business Council meetings, five Business Forum gatherings and three round-table meetings for entrepreneurs of the Member States have taken place⁴⁵⁴. Thus, exchange-sharing programs have occurred among national trade and industry chambers of member countries⁴⁵⁵.

⁴⁴⁸ Yeşim Kaygusuz, "Kuruluşunun 10. Yılında Türk Konseyi'nin Türkiye İle Diğer Üye Ülkeler Arasındaki Ticarete Etkileri", 215.

⁴⁴⁹ Ahmet Keser, İbrahim Çütücü, and Mehmet Vahit Eren, "Does Country-Level Governance Matter For National Development? An Analysis on the Founding States of Turkic Council" *Applied Economics* 54.5 (2022): 523.

⁴⁵⁰ Yerkebulan Sapiyev, “Kazakhstan’s Role In Strengthening The Turkic Council And Regional Cooperation In Central Asia”, 44.

⁴⁵¹ Pierre Chaix, "The Turkic Council’s Policy in Central Asia and the Caucasus: Assessment and Prospects”, 42.

⁴⁵² Zarema Shaukenova, “Turkic Council: Achievements and Prospects”, 87-88.

⁴⁵³ Kuvanchybek Shadybekov, “The Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States: Main Stages and Prospects of Development”, 98-99.

⁴⁵⁴ “Areas of Cooperation- Economic Cooperation”, *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-alanlari#2-economic-cooperation>

⁴⁵⁵ “Areas of Cooperation- Economic Cooperation”, *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-alanlari#2-economic-cooperation>

Thus, with the initiative of Former Kazakh President Nazarbayev, the Turkic Chamber of Commerce was founded in 2019 in the scheduled meeting of the Turkic Business Council⁴⁵⁶. It consists of member states' chambers of commerce and industry and business circles of the member countries⁴⁵⁷. Its headquarters is in İstanbul, and it is assigned by the Council of Heads of States to develop sustainable business programs and projects⁴⁵⁸. The institution has managed several successful organizations since its establishment. The institution managed to organize large-scale business Forums on October 5 2019, in Tashkent and on October 15 2019, in Baku, with the participation of government officials and more than 500 businessmen⁴⁵⁹. Also, the Turkic Chamber of Commerce Presidents gathered a session on November 2, 2020, with a theme of "A New Era of Social and Economic Development in Azerbaijan"⁴⁶⁰. Thus, the third General Assembly of the Turkic Chamber of Commerce occurred in Istanbul in 2021⁴⁶¹.

Moreover, the Organization intends to create a Turkic Business Portal, which aims to eliminate physical, bureaucratic and linguistic impediments that prevent trade among SMEs of member countries⁴⁶². The Organization aims to provide accessible communication between SMEs to increase the speed and volume of commercial interactions⁴⁶³.

Another project of the Organization is the Turkic Investment and Development Fund. The potential benefits of the Turkic Investment and Development Fund are to

⁴⁵⁶ Zarema Shaukenova, "Turkic Council: Achievements and Prospects", 88.

⁴⁵⁷ Çağla Gül Yesevi, "Examining the Organization of Turkic States: A Teacher and Norm-Creator", *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 27.1 (2022): 10.

⁴⁵⁸ "Areas of Cooperation- Economic Cooperation", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-alanlari#2-economic-cooperation>

⁴⁵⁹ *Ibid.*

⁴⁶⁰ *Ibid.*

⁴⁶¹ *Ibid.*

⁴⁶² *Ibid.*

⁴⁶³ "Areas of Cooperation- Economic Cooperation", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-alanlari#2-economic-cooperation>

increase employment, strengthen innovation and give impetus to economic and social development and entrepreneurship⁴⁶⁴. The feasibility study of the Turkic Investment and Development Fund has already been prepared by the leading consulting company Ernst and Young, as it will be a powerful instrument to mobilize the economic potential of the member countries⁴⁶⁵.

Finally, there will be Houses of Commerce under the umbrella of the Organization of Turkic States. The concept paper, which defines the main activities and functions of Trade Houses, was published⁴⁶⁶. Establishing Trade houses will strengthen economic cooperation among members by increasing their trade volumes, easing the export process and strengthening their position in each other markets⁴⁶⁷.

Another aspect of economic cooperation lies in the energy field, as energy and the economy are closely linked. In Nakhchivan Summit, the energy side of the Turkic integration was stressed, mainly in guaranteeing the multi-variant transportation of energy resources⁴⁶⁸. The BTC Oil Pipeline, the Baku-Tbilisi-Erzurum Gas Pipeline, TAP and TANAP Projects are essential tools to serve the economic benefits of the member countries of the Organization of Turkic States⁴⁶⁹. In this sense, it can be suggested that economic motivations trigger the energy cooperation. In other words, economic cooperation affects energy cooperation among the member states, which is compatible with the Neofunctionalist view.

The strategic importance of those pipelines was emphasized in the Nakhchivan Summit to ensure global energy security and sustainable economic development of

⁴⁶⁴ *Ibid.*

⁴⁶⁵ "Areas of Cooperation- Economic Cooperation", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-alanlari#2-economic-cooperation>

⁴⁶⁶ *Ibid.*

⁴⁶⁷ *Ibid.*

⁴⁶⁸ Yerkebulan Sapiyev, "Kazakhstan's Role In Strengthening The Turkic Council And Regional Cooperation In Central Asia", 39.

⁴⁶⁹ Günay Afandiyeva, "Cooperation Between Turkic Speaking Countries as One of The Factors Strengthening Unity Of The Turkic World", 35-36.

the member countries⁴⁷⁰. Also, Azerbaijan's international energy projects are crucial for economic cooperation among member countries⁴⁷¹. Within this context, again, it can be argued that economic cooperation triggers energy cooperation. Also, it can be stated that economic cooperation opens new areas of cooperation in the Turkic integration model. In fact, it is an example of functional spillover.

Thus, economic motivations of the member countries affect the cooperation in transport routes. There exists cooperation in transport among member countries of the OTS mainly due to increase trade turnover of the member countries. The member countries organize ministerial level meetings on transport, sign several Memorandum of Understandings such as the one about Cooperation and Relation on Sister Ports, work on several protocols, organize workshops in order to develop and improve transport between the member countries and work on joint projects such as e-TIR project⁴⁷². For instance, the freight train from Türkiye to Uzbekistan, which was prepared as a project under the cooperation in transport, aims to reduce the time and cost of transport⁴⁷³. Indeed, the main motivation to initiate the freight trains between Türkiye and Uzbekistan is for economic reasons. In this regard, it can be included that economic cooperation pushes for cooperation in transport, in accordance with Neofunctionalism.

It is noteworthy that the total population of the Organization accounts for around 150 million, and it consists of an area of over 45 million square kilometers, with a GDP exceeding 2.1 trillion dollars, which ranked 13th in the world as a whole⁴⁷⁴. It is expected that the total GDP of the Organization is going to rise to 1.3 trillion in

⁴⁷⁰ Yerkebulan Sapiyev, "Kazakhstan's Role In Strengthening The Turkic Council And Regional Cooperation In Central Asia", 39.

⁴⁷¹ Günay Afandiyeva, "Cooperation Between Turkic Speaking Countries as One of The Factors Strengthening Unity Of The Turkic World", 35-36.

⁴⁷² "Transport Cooperation", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-alanlari#2-economic-cooperation>

⁴⁷³ *Ibid.*

⁴⁷⁴ Baghdad Amreyev, "The Turkic Council Begins A New Decade", 30.

2023⁴⁷⁵. However, the economic cooperation among the member countries is not at its potential despite these numbers. Indeed, this has various indicators.

First of all, it has to be added that substantial disparities exist among the economies of the member countries⁴⁷⁶. It is noteworthy that Türkiye has the most significant GDP and the highest level of trade among member countries⁴⁷⁷. Yet, its share of business within the member countries is not more than 3 per cent of its total trade⁴⁷⁸.

According to the information from Türkiye's Union of Chamber of Commerce and Commodity Exchanges, the total foreign trade amount of the member countries was approximately 560 billion dollars, which is about 3 per cent of the global trade⁴⁷⁹. In addition to this, the economic influence of Türkiye is small in the region and Türkiye is not the top trade partner of any of the countries in Central Asia⁴⁸⁰ nor Azerbaijan. Furthermore, the total trade turnover among the member countries is below its potential. Indeed, trade turnover among the member countries is only about 3 per cent of the entire business of the member and observer states⁴⁸¹. Moreover, the trade turnover between Türkiye and Central Asian countries was about US\$ 12.33 billion in 2022⁴⁸² while the trade turnover between Türkiye and Azerbaijan is US\$ 5.8

⁴⁷⁵ Can Demir, "The Organization of Turkic States: Implications for the Regional Balance of Power", 49.

⁴⁷⁶ Pierre Chaix, "The Turkic Council's Policy in Central Asia and the Caucasus: Assessment and Prospects", 48.

⁴⁷⁷ Orkhan Bağirov, "The Organization of Turkic States: Economic Potential and Cooperation Prospects among its Members", *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 27.1 (2022): 61.

⁴⁷⁸ *Ibid*, p. 61.

⁴⁷⁹ *Ibid*, p. 58.

⁴⁸⁰ "Türkiye Reaches Out To Central Asia", Geopolitical Features, <https://geopoliticalfutures.com//pdfs/turkey-reaches-out-to-central-asia-geopoliticalfutures-com.pdf>

⁴⁸¹ Orkhan Bağirov, "The Organization of Turkic States: Economic Potential and Cooperation Prospects among its Members", 65.

⁴⁸² "Türkiye's 2022 Central Asian Trade Reaches Over US\$12 Billion", *Middle East Briefing*, January 12, 2023, <https://www.middleeastbriefing.com/news/turkiyes-2022-central-asian-trade-reaches-over-us12-billion/>

billion⁴⁸³. Further, Türkiye's exports to Azerbaijan was 2.53 billion dollars⁴⁸⁴ and the value of Türkiye's exports to Central Asian Republics was approximately 5.909 billion USD⁴⁸⁵ in 2022. Whereas Central Asia provided approximately 4.38 USD of Türkiye's imports⁴⁸⁶ and Azerbaijan provided about 1.84 billion USD of Türkiye's imports⁴⁸⁷. Apparently, it can be concluded that the economic ties and trade levels are under their potential.

However, the Organization has potential for economic cooperation as it has invested in new projects, further increasing trade and investment among member countries. Besides, the future developments in the region, such as the opening of the Zangezur corridor and the increasing influence of the Middle Corridor, will probably influence the economic cooperation among member countries. Also, it was mentioned by Nail Olpak, the President of Foreign Economic Relations Abroad (DEİK), that they are making efforts to make the Turkish firms participate projects in the liberated Azerbaijani territory Karabakh and invest more in the region in the Business Forum between Türkiye and Azerbaijan on November 4, 2022⁴⁸⁸. Such projects can increase the trade turnover not only between Türkiye and Azerbaijan but also between Azerbaijan and Central Asian Countries. Moreover, it was stressed by Turkish Trade Minister Mehmet Muş the need to revive the Silk Road in the Business Forum

⁴⁸³ "Trade turnover between Azerbaijan and Türkiye reaches \$5,8 bn - Ambassador", APA, February 28, 2023, <https://apa.az/en/infrastructure/trade-turnover-between-azerbaijan-and-turkiye-reaches-58-bn-ambassador-397506>

⁴⁸⁴ "Turkey Exports by Country", *Trading Economics*, <https://tradingeconomics.com/turkey/exports-by-country>

⁴⁸⁵ "Trade Map", *International Trade Centre*, https://www.trademap.org/Country_SelProductCountry_TS.aspx?nvpm=1%7c792%7c%7c%7c23%7cTOTAL%7c%7c%7c2%7c1%7c1%7c2%7c2%7c1%7c2%7c1%7c1%7c1

⁴⁸⁶ "Trade Map- Türkiye-Central Asia Imports", *International Trade Centre*, https://www.trademap.org/Country_SelProductCountry_TS.aspx?nvpm=1%7c792%7c%7c%7c23%7cTOTAL%7c%7c%7c2%7c1%7c1%7c1%7c2%7c1%7c2%7c1%7c1%7c1

⁴⁸⁷ "Trade Map- Azerbaijan- imports", *International Trade Centre*, https://www.trademap.org/Country_SelProductCountry_TS.aspx?nvpm=1%7c031%7c%7c%7c%7cTOTAL%7c%7c%7c2%7c1%7c1%7c1%7c2%7c1%7c2%7c1%7c1%7c1

⁴⁸⁸ "Türkiye-Azerbaycan İş Konseyi-T.C. Cumhurbaşkanı Yardımcısı Sayın Fuat Oktay'ın Teşrifleriyle Türkiye-Azerbaycan İş Forumu", *DEİK*, November 4, 2022, <https://www.deik.org.tr/uploads/tr-azeifsonucraporu.pdf>

between Türkiye and the Turkic Countries, in 2021⁴⁸⁹. This was emphasized by Minister Muş since the revival of the Silk Road means increasing trade between the member countries of the Organization of Turkic States.

⁴⁸⁹ “Türkiye-Türk Cumhuriyetleri Ekonomi ve Ticaret Konferansı”, *DEİK*, November 11, 2021, <https://www.deik.org.tr/uploads/turkic-sonuc-raporu-11-kasim-2021-1.pdf>

CHAPTER 5

COOPERATION IN EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY

The Organization of Turkic States prioritizes cooperation in education, science and technology between the member countries through its efforts. Education is the only way for younger generations to live and promote the Turkic culture, so the Organization attaches extreme importance to this field. For this reason, the second summit of the then Turkic Council was realized symbolically under the theme of "Educational, Scientific and Cultural Cooperation"⁴⁹⁰.

The Organization realizes Ministerial Meetings on education problems to enhance and apply special programs to assist young students from the member countries to participate in the existing education system⁴⁹¹. In the meeting of 2012, the Association of Turkish Universities is founded as part of the then Turkic Council as a concrete step to develop cooperation in education⁴⁹².

In addition, the Organization uses the Turkic Universities Union (TURKUNIB), formed in 2013 and consisting of 22 universities, to enhance cooperation between the universities⁴⁹³. It is another instrument for the Organization to serve in the education and science field. Within the TURKUNIB, there is a Student Council that provides

⁴⁹⁰ Muhammet Musa Budak and Hacı Murat Terzi, "Scholarship Programs as Public Diplomacy Tool and Implementations in Turkic Council Countries." *Bilig* 96 (2021): 239.

⁴⁹¹ "Areas of Cooperation- Education Cooperation", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-alanlari#6-education-cooperation>

⁴⁹² Köksal Şahin and Gökçe Candan, "Scientific productivity and cooperation in Turkic world: a bibliometric analysis." *Scientometrics* 115.3 (2018): 1203.

⁴⁹³ Yerkebulan Sapiyev, "Turkey and Turkic-Speaking States", 20.

cooperation among the students from the member universities in the areas of culture, education and sport⁴⁹⁴.

The Organization uses several exchange and scholarship programs as an instrument to deepen cooperation in education and science. Since the early 1990s, Türkiye has provided many scholarships and grants to students from Turkic countries who aim to continue higher education in Türkiye⁴⁹⁵. There is also the Türkiye Scholarship Program, which started with the name the Great Student Project and was initiated for a specific reason. It has been implemented by the Presidency of Turks Abroad and Associated Communities (YTB) and other relevant agencies since 2012⁴⁹⁶. Apart from this, there is Türkiye's Mevlana Exchange Program, which provides chances for the students and academic staff of the member countries⁴⁹⁷. With the assistance of the Mevlana Exchange Program, the exchange of students and teaching staff from Türkiye's higher education institutions abroad takes place⁴⁹⁸. Finally, there is Orkhun Exchange Program, granted to members from Turkic countries.

However, Türkiye is not the only member that provides scholarship programs for Turkic students. Apart from Türkiye, other members of the Organization, such as Azerbaijan and Kazakhstan, offer scholarship programs⁴⁹⁹. Azerbaijan has been conducting a state scholarship program to cover the country's skillful labour needs

⁴⁹⁴ "Areas of Cooperation- Education Cooperation", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-alanlari#6-education-cooperation>

⁴⁹⁵ Baktygul Kalambekova, "The Paradigm of Soft Power and the Importance of the Organization of Turkic States: Perspective from Kyrgyzstan", *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 27.1 (2022): 93.

⁴⁹⁶ Baktygul Kalambekova, "The Paradigm of Soft Power and the Importance of the Organization of Turkic States: Perspective from Kyrgyzstan", 93.

⁴⁹⁷ Muhammet Musa Budak and Hacı Murat Terzi, "Scholarship Programs as Public Diplomacy Tool and Implementations in Turkic Council Countries", *Bilig* 96 (2021): 239.

⁴⁹⁸ Muhammet Musa Budak and Hacı Murat Terzi, "Scholarship Programs as Public Diplomacy Tool and Implementations in Turkic Council Countries", 239.

⁴⁹⁹ *Ibid*, p. 240.

since 2006⁵⁰⁰. Also, there is Bolashak Presidential International Program, which collects the most advanced students from Kazakhstan and gives those students a chance to get higher education from top-ranking universities worldwide⁵⁰¹.

Apart from the scholarship and exchange programs, another institution providing financial aid for higher education in the member countries was established. Establishing the Turkic Scientific Research Fund, which aims to finance collaborative work following the aims of higher education within the then Turkic Council, is considered a significant step⁵⁰² to promote cooperation in education and science.

Furthermore, the International Turkic Academy (TWESCO) was founded in Astana on May 25, 2010, to serve as an intellectual centre for the Turkic Council⁵⁰³. The missions of the TWESCO can be summarized as enhancing the scientific network and forming human capital in member countries⁵⁰⁴. For this purpose, the Academy gathers academics from the member countries regularly and builds collaborative work areas in order to support academic activities in the region⁵⁰⁵. Also, "The activities of the international scientific organization are mainly focused on 'coordinating and promoting scientific research about the history of the Turkic world, ranging from ancient times to the present, studying the Turkic language and literature, culture, and exploring the common Turkic world on the base of the discovery of unique sources and identifying the role and place of Turkic states in the

⁵⁰⁰ *Ibid*, p. 241.

⁵⁰¹ *Ibid*, p. 242.

⁵⁰² Köksal Şahin and Gökçe Candan, "Scientific productivity and cooperation in Turkic world: a bibliometric analysis", 1203.

⁵⁰³ Yerlan Karın, "The Evolution of Turkic Integration: An Institutional Foundation for Interstate Relations." Fifth Summit of the Turkic Council: A rising actor in regional cooperation in Eurasia, *Center for Strategic Research* 11 (2015): 43.

⁵⁰⁴ Köksal Şahin and Gökçe Candan, "Scientific productivity and cooperation in Turkic world: a bibliometric analysis", 1203.

⁵⁰⁵ *Ibid*, p. 1203.

world⁵⁰⁶". The Academy, headquartered in Astana⁵⁰⁷, issues publications such as the Turkic Weekly and the Weekly journal, which appeared in 2015⁵⁰⁸. Regularly informing the news happening in the member countries is the aim of the Academy through these publications⁵⁰⁹. In addition to its regular publications, in 2017, "A Common Turkic History Textbook", which covers the region's history from the 15th century till now, was published by the International Turkic Academy. With this publication, the Academy significantly contributed to the education field⁵¹⁰. Another significant contribution of the Academy is its creation of the Association for Altistics, Turkology and Mongolistics⁵¹¹. Moreover, it is noteworthy that the efforts of TWESCO increases both the cooperation in culture and cooperation education. As a matter of fact, its publications such as the Common Turkic History Book and its efforts on archeology teach the students from the Turkic World their culture and history. In this context, it can be argued that the efforts of TWESCO create Functional Spillover.

Thus, it was stressed by former Kazakh President Nazarbayev that Akhmet Yassawi University could be turned into the first Joint University of the Turkic World to improve the level of cooperation in education and science between the member countries⁵¹². Notably, the Turkish Government funded 60 million dollars to develop

⁵⁰⁶ Zarema Shaukenova, "Turkic Council: Achievements and Prospects", 89-90.

⁵⁰⁷ Mustafa Bıyıklı, "Türk Dünyası Ortak Kuruluşu Olarak Türk Akademisi Uluslararası Teşkilatı (TWESCO), Rolü Ve İş Birlikleri." *Dumlupınar University Journal of Social Science* (2016): 408.

⁵⁰⁸ Yerkebulan Sapiyev, "Kazakhstan's Role In Strengthening The Turkic Council And Regional Cooperation In Central Asia", 45.

⁵⁰⁹ *Ibid*, p. 45.

⁵¹⁰ "V Summit of the Turkic Council: Common Information Space and Enhancing Multilateral Cooperation", Ahmet Yassawi University, September 21, 2015 <https://eurasian-research.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/aae-bulten-en-33.pdf>

⁵¹¹ Darkhan Kıdıralı, "Türk Konseyi (Türk Keneşi)", *Türk Cumhuriyetleri ve Topuluğu Yıllığı* Ankara: Hoca Ahmet Yesevi Üniversitesi Yayınları (2013): 51.

⁵¹² "V Summit of the Turkic Council: Common Information Space and Enhancing Multilateral Cooperation", Ahmet Yassawi University, September 21, 2015 <https://eurasian-research.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/aae-bulten-en-33.pdf>

Akhmet Yassawi University⁵¹³. It demonstrates that Türkiye, as a member state, attaches importance the cooperation in education.

Sport is another way to educate youth and connect younger generations from the different member countries. With this understanding, World Nomad Games is organized regularly in order to inform the children of the member countries and provide a connection between the younger generations from member countries. In this context, the First World Nomad Games took place in Yssyk-Kul, Kyrgyzstan, on September 2014, and more than 400 athletes from 19 countries participated in this game⁵¹⁴. The World Nomad Games has been organized ever since 2014, and it turned out to be a tradition. In this context, it was organized in 2016 and 2018, in Cholpon- Ata and Issyk-Kul Province of Kyrgyzstan⁵¹⁵, with respectively.

It is noteworthy that the Organization establishes mutual universities in member countries to develop cooperation in education and science and contribute to science and education in the region. Those universities are International Hoca Ahmet Yesevi Turkish-Kazakh University and Kyrgyz-Türkiye Manas University.

Moreover, the Organization aims to strengthen cooperation in education with the Sister Schools Project. On March 14, 2019, the 7th Meeting of the Senior Officials of the Organization of Turkic States was held in Bishkek and in this summit, the sides launched the Sister Schools Project⁵¹⁶.

Another significant development in education is the effort to establish the standard alphabet. On September 2022, a workshop was gathered in Bursa, which was chaired by Turkish Language Association (TDK) head Gürer Gülsevin to set the standard

⁵¹³ Yerkebulan Sapiyev, "Turkey and Turkic-Speaking States", 9.

⁵¹⁴ Yerkebulan Sapiyev, "Turkey and Turkic-Speaking States", 21.

⁵¹⁵ "About the World Nomad Games", *World Nomad Games*, <http://worldnomadgames.com/en/page/About-the-WNG/>

⁵¹⁶ "Areas of Cooperation- Education Cooperation", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-alanlari#6-education-cooperation>

alphabet⁵¹⁷. During this workshop, it was decided to build the "Common Alphabet Commission" under the Organization of Turkic States to establish the standard alphabet⁵¹⁸. This development is noteworthy as the traditional alphabet will assist the efforts to enhance cooperation in education.

In spite of the efforts of the Organization, it has to be underlined that the scientific situation in the member countries is under its potential. For instance, only Türkiye has universities which can enter into THE (Times Higher Education) rankings among the member universities. At the same time, Asia keeps rising and balancing the West by joining the orders of 289 universities⁵¹⁹ by 2020. Therefore, it must be mentioned that the scholarship programs of the member countries are not sufficient when compared with other countries' scholarship programs. The budget and number of people enrolling on the agenda of the member countries are less than the program of the US, Russia, China and European countries⁵²⁰. Therefore, students coming from Central Asia to Türkiye through scholarships prefer Türkiye for the common culture, advice of acquaintances, doing internships in Türkiye and accepting it as a future investment while building their careers, according to a SETA Report on the Turkic students in Türkiye⁵²¹. Nevertheless, none of the students in this research mentioned that they prefer Türkiye due to the popularity of its scholarship programs. It means that further study is necessary to promote and present those scholarship programs to the students from member countries.

⁵¹⁷"Turkic states establish 'Alphabet Commission' to unify languages", *Daily Sabah*, October 22, 2022, <https://www.dailysabah.com/turkey/diaspora/turkic-states-establish-alphabet-commission-to-unify-languages>

⁵¹⁸*Ibid.*

⁵¹⁹ Sebahattin Balci, Hakan Dünder, and Yunus Emre Gürbüz, "Internationalization of education: From Bologna process to Orhun exchange programme", *International Journal of Psychology and Educational Studies* 7.1 (2020): 172.

⁵²⁰ Muhammet Musa Budak and Hacı Murat Terzi, "Scholarship Programs as Public Diplomacy Tool and Implementations in Turkic Council Countries", 244.

⁵²¹ Murat Özoğlu, Bekir Gür and İpek Coşkun, "Küresel Eğilimler Işığında Türkiye'de Uluslararası Öğrenciler", SETA (2012), p. 82-83.

Thus, the number of students from the Turkic countries in 2021-2022 education year is only 54.513 through exchange programs⁵²². Apparently, this number is also under its potential. Even though the Organization promotes cooperation in education through Ministerial Meetings, the activities of its umbrella institutions, scholarship and exchange programs and scholarships, publications, youth sports games and sister school projects, the scientific work in member countries is under its potential. Yet, the Organization of Turkic States may increase these efforts in the future with new initiatives.

5.1. International Turkic Academy

The initiation of the International Turkic Academy dates back to the 2009 Nakhchivan Agreement, in the summit of the Heads of Turkic Speaking States⁵²³. During this summit, the former President of Kazakhstan, Nursultan Nazarbayev, established an expert-level scientific research structure, a think tank, to further study the Turkic speaking areas⁵²⁴.

On May 25, 2010, the grand opening of the Turkic Academy was held in Astana, Kazakhstan⁵²⁵. This opening took place with the participation of Kazakh President Nursultan Nazarbayev, Turkish President Abdullah Gül, and scholars of Turkology from the member countries, Russia, Ukraine and the US⁵²⁶. However, only four years later, the International Turkic Academy granted the international organization

⁵²² "Uyruğa Göre Öğrenci Sayıları Raporu", *Yükseköğretim Bilgi Yönetim Sistemi*, <https://istatistik.yok.gov.tr/>

⁵²³ Darkhan Kydrali, "Ten Years of the Turkic Academy: Activities, Achievements And Lessons", *Turkic Council* (2019): 49.

⁵²⁴ Darkhan Kydrali, "Ten Years of the Turkic Academy: Activities, Achievements And Lessons", 49.

⁵²⁵ *Ibid*, p. 49.

⁵²⁶ Darkhan Kydrali, "International Turkic Academy: A New Platform For Intellectual Cooperation In Eurasia.", *Center for Strategic Research (SAM)* (2015): 30.

status⁵²⁷. This decision resulted from an agreement between Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Azerbaijan and Türkiye⁵²⁸. In addition to this decision, a new chairman of the Academy and additional staff and prominent specialists from the member countries were appointed⁵²⁹. These decisions transformed the International Turkic Academy into an international organization responsible for enhancing scientific cooperation⁵³⁰.

The Academy is located in Astana and is conducted by a Scientific Council, which Ministers form in Charge of Education from the member countries, the President and Vice President of the Academy⁵³¹. The President of the Academy is responsible for the functioning of the Executive Body⁵³². Thus, Darkhan Kydralı has been the President of the Academy since 2014⁵³³.

Therefore, within the Academy are five academic units: History and Ethnology Center, Art and Culture Center, Socio-Economic Research Center, International Research Center and Language, Literature and Terminology Center⁵³⁴.

The main aim of the International Turkic Academy can be summarized as collecting scholars from the member countries and promoting their participation in joint scholarly projects⁵³⁵.

⁵²⁷ Darkhan Kydralı, "Ten Years of the Turkic Academy: Activities, Achievements And Lessons", 49.

⁵²⁸ *Ibid*, p. 50.

⁵²⁹ *Ibid*, p. 50.

⁵³⁰ Darkhan Kydralı, "Ten Years of the Turkic Academy: Activities, Achievements And Lessons", 50.

⁵³¹ "Turkic Academy", *Organization of Turkic States*, https://turkicstates.org/en/iliskili-kurumlar/turkic-academy_1

⁵³² "Turkic Academy", *Organization of Turkic States*, https://turkicstates.org/en/iliskili-kurumlar/turkic-academy_1

⁵³³ *Ibid*.

⁵³⁴ Cengiz Alyılmaz, "Uluslararası Türk Akademisi ve Altay Cumhuriyeti'ndeki Eski Türk Yazıtları Albümü Adlı Eser Üzerine", *Atatürk Üniversitesi Türkiyat Araştırmaları Enstitüsü Dergisi* 56 (2016): 659.

Within this view, International Turkic Academy was given the authority to form the Union of National Academies of Sciences of Turkic World, during the third Meeting of the Turkic Council in Baku, on November 28, 2014⁵³⁶. On June 29, 2015, the Union of National Academies of Science was established, and the Academy was planned to be its Secretariat⁵³⁷.

Promoting science and scientific cooperation between the member countries is crucial for the International Turkic Academy. Within this perspective, Heads of State of the Organization stressed the vital necessity for the development of cooperation between science and education within establishing a standard structure⁵³⁸.

In this context, the International Turkic Academy provides scientific cooperation between the Organization of Turkic States members in several ways. First, the Academy prioritizes publishing textbooks on the common language, history, art and geography of the member countries of the Organization. For instance, the Common Turkic History Textbook was prepared with the initiative of former President Nazarbayev, and it was introduced to the schools of Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Türkiye, as selective subject material, in 2019⁵³⁹. Also, the textbooks on the Geography of the Turkic World and the Common Turkic Literature were prepared by the Academy⁵⁴⁰. However, the Academy does not only publish textbooks. It publishes scholarly monographs in international scientific journals Global-Turk and Altaistics, Turkology, and Mongolistics, published in Kazakh,

⁵³⁵ Darkhan Kydrali, "International Turkic Academy: A New Platform For Intellectual Cooperation In Eurasia", 30.

⁵³⁶ *Ibid*, p. 31-32.

⁵³⁷ Darkhan Kydrali, "International Turkic Academy: A New Platform For Intellectual Cooperation In Eurasia", 32.

⁵³⁸ *Ibid*, p. 31.

⁵³⁹ Darkhan Kydrali, "Ten Years of the Turkic Academy: Activities, Achievements And Lessons", 51.

⁵⁴⁰ *Ibid*, p. 51.

English, Russian and Turkish. It includes a comprehensive analysis of Turkology and the modern Turkic World ⁵⁴¹.

In addition to publishing, the Academy also created the "Atalar Mirası" (Heritage of Ancestors) media portal, which is valuable both for the Turkic speaking countries and Turkologists ⁵⁴². The aim of this media portal, which operates in Kazakh, Turkish, Russian and English, is to preserve, save and present the culture of the Turkic speaking peoples through digitalization ⁵⁴³. Indeed, this media portal improves cultural cooperation. In this sense, it is another example of Functional Spillover.

Thus, the International Turkic Academy conducts sociological research, presenting the member countries' current situation ⁵⁴⁴. Within this context, the Academy completed the Turkbarometer project, which was implied twice ⁵⁴⁵.

Furthermore, the Academy has organized and attended many conferences since its establishment. For instance, "On May 22, 2015, the Academy held a special ex-pat discussion on the "Caspian Transit Corridor" within the framework of the Eight Astana Economic Forum, with a high level of international participation ⁵⁴⁶". Also, in the same year, an international forum named "Korkut's Legacy and the Turkic World" was held successfully by the Academy at the UNESCO Headquarters, in Paris, with immense participation ⁵⁴⁷. Following this discussion, the Academy

⁵⁴¹ *Ibid*, p. 56.

⁵⁴² Darkhan Kydrali, "Ten Years of the Turkic Academy: Activities, Achievements And Lessons", 52.

⁵⁴³ *Ibid*, p. 52.

⁵⁴⁴ *Ibid*, p. 53.

⁵⁴⁵ Darkhan Kydrali, "Ten Years of the Turkic Academy: Activities, Achievements And Lessons", 53.

⁵⁴⁶ *Ibid*, p. 54.

⁵⁴⁷ Darkhan Kydrali, "International Turkic Academy: A New Platform For Intellectual Cooperation In Eurasia", 32.

organized "The Great Steppe International Forum of Humanities" in Astana, with substantial international participation, in 2016⁵⁴⁸. Thus, the Academy held conferences and discussions in the headquarters of international Organization. For example, in 2016, "Synergy along the Silk Road and Agenda 2030" International Symposium was held by the International Turkic Academy, at the United Nations Headquarters in New York, with the massive participation of UN officials, heads of International Organizations, diplomats and academic staff⁵⁴⁹. In 2018-2019, the Academy organized the Kazakh-Kyrgyz Intelligentsia Forums to consolidate fraternal relations between the two countries⁵⁵⁰. Moreover, on May 30, 2018, the "Revival of Identity and Cultural Heritage: the Turkic Language from Past to the Future" International Forum took place at the UNESCO headquarters in Paris by the International Turkic Academy⁵⁵¹. Another international forum named "The Great Steppe: Cultural Heritage and its Role in World History", which was inspired by the article of the former Kazakh President was hosted at the UNESCO Headquarters in Paris⁵⁵².

The Academy also conducts archaeological studies to highlight the member countries' history further. For instance, archaeological studies of the Academy mainly occur in Mongolia because most of the ancient monuments belonging to the Turkic culture are in Mongolia⁵⁵³. Also, the Academy conducts archaeological excavations in Karaganda and the Eastern Kazakhstan regions⁵⁵⁴. Indeed, all those

⁵⁴⁸ Darkhan Kydrali, "Ten Years of the Turkic Academy: Activities, Achievements And Lessons", 53.

⁵⁴⁹ Darkhan Kydrali, "Ten Years of the Turkic Academy: Activities, Achievements And Lessons", 54.

⁵⁵⁰ *Ibid*, p. 54.

⁵⁵¹ *Ibid*, p. 53.

⁵⁵² *Ibid*, p. 53.

⁵⁵³ *Ibid*, p. 56.

⁵⁵⁴ *Ibid*, p. 56.

efforts improve both cooperation areas: cooperation in culture and education. It can be suggested that the efforts of the Academy enhanced the functional spillover.

It is also worth mentioning that the Academy has stable international connections with several different institutions, such as the UN and UNESCO, where it has organized several joint forums and conferences⁵⁵⁵. Apart from its cooperation with well-known international organizations, the Academy was granted observer status at ISESCO, another institution, the Academy actively cooperates with⁵⁵⁶.

In this context, the International Turkic Academy successfully conducts studies to improve cooperation in science and technology. Through book publishing, website creation, sociological and archaeological research, and organizing international forums and conferences, the Academy provides communication in science and education among the member countries. Further, the Academy has been pursuing the creation of a standard alphabet and terminology⁵⁵⁷. Through this work, the Academy also enhances science among the member countries by promoting and encouraging academic staff.

5.2. The Orkhun Exchange Program

Cooperation in education is provided through various instruments within the Organization. The Orkhun Exchange Program is one tool that extends collaboration in the education field by providing student and academic staff circulation among the universities of Turkic countries.

⁵⁵⁵ *Ibid*, p. 51.

⁵⁵⁶ Darkhan Kydrali, "Ten Years of the Turkic Academy: Activities, Achievements And Lessons", 51.

⁵⁵⁷ Mustafa Bıyıklı, "Türk Dünyası Ortak Kuruluşu Olarak Türk Akademisi Uluslararası Teşkilatı (TWESCO), Rolü Ve İş Birlikleri", 412.

The history of the Orkhun Exchange Program starts with the first meeting of the Turkic Universities Union. The Turkic Universities Union made several meetings from 2011 to 2013.

The Orkhun Exchange Program Project was examined vigorously regarding commonalities between the member countries, such as language, curriculum, credit transfer, evaluation system and financial problems before implementing the Orkhun Exchange Program. The Orkhun Exchange Program was first mentioned in those meetings of the Turkic Universities Union⁵⁵⁸. During those meetings, the need for developing cooperation in education through the exchange of academic staff and student exchange programs between the member countries was underlined⁵⁵⁹. Then, country reports were collected by the then-Turkic Council to realize the Orkhun Exchange Program⁵⁶⁰. Also, the participating Universities emphasized that it is necessary to share information on education processes, training plans and programs within the Union⁵⁶¹. Shortly after those meetings, on October 16-17, 2014, the first General Assembly of the Turkic Universities Union was gathered at Atatürk University in Erzurum in order to stress the need to realize the Orkhun Exchange Program⁵⁶². In the end, the universities of three member countries found the Orkhun Exchange Program appropriate after the evaluation process, and those universities agreed to join the pilot program of the project while stressing the need for financial support⁵⁶³.

However, the Orkhun Exchange Program implementation did not occur until 2017. On April 6-7, 2017, the member countries signed the ratification of the Orkhun

⁵⁵⁸ Sebahattin Balci, Hakan Dündar, and Yunus Emre Gürbüz, "Internationalization of education: From Bologna process to Orhun exchange programme", 175.

⁵⁵⁹ *Ibid*, p. 175.

⁵⁶⁰ *Ibid*, p. 177.

⁵⁶¹ Sebahattin Balci, Hakan Dündar, and Yunus Emre Gürbüz, "Internationalization of education: From Bologna process to Orhun exchange programme", 177.

⁵⁶² *Ibid*, p. 176.

⁵⁶³ *Ibid*, p. 177.

Exchange program, which enables student and academic staff exchange for the universities among the Organization of the Turkic Countries, at the Kyrgyz Turkish Manas University Meeting⁵⁶⁴. Within this regard, the pilot project of the Orkhun Exchange Program opened for the students of the International Relations, Political Science, International Relations and Political Science Departments for the 2017-2018 academic year⁵⁶⁵. The participating universities signed bilateral protocols⁵⁶⁶.

In the 2017-2018 academic year, 43 students and two academic staff from 6 member universities applied for the Orkhun Exchange Program⁵⁶⁷. Thus, "160 students and academicians have already benefitted from the Orkhun Exchange Program⁵⁶⁸" in 2022.

The Turcology Department was added to the recognized programs of the Orkhun Exchange Program along with International Relations and Political Science Departments after the first year⁵⁶⁹. In addition to this, after the first year, the number of participating universities rose from 16 to 19 with the addition of Azerbaijan University of Languages, Atyrau State University from Kazakhstan and Osh State University from Kyrgyzstan⁵⁷⁰. This is the sole indicator that the Orkhun Exchange Program is accepted as successful in its first year.

⁵⁶⁴ Erman Akıllı, "TURKSOY, Turkic Council and Cultural Diplomacy: Transactionalism revisited", 14-15.

⁵⁶⁵ Erman Akıllı, "TURKSOY, Turkic Council and Cultural Diplomacy: Transactionalism revisited", 15.

⁵⁶⁶ *Ibid*, p. 15.

⁵⁶⁷ Sebahattin Balci, Hakan Dündar, and Yunus Emre Gürbüz, "Internationalization of education: From Bologna process to Orhun exchange programme", 177.

⁵⁶⁸ Çağla Gül Yesevi, "Examining the Organization of Turkic States: A Teacher and Norm-Creator", 10.

⁵⁶⁹ Sebahattin Balci, Hakan Dündar, and Yunus Emre Gürbüz, "Internationalization of education: From Bologna process to Orhun exchange programme", 178.

⁵⁷⁰ *Ibid*, p. 178.

Currently the list of universities participating in the Orkhun Exchange Program are as such: Baku State University in Azerbaijan; International Hodja Ahmet Yesevi Turkish Kazakh University, Al Farabi Kazakh National University, L. N. Gumilyev Eurasia National University in Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Turkish Manas University, International University of Kyrgyzstan; and finally, Istanbul University and Atatürk University in Türkiye⁵⁷¹. By 2023, Azerbaijan participates in this program with 5, Kazakhstan with 7 and Kyrgyzstan with 6 universities⁵⁷². Türkiye, Uzbekistan and Hungary have 18, 5 and 1 universities participating this program, with respectively⁵⁷³.

It was mentioned that the Orkhun Exchange Program might increase its influence in the future, yet the number of participating students and academic staff is insufficient today⁵⁷⁴. The number of staff participating in the Orkhun Exchange program must be increased⁵⁷⁵. Thus, if several Universities participate in this program, the program will probably benefit more students and academic staff.

It can be concluded that the Orkhun Exchange Program, an instrument to provide cooperation in education as well as internationalization of education for the participating member states is significant in increasing scientific research in member countries. Despite its capacity today, the Orkhun Exchange Program has potential. On the other hand, it has to be added that it is a crucial public diplomacy tool for the member countries. The member countries increase their influence in the region through the students and academic staff circulating between the universities of the host countries. Also, in this way, the member states and participating institutions get

⁵⁷¹ Erman Akıllı, "TURKSOY, Turkic Council and Cultural Diplomacy: Transactionalism revisited", 15.

⁵⁷² "Member Universities", *Turkic Universities Union*, <http://turkunib.org/en/site/index/#member>

⁵⁷³ *Ibid.*

⁵⁷⁴ Erman Akıllı, "TURKSOY, Turkic Council and Cultural Diplomacy: Transactionalism revisited", 15.

⁵⁷⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 15.

to know about each other's education system. In this sense, the Orkhun Exchange Program provides strong bonds and expertise between the Turkic countries. Thus, it can be suggested that while intensifying cooperation in education between the member countries, the Orkhun Exchange Program, also, promotes cultural cooperation as it teaches students and academic staff the culture of the host country. Within this regard, it can be concluded that there exists functional spillover in this case.

CHAPTER 6

COOPERATION IN POLITICS

Political cooperation is another area that the Organization attaches importance to. In order to provide political cooperation, the Organization of Turkic States organizes regular meetings of Foreign Ministers, the Senior Officials Committee, the Junior Diplomats Training Program, Foreign Policy Research Centers and the international election observer missions⁵⁷⁶.

In the first place, the Foreign Ministers of the member countries came together regularly at the meetings of the Council of Foreign Ministers⁵⁷⁷. Also, Foreign Ministers of the member countries organize additional meetings to discuss topics of mutual concern⁵⁷⁸. With this perspective, Foreign Ministers gather annually, during the UN General Assemblies, for informal meetings as a tradition⁵⁷⁹. The last meeting of Council of Foreign Ministers took place in November 10, 2022, in Samarkand⁵⁸⁰. Thus, member states' Foreign Ministers can organize Extraordinary Meetings⁵⁸¹. The first meeting of the Council of Foreign Ministers took place on February 6, 2020, in

⁵⁷⁶ Çağla Gül Yesevi, "Examining the Organization of Turkic States: A Teacher and Norm-Creator", 9.

⁵⁷⁷ Yerkebulan Sapiyev, "Turkey and Turkic-Speaking States", 19.

⁵⁷⁸ *Ibid*, p. 19.

⁵⁷⁹ *Ibid*, p. 19.

⁵⁸⁰ Merve Aydoğın, "Organization of Turkic States summit to start Friday in Uzbekistan", *Anadolu Agency*, November 9, 2022, <https://www.aa.com.tr/en/politics/organization-of-turkic-states-summit-to-start-friday-in-uzbekistan/2733426>

⁵⁸¹ "Areas of Cooperation- Political Cooperation", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-alanlari#1-political-cooperation>

Baku, and another extraordinary meeting was held on September 27, 2021, in Istanbul to discuss the Afghanistan issue⁵⁸².

Also, member countries have been organizing security consultations annually since 2015⁵⁸³. The subject of those security consultations is regional and international security to deepen cooperation among members⁵⁸⁴. For instance, member states' relations with Afghanistan, prevention of violent extremism, and the fight against terrorism were on the agenda in the last round of security consultation, which took place on February 6, 2016, in Türkiye⁵⁸⁵. In addition to the meeting in 2016, the first meeting of the Heads of the National Security Council of the Member and Observer States of the Organization of Turkic States took place on June 29, 2022, in Ankara with the participants from member countries⁵⁸⁶.

Thirdly, the Junior Diplomats Training Program provides legal education to diplomats among member countries. The Junior Diplomats Training Program is a two-week training program in one of the member countries, strengthening ties between member countries and increasing knowledge about their political agenda⁵⁸⁷. Therefore, this program teaches language courses in order to familiarize young diplomats with the languages of the member countries⁵⁸⁸. Thus, this program covers topics such as Turkic history, international organizations, negotiation techniques, public relations, the role of global and regional organizations, security issues and

⁵⁸² "Areas of Cooperation- Political Cooperation", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-olanlari#1-political-cooperation>

⁵⁸³ *Ibid.*

⁵⁸⁴ *Ibid.*

⁵⁸⁵ *Ibid.*

⁵⁸⁶ "Areas of Cooperation- Political Cooperation", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-olanlari#1-political-cooperation>

⁵⁸⁷ Pierre Chaix, "The Turkic Council's Policy in Central Asia and the Caucasus: Assessment and Prospects", 42.

⁵⁸⁸ *Ibid.*

foreign policy priorities, etc.⁵⁸⁹. One hundred thirty-eight diplomats joined the Junior Diplomats Training Program up till now⁵⁹⁰.

Furthermore, the Organization of Turkic States act as election observer missions to promote political cooperation among member countries. The Organization contributes to fair, transparent and democratic elections in member countries⁵⁹¹. It is known that the Organization performed several observing missions, such as presidential elections in Kyrgyzstan in 2011, parliamentary elections in Kazakhstan in 2012, presidential elections in Azerbaijan in 2013, the first round Presidential elections in Türkiye in 2014, early presidential elections in Kazakhstan in 2015, parliamentary elections in Türkiye in June 2015 and early parliamentary elections in Kazakhstan in March 2016⁵⁹². So far, the last election observation mission of the OTS was realized on May 1, 2023, in Uzbekistan, in the Constitutional Referendum⁵⁹³.

As an umbrella institution, the Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic Speaking Nations (TURKPA) promotes political cooperation through various measures such as election observing missions. On November 21, 2008, Azerbaijan, Türkiye, Kazakhstan, and Kyrgyzstan parliamentary bodies signed the founding multilateral agreement of TURKPA⁵⁹⁴. TURKPA, which has headquarters in Azerbaijan, has the

⁵⁸⁹ "Areas of Cooperation- Political Cooperation", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-alanlari#1-political-cooperation>

⁵⁹⁰ Çağla Gül Yesevi, "Examining the Organization of Turkic States: A Teacher and Norm-Creator", 10.

⁵⁹¹ Pierre Chaix, "The Turkic Council's Policy in Central Asia and the Caucasus: Assessment and Prospects", 42.

⁵⁹² Yerkebulan Sapiyev, "Kazakhstan's Role In Strengthening The Turkic Council And Regional Cooperation In Central Asia", 55.

⁵⁹³ "OTS International Observation Mission Monitored the Constitutional Referendum in Uzbekistan", *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkicstates.org/en/haberler/ots-international-observation-mission-monitored-the-constitutional-referendum-in-uzbekistan_2899

⁵⁹⁴ Yerkebulan Sapiyev, "Kazakhstan's Role In Strengthening The Turkic Council And Regional Cooperation In Central Asia", 44.

motivation to enhance parliamentary cooperation among member countries and functions with this aim⁵⁹⁵. TURKPA has four commissions to provide political collaboration between members, but its crucial effort is the election-watching mission. Within this perspective, TURKPA has connections with the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly, the Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU), the Organization of Islamic Cooperation (OIC) and several other international structures⁵⁹⁶.

Moreover, the Organization gathers "Official Foreign Policy Research Centers" to bring together the academicians of member countries and think-tanks to decide on the political agenda⁵⁹⁷. In addition to deciding on political agenda together, these gatherings of research centers are helpful in terms of developing common communication strategies and promoting good relations among such institutions from the member countries⁵⁹⁸. For instance, the Centre for Strategic Studies held the first official meeting of Foreign Policy Research Centers in Baku under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan (SAM-Azerbaijan) in 2015⁵⁹⁹. Other discussions follow this meeting in 2017 and 2021. It can be included this activity serves not only political cooperation but also educational cooperation. There exists Functional spillover in this case.

Apart from those, it has to be considered that the Organization of Turkic States has formed a collective identity in many problems faced, and the connection among members has deepened political cooperation⁶⁰⁰. It can be included that the member

⁵⁹⁵ Yerkebulan Sapiyev, "Kazakhstan's Role In Strengthening The Turkic Council And Regional Cooperation In Central Asia", 44.

⁵⁹⁶ *Ibid*, p. 44.

⁵⁹⁷ Çağla Gül Yesevi, "Examining the Organization of Turkic States: A Teacher and Norm-Creator", 42.

⁵⁹⁸ *Ibid*, p. 16.

⁵⁹⁹ "Areas of Cooperation- Political Cooperation", *Organization of Turkic States*, <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-alanlari#1-political-cooperation>

⁶⁰⁰ Çağla Gül Yesevi, "Examining the Organization of Turkic States: A Teacher and Norm-Creator", 16.

countries act in coordination with many political and security challenges. For instance, there is a strong security cooperation between Azerbaijan and Türkiye. In the 44 days of the war in Nagorno Karabakh, this security cooperation between Türkiye and Azerbaijan was solid, and even the two countries acted as allies⁶⁰¹. Besides, rest of the member states showed solidarity with Azerbaijan. A common condemnation of the presidential and parliamentary elections in the Armenian occupied Nagorno-Karabakh was released by the then Turkic Council on March 31, 2020⁶⁰².

Besides, it can be said that the Organization declared their solidarity with the Turkish Cypriots to ensure their equal, inherent rights as well as to recognize Ankara's request of inviting Turkish Cypriots to join in the relevant activities of the Organization in İstanbul Declaration⁶⁰³. Then, on November 2022, the Foreign Minister of Türkiye Mevlüt Çavuşoğlu announced that the Republic of Northern Cyprus joined the Organization of Turkic States as an observer member⁶⁰⁴. This constitutes importance both for the Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus (TRNC) and Türkiye. For TRNC, gaining an observer status in the OTS means that the members of the Organization do recognize its status as an independent state. For Türkiye, it means that the Turkic Republics are in solidarity with the Cyprus policy of Türkiye. Therefore, there is probability that Central Asian countries and Azerbaijan will recognize the TRNC in the future. As a matter of fact, Russia may recognize the TRNC stands as another interpretation.

⁶⁰¹ Muradjon Mustafiev, "The Organization of Turkic States: A New Approach to Global and Regional Challenges", *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 27.1 (2022): 114.

⁶⁰² Turan Gafarlı, "ANALYSIS - Turkic Council's growing role in tackling crises of 2020", *Anadolu Agency*, September 10, 2020, <https://www.aa.com.tr/en/analysis/analysis-turkic-councils-growing-role-in-tackling-crises-of-2020/1968547>

⁶⁰³ Muradjon Mustafiev, "The Organization of Turkic States: A New Approach to Global and Regional Challenges", 09.

⁶⁰⁴ Gözde Bayar, "Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus admitted to OTS as observer", *Anadolu Agency*, November 11, 2022, <https://www.aa.com.tr/en/politics/turkish-republic-of-northern-cyprus-admitted-to-organization-of-turkic-states-as-observer/2735208>

Further cooperation exists in issues of international relations between the member countries. For example, Türkiye has strongly supported Kazakhstan's wish to join the World Trade Organization (WTO) and Kazakhstan's goal of pursuing a leading role in OSCE⁶⁰⁵. As another example, the Organization of Turkic States demonstrated strong solidarity with Kazakhstan during the protests in December 2021⁶⁰⁶.

Political cooperation was even strongly emphasized in the Turkic Vision 2040. Therefore, it was stated in the 2040 Vision that, "Last but not least, promoting effective coordination and cooperation among the relevant authorities of the Member States on issues of migration and displacement constitutes an important reality that the Vision highlights in compliance to develop a more resolute regional and global approach to the trans-boundary issue⁶⁰⁷". Another essential point of the Turkic Vision 2040 is about the security of the member countries to combat political challenges. Regarding this issue, the perspective of the Organization is establishing a network for cooperation, through which the members can share information to fight against threats of radicalization, violent extremism, Islamophobia, Xenophobia and terrorism to provide border security⁶⁰⁸. In this sense, it can be understood that the members act with solidarity in many security challenges.

6.1. Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic Speaking Countries (TÜRKPÄ)

Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic Speaking Countries (TURKPÄ) is the institution that provides parliamentary cooperation and integration for the Turkic countries⁶⁰⁹.

⁶⁰⁵ Zeeshan Fida, "Central Asia's Place in Turkey's Foreign Policy", 119.

⁶⁰⁶ Çağla Gül Yesevi, "Examining the Organization of Turkic States: A Teacher and Norm-Creator", 17.

⁶⁰⁷ Pelin Musabay Baki, "Turkic World Vision–2040: A Step Forward for the Resilience of Turkic Cooperation", *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 27.1 (2022): 40.

⁶⁰⁸ *Ibid*, p. 43.

⁶⁰⁹ Jandos Asanov, "TÜRKPÄ: The Parliamentary Dimension Of The Cooperation Among Turkic Countries", Fifth Summit Of The Turkic Council: A Rising Actor In Regional Cooperation In Eurasia, *Center for Strategic Research (SAM)*, 2015, pp. 25.

TURKPA is often regarded as an example of an international parliamentary institution (IPI), which provides an instrument for parliamentary diplomacy and serves as the parliamentary dimension of cooperation and integration between the member countries⁶¹⁰. Thus, it is significant to add that the Organization is unique in terms of being an international parliamentary institution based on shared history, language and culture⁶¹¹.

The new millennium started the lengthy establishment process of TURKPA⁶¹². The Speaker of the Kazakhstan Parliament, Jarmahan Tuyakbay, first proposed establishing TURKPA during the visit of the Former President of the Grand National Assembly of Turkey, Ömer İzgi, on March 29, 2001⁶¹³. A month later, former Kazakh President Nursultan Nazarbayev brought up the same proposal during the Summit of the Heads of States of Turkish speaking countries in İstanbul⁶¹⁴. The then President Nazarbayev restated his offer in the Eight Summit of the Heads of States of Turkic Speaking countries, on November 17, 2006, in Antalya⁶¹⁵. After the gathering in Antalya, the first meeting group to establish TURKPA for Turkish Speaking countries took place on February 21-22, 2008, in Antalya⁶¹⁶. Parliamentary delegations from Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Türkiye attended this meeting⁶¹⁷. In the same year, a second preparatory meeting was held in Astana and delegations from the Parliaments of Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Türkiye participated in this meeting. In contrast, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan did

⁶¹⁰ Ercan Durdular, "Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic-Speaking Countries TURKPA: Beyond Parliamentary Diplomacy." *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 22.1 (2017): 115.

⁶¹¹ *Ibid*, p. 120.

⁶¹² *Ibid*, p. 118.

⁶¹³ *Ibid*, p. 118.

⁶¹⁴ *Ibid*, p.118.

⁶¹⁵ *Ibid*, p. 118.

⁶¹⁶ *Ibid*, p. 118.

⁶¹⁷ Ercan Durdular, "Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic-Speaking Countries TURKPA: Beyond Parliamentary Diplomacy", 118.

not attend⁶¹⁸. Notably, the establishment process of the Organization itself is an example and practice of parliamentary diplomacy as it consolidated the bond, rapprochement and international dialogue between the parliamentarians of member countries⁶¹⁹.

Finally, TURKPA was established in 2008 with the İstanbul Agreement in order to approximate the national legislation based on the unity of history, culture and language and realize close cooperation on the issues between the parliaments⁶²⁰. "The Treaty was signed by the Azerbaijan National Assembly Chair Oktay Asadov, Kazakhstan Senate Vice President Mukhambet Kopeyev, Kyrgyzstan Parliament Speaker Aytibay Togayev and the former Speaker of the Turkish Parliament, Köksal Toptan⁶²¹". It can be observed that the signatory countries of the Istanbul Agreement or members of TURKPA have some standard features. Having developing economies and dynamic populations are the commonalities of those member countries⁶²². It was assumed that those standard features could provide a sphere of cooperation among member countries⁶²³. Thus, member countries should be able to facilitate inter-parliamentary dialogue through those standard features.

After its establishment, the first General Assembly of TURKPA was held in Baku, Azerbaijan, on September 29, 2009⁶²⁴. In this meeting, the bylaws of the Organization, the Secretariat and the Baku Declaration were accepted⁶²⁵.

⁶¹⁸ *Ibid*, p. 118-119.

⁶¹⁹ *Ibid*, p.119.

⁶²⁰ Hakan Erdoğan, "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Parlamenter Asamblesinin TÜRKPA Uluslararası Hukuki Kişiliği." *Yasama Dergisi*, 2014, p.8.

⁶²¹ Ercan Durdular, "Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic-Speaking Countries TURKPA: Beyond Parliamentary Diplomacy." *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 22.1 (2017): 119.

⁶²² *Ibid*, p. 120.

⁶²³ *Ibid*, p. 120.

⁶²⁴ Mukaddes Arslan. "TÜRKPA ve Türk Dünyasına Yönelik Adımları (2008-2019)", *Atatürk Research Center*, 2021, <https://www.atam.gov.tr/wp-content/uploads/49.pdf>, p. 1433.

⁶²⁵ *Ibid*, p.1433.

TürkPA has four organs: the Presidency, the Council of Assembly, the General Assembly and the Secretariat⁶²⁶. First, the Presidency is the organ that conducts the Secretariat within the framework of self-given powers and the Assembly's decisions. It represents the Organization to the outside world as long as it is time on duty⁶²⁷.

Also, "Council of Assembly, which consists of the heads of the parliaments of the member countries, is the organ that coordinates the activities of the Assembly and takes decisions for the realization of the Organization's aims and tasks⁶²⁸". The Council of Assembly is the main decision- making organ of TURKPA and it is responsible of coordinating relations with the other organizations⁶²⁹.

On the other hand, the General Assembly, which consists of the delegations of the member countries of TURKPA, is responsible for taking decisions such as memorandum or calls, representing the Assembly in terms of international relations and regulating the legal arrangements on the internal process⁶³⁰.

Finally, there is the Secretariat of the TURKPA, which is located in Azerbaijan. "It is not by coincidence that our Secretariat, which started its activities in 2010, is located in Azerbaijan⁶³¹". Because the Azerbaijan Democratic Republic, which was the first Turkic Parliamentary Republic, was built in Azerbaijan in 1918⁶³². Even though the

⁶²⁶ Hakan Erdoğan, "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Parlamenter Asamblesinin TÜRKPA Uluslararası Hukuki Kişiliği." *Yasama Dergisi*, 2014, p. 22.

⁶²⁷ *Ibid*, p. 22.

⁶²⁸ *Ibid*, p. 22.

⁶²⁹ "TÜRKPA", *Organization of Turkic States*, https://www.turkicstates.org/en/iliskili-kurumlar/TürkPA_2

⁶³⁰ Hakan Erdoğan, "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Parlamenter Asamblesinin TÜRKPA Uluslararası Hukuki Kişiliği." *Yasama Dergisi*, 2014, p. 22.

⁶³¹ Jandos Asanov, "TÜRKPA: The Parliamentary Dimension Of The Cooperation Among Turkic Countries", 25.

⁶³² *Ibid*, p. 25.

Azerbaijan Democratic Republic did not live long, its legacy remains among member countries⁶³³.

Ensuring the effective functioning of the Assembly, the Council, and the Commissions is the main aim of the Secretariat⁶³⁴. Besides, preparing the required documents for the Assembly, the Council, and the other bodies, providing the necessary information for the Assembly Council and other bodies and finally, sending the necessary documents to the parliaments and informing them on the activities of the TURKPA are among the tasks of the Secretariat⁶³⁵. It is also noteworthy that the Secretary General, the head of the International Secretariat, is responsible for taking care of the whole activity of the Secretariat⁶³⁶. Thus, the budget of the Secretariat is formed with the contributions of the member countries of TURKPA according to their GDP⁶³⁷.

When the structure of TURKPA is considered, it can be seen that parliamentary delegations of the member countries form the Organization⁶³⁸. Furthermore, each member country has nine delegates in TURKPA⁶³⁹. A plenary session is held annually by the Assembly, which consists of chairpersons of the member parliaments, and is the supreme body⁶⁴⁰. The Council Meeting takes place one day before the plenary session and the Council is responsible for coordinating the

⁶³³ *Ibid*, p. 25.

⁶³⁴ Ercan Durdular, "Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic-Speaking Countries TURKPA: Beyond Parliamentary Diplomacy", 123.

⁶³⁵ *Ibid*, p. 123.

⁶³⁶ *Ibid*, p. 123.

⁶³⁷ *Ibid*, p. 123.

⁶³⁸ *Ibid*, p. 122.

⁶³⁹ *Ibid*, p. 122.

⁶⁴⁰ Ercan Durdular, "Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic-Speaking Countries TURKPA: Beyond Parliamentary Diplomacy", 122.

activities of the Assembly⁶⁴¹. The plenary sessions take place annually with specific themes. The last plenary session was held under "Parliamentary Diplomacy – the Basis of Trust and Partnership" on June 24, 2022⁶⁴².

Also, "The TURKPA Chairmanship is held by each member country for one year in alphabetical order⁶⁴³". The Organization's current chairman is Mr. Nurlanbek Shakiev from the Kyrgyz Republic⁶⁴⁴. The Chairman of the Council of Assembly, who is also the chairman of the member country parliament, conducts the plenary sessions as the chair for one year⁶⁴⁵. The Assembly takes decisions according to consensus⁶⁴⁶.

“As the parliamentary dimension of Turkic cooperation, TURKPA is committed to providing legislative support of the activities and undertakings initiated within the framework of the Turkic Council⁶⁴⁷”. The main goal of TURKPA is defined as to bring national legislation closer and within this context, working closely with the parliaments of the member countries⁶⁴⁸. In addition to promoting inter-parliamentary cooperation between Turkic countries, developing political and economic dialogue

⁶⁴¹ *Ibid*, p. 122.

⁶⁴²“Eleventh Plenary Session of TÜRKPA. Cholpon-Ata, 24 June 2022”, TÜRKPA, June 14, 2022,https://turk-pa.org/en/content/events/plenary_ses/11th_p/4119_eleventh_plenary_session_of_TürkPA_c_holponata_24_june_2022

⁶⁴³ Ercan Durdular, "Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic-Speaking Countries TURKPA: Beyond Parliamentary Diplomacy." *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 22.1 (2017): 122.

⁶⁴⁴“Chairman”, TÜRKPA, December 9, 2022,https://turk-pa.org/en/content/about_TürkPA/chairman

⁶⁴⁵ Ercan Durdular, "Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic-Speaking Countries TURKPA: Beyond Parliamentary Diplomacy”,122.

⁶⁴⁶ *Ibid*, p. 122.

⁶⁴⁷ Jandos Asanov, “TÜRKPA: The Parliamentary Dimension Of The Cooperation Among Turkic Countries”, 25.

⁶⁴⁸ Ercan Durdular, "Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic-Speaking Countries TURKPA: Beyond Parliamentary Diplomacy”,120.

between member countries and forming a favorable political atmosphere for implementing different initiatives to provide regional and global security are the other important objectives of TURKPA⁶⁴⁹. Moreover, building and strengthening mutual trust between its members in line with parliamentary democracy, is among the aims of the TURKPA⁶⁵⁰.

National independence, sovereign equality, territorial integrity, inviolability of state borders, non-interference of the internal issues of the members, and nonacceptance of the use of force or threat against each other are the core principles of TURKPA, as declared in the Baku Declaration⁶⁵¹. In this sense, it can be concluded that TURKPA is committed to the UN values and principles and its charters in a strong sense. Thus, it can be added that TURKPA is firmly committed to the universal rules and principles of international law⁶⁵².

In general, TURKPA, as well as providing oversight of regional problems, regulates laws and policies towards regional integration⁶⁵³. Besides, making recommendations for legislation and democratic institutions, election observing missions, and good governance are among the functions of TURKPA⁶⁵⁴. Thus, the activities of TURKPA cover a great variety of issues related to trade and investment, transport and hydrocarbon sectors to culture and education⁶⁵⁵. In this context, TURKPA covers its work through its specialized commissions.

⁶⁴⁹ Ercan Durdular, "Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic-Speaking Countries TURKPA: Beyond Parliamentary Diplomacy", 120.

⁶⁵⁰ *Ibid*, p. 121.

⁶⁵¹ *Ibid*, p. 121.

⁶⁵² *Ibid*, p. 121.

⁶⁵³ *Ibid*, p. 115.

⁶⁵⁴ *Ibid*, p. 115.

⁶⁵⁵ Jandos Asanov, "TÜRKPÄ: The Parliamentary Dimension Of The Cooperation Among Turkic Countries", 25.

The history of those commissions began almost 12 years ago. After June 2011, expert commissions started to work under TURKPA, and the Assembly accepted the first document related to the Commissions after its third plenary session⁶⁵⁶. Today, four permanent Commissions exist, each with different responsibilities and under the head of a delegation of member countries⁶⁵⁷. Indeed, as of today, the Commission on Environmental and Natural Resources, the Commission on Social, Cultural and Humanitarian Issues, the Commission on Economic Cooperation, and the Commission on Legal Affairs and International relations are headed by Azerbaijan, Kyrgyzstan, Kazakhstan and Türkiye with respectively⁶⁵⁸.

First, the Commission on Environmental and Natural Resources manages natural resources essential for the world economy and trade⁶⁵⁹. Environmental issues, which are in need of cooperation between different parties, are handled by this Commission⁶⁶⁰.

Therefore, the Commission on Social, Cultural and Humanitarian Issues covers the subjects related to the cultural ties of TURKPA⁶⁶¹. Those ties include business alliance changes in the social and humanitarian fields, works on the Turkic language, translation and education of different Turkic dialects and cultural art⁶⁶².

Thirdly, the Commission for Economic Cooperation deals mainly with economic issues such as economic and financial relations, energy and tourism⁶⁶³. Also, this

⁶⁵⁶ Ercan Durdular, "Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic-Speaking Countries TURKPA: Beyond Parliamentary Diplomacy", 126.

⁶⁵⁷ *Ibid*, p. 122.

⁶⁵⁸ *Ibid*, p. 122-123.

⁶⁵⁹ *Ibid*, p. 127.

⁶⁶⁰ *Ibid*, p. 127.

⁶⁶¹ *Ibid*, p. 127.

⁶⁶² *Ibid*, p. 127.

⁶⁶³ Ercan Durdular, "Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic-Speaking Countries TURKPA: Beyond Parliamentary Diplomacy", 127.

Commission deals with commercial relations such as import-export volumes, customs processes and transport. Further, Business Council, established within TURKPA, and the aforementioned free trade zones within the member countries are the subject of the Commission for Economic Cooperation⁶⁶⁴.

The last Commission, the Commission on Legal Affairs and International Relations covers the subjects related to the constitution and legal affairs and shares information about legislative activities in the parliaments of the member countries⁶⁶⁵. In addition to those activities, the work of this Commission includes legislative processes as well as harmonization and approximation of legislation⁶⁶⁶. Thus, cooperation with international organizations and diaspora relations are among the tasks of this Commission, and those issues are discussed under the International Relations heading⁶⁶⁷.

Another significant work of TURKPA is election monitoring activities. Indeed, as Hasanov, the First Secretary General of TURKPA, mentioned election observing mission is the main activity of TURKPA, along with holding plenary sessions⁶⁶⁸. TURKPA has conducted many election observing missions so far. For instance, the first election monitoring mission of the Organization took place in Kyrgyzstan, for the national legislation of the Kyrgyz Republic, on October 10, 2010⁶⁶⁹. In this observation mission, representatives from the Azerbaijan Republic, Kazakhstan Republic and the Republic of Türkiye were there, along with the representatives of

⁶⁶⁴ *Ibid*, p. 126.

⁶⁶⁵ *Ibid*, p. 126.

⁶⁶⁶ *Ibid*, p. 126.

⁶⁶⁷ *Ibid*, p. 126.

⁶⁶⁸ *Ibid*, p. 127.

⁶⁶⁹ "Statement of International Observers Mission of Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic-Speaking Countries on elections held on October 10, 2010 for Jogorku Kenesh of the Kyrgyz Republic", *TürkPA*, May 20, 2012, https://turkpa.org/en/content/events/preandparlelections/312_parliamentary_elections_held_in_kyrgyz_republic_10102010

TURKPA Secretariat⁶⁷⁰. After this mission, TURKPA conducted another election watch mission in Azerbaijan, in parliamentary elections, on November 7, 2010⁶⁷¹. In 2011, the Organization realized three election watch missions in Kazakhstan, Türkiye and the Kyrgyz Republic⁶⁷². The following year, the international group of observers from TURKPA monitored the early parliamentary elections in Kazakhstan; on January 15 and 2013, TURKPA realized the same process in the presidential elections in Azerbaijan⁶⁷³. From 2015 to 2021, TURKPA conducted 14 election-watching missions in member countries⁶⁷⁴.

TURKPA's core values in the election monitoring process are transparency, fairness and respect for members' national legislation⁶⁷⁵. Also, TURKPA firmly follows objectivity, accuracy and refraining from conflicts of interest as main principles during election watch⁶⁷⁶. The international community recognizes and accepts TURKPA's election-observing mission⁶⁷⁷. As a matter of fact, "Thus, today's observation missions enjoy near-universal acceptance and can help raise voter confidence and evaluate the legitimacy of an electoral process and its international credibility and respect⁶⁷⁸".

⁶⁷⁰ *Ibid.*

⁶⁷¹ "Presidential and Parliamentary Elections", *TURKPA*, <https://turkpa.org/en/content/events/preandparlelections/2>

⁶⁷² *Ibid*

⁶⁷³ *Ibid.*

⁶⁷⁴ "Presidential and Parliamentary Elections", *TURKPA*, <https://turkpa.org/en/content/events/preandparlelections/1>

⁶⁷⁵ Jandos Asanov, "TÜRKPÄ: The Parliamentary Dimension Of The Cooperation Among Turkic Countries", 28.

⁶⁷⁶ Ercan Durdular, "Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic-Speaking Countries TURKPA: Beyond Parliamentary Diplomacy", 128.

⁶⁷⁷ *Ibid*, p. 128.

⁶⁷⁸ Ercan Durdular, "Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic-Speaking Countries TURKPA: Beyond Parliamentary Diplomacy", 127.

Moreover, organizing knowhow exchange programs is another crucial function of TURKPA⁶⁷⁹. As it is compatible with Article 2 of the Istanbul Agreement, TURKPA International Secretariat organizes knowhow exchange programs for the parliaments of member countries in order to develop a dialogue between the parliaments⁶⁸⁰. Through the reciprocal visits of parliamentary staff members to the member states' parliaments, parliamentary staff get to know the working of the Departments of Foreign Relations and Protocol, Law and Legislation, Permanent Committee, Departments of International Relations, Social Legislation, Economic Legislation, the Press Secretariat, Committees and Commissions, and Information Resources and Technology of the Turkish Parliament⁶⁸¹. Besides, the parliamentary staff members get acquainted with those departments. They have an opportunity to participate in the preparation of draft laws, work with the permanent committees and finally, acquire acquaintances for future cooperation and consultations⁶⁸². Thus, at the end of each seminar, a certificate of participation is published by the TURKPA for the participants⁶⁸³.

Apart from those, TURKPA has formed relations with several international organizations through its Secretariat⁶⁸⁴. Those international organizations include OSCE, the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly, the European Parliament, the Organization of Islamic Cooperation, the CIS Inter-Parliamentary Assembly, GUAM, the Baltic Assembly, the Nordic Council, and the Parliamentary Dimension of Southeast European Cooperation Process⁶⁸⁵. Therefore, TURKPA has formed communication with the Conference on Interaction and Confidence Building

⁶⁷⁹ Ercan Durdular, "Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic-Speaking Countries TURKPA: Beyond Parliamentary Diplomacy", 128.

⁶⁸⁰ *Ibid*, p. 128.

⁶⁸¹ *Ibid*, p. 129.

⁶⁸² *Ibid*, p. 129.

⁶⁸³ *Ibid*, p. 129.

⁶⁸⁴ *Ibid*, p. 130.

⁶⁸⁵ Ercan Durdular, "Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic-Speaking Countries TURKPA: Beyond Parliamentary Diplomacy", 130.

Measures (CICA) as well as the Parliamentary Assembly of the Black Sea Economic Cooperation (BSEC)⁶⁸⁶. CICA and the Parliamentary Assembly of the Black Sea Economic Cooperation gained observer status to TURKPA⁶⁸⁷. Thus, it is noteworthy that the European Parliament has started practical cooperation with Assembly since 2010⁶⁸⁸.

It would be rational to state that the general work of TURKPA strengthens the political dialogue between the members and consolidates peace and tolerance among them. In general, it can be concluded that TURKPA extends the parliamentary dialogue between the member countries through its various commissions and election monitoring missions. The member countries learn their legislations and parliaments by working together for legislation and rules. This provides consolidation of relations as well as core values of the members. Thus, the efforts of this Organization improve the cultural and economic cooperation between the member countries through the work of its commissions and election monitoring activities. Again, there exists Functional spillover in this case.

⁶⁸⁶ *Ibid*, p. 130.

⁶⁸⁷ *Ibid*, p. 130.

⁶⁸⁸ *Ibid*, p. 130.

CHAPTER 7

CONCLUDING REMARKS

1991 is a turning point for the integration of the Turkic-speaking countries. Following 1991, the Turkic integration process had three phases: the period between 1992-2001, 2001-2010 and 2010-present. Among those dates, the Ankara Summit of 1992 constitutes particular importance as it is the first Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking Countries. Also, Nakhchivan Summit is another critical Summit as it gives the institutionalized form of the Organization. The 2021 Summit, in which the Organization has changed from the Turkic Council to the Organization of Turkic States constitutes another milestone.

Since 1992, the Organization has built several cooperation areas such as economy, culture, education and politics. In addition to ministerial-level meetings, the Organization has established several umbrella institutions and tools to realize cooperation. The Orkhun Exchange Program, TURKSOY, TURKPA, International Turkic Academy and Turkic Business Council are among those institutions and initiatives. Those institutions play a significant role in promoting regional cooperation in Eurasia⁶⁸⁹.

It is crucial that the member countries of the OTS have started to show a collective identity in the political matters and conflicts, in particular. The solidarity of member states on the Karabakh issue and the riots in Kazakhstan demonstrates this idea. Also, TRNC's acceptance as an observer member constitutes a milestone for the political cooperation between the member countries. The following TRNC's

⁶⁸⁹ Talant Sultanov, "The Turkic Council's Increasing Role in Promoting Regional Cooperation in Eurasia." Fifth Summit of the Turkic Council: A rising actor in regional cooperation in Eurasia, *Center for Strategic Research 11*, 2015, p.45

inclusion as an observer state in TURKPA on April 29, 2023 is another indicator⁶⁹⁰. This is a strong sign that the member countries back the recognition of the TRNC and Turkish foreign policy towards the Cyprus. In this sense, it can be suggested that Türkiye has increased its influence in the case of Cyprus issue.

Nevertheless, it was not only Türkiye who increased its influence in the world politics through the OTS. In fact, it can be argued that all member countries of the OTS have caught a chance to be more powerful in international relations. For instance, the member countries have showed support and solidarity to Azerbaijan during the Karabakh Conflict and the same is valid for the Kazakhstan during the 2022 riots.

In general, it can be suggested that Neofunctionalism explains the integration of Turkic countries and the Organization of Turkic Countries. There are several examples to justify this fact. As a matter of fact, when the integration process of Turkic countries is analyzed, it can be seen that cooperation in one area triggers cooperation in another area. When the member countries began to make an effort to strengthen cultural cooperation and pursued activities for this aim, they also began cooperation in education and science. For instance, the activities of TURKSOY do not only provide cultural cooperation among members and intensify the educational links among member countries. Also, when a standard textbook on the history of the region is published, it promotes cultural and educational cooperation among member states. Besides when TURKSOY organizes events with museums, this activity also aids to the process. In those examples, functional spillover is apparent. In this context, it can be stated that formation of the Organization can be explained by the Neofunctionalist theory.

Besides, it can be argued that economic integration pursues different cooperation areas in the Organization of Turkic States case. In fact, economic cooperation improves cooperation in transport and energy. Because the main motivation of

⁶⁹⁰ Diyar Güldoğan, "Türkiye Welcomes Northern Cyprus' Admission to TÜRKPA as Observer", *Anadolu Agency*, April 29, 2023, <https://www.aa.com.tr/en/turkiye/turkiye-welcomes-northern-cyprus-admission-to-TürkPA-as-observer/2884410>

establishing Sister Ports Projects, building natural gas pipelines and initiating freight trains between the member countries is economical. In this sense, it can be argued that cooperation in economy promotes other areas of cooperation and there exists functional spillover in this case as those initiative further push for integration. Within this regard, again, it can be concluded that Neofunctionalism explains the formation and functioning of the Organization of Turkic States.

On the other hand, there exists limitations for OTS and Türkiye to increase their influences. Indeed, several different actors in the region may stand as impediments to further integration of the Turkic countries. First of all, Russia stands as the most influential actor in the region. This is primarily due to the region's high percentages of the Russian population⁶⁹¹. Also, the Russian language has protected its place in the region even after so many years after the dissolution of the USSR. Furthermore, ten million labour migrants from Central Asia live in Russia⁶⁹².

Apart from Russia, China is an increasing actor in the region. This can be explained by China's several regional economic initiatives⁶⁹³ such as the Belt and Road (BRI). Besides, 3 Central Asian countries are members of SCO, which pursues Beijing's influence in the region.

Despite the challenges and limitations such as the influence of other countries in the region and the continuing war in Ukraine, the Organization of Turkic Countries will have more influence in the region and the world despite the limitations. This can be estimated by the current initiatives that the Organization took. Those initiatives will further intensify the cooperation areas. Thus, Hungary's and TRNC's acceptance as an observer member demonstrated that the Organization has already built added value and influence in world politics.

⁶⁹¹ Can Demir, "The Organization of Turkic States: Implications for the Regional Balance of Power." *Güvenlik Stratejileri Dergisi Spec. Issue*, 2022, p. 52.

⁶⁹² *Ibid*, p. 52.

⁶⁹³ *Ibid*, p. 54.

REFERENCES

- Afandiyeva, Gunay. "Cooperation Between Turkic Speaking Countries as One of The Factors Strengthening Unity Of The Turkic World." Fifth Summit of the Turkic Council: A rising actor in regional cooperation in Eurasia. *Center for Research* 11 (Ankara, 2015): 35-38. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/resrep05095.11.pdf>
- Ahmet Yassawi University. "V Summit of the Turkic Council: Common Information Space and Enhancing Multilateral Cooperation." Last modified September 21, 2015. <https://eurasian-research.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/aaebulten-en-33.pdf>
- Akiner, Shirin. "Regional cooperation in Central Asia." *School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London* (London, 2007):187-208. <https://www.nato.int/docu/colloq/2001/2001-17e.pdf>
- Akıllı, Erman. "TURKSOY, Turkic Council and Cultural Diplomacy: Transactionalism revisited." *Bilig* 91 (2019): 1-25. <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7782-0881>
- Alexander, Jeffrey C., and Paul Colomy. "2. Neofunctionalism Today: Reconstructing a Theoretical Tradition." *Frontiers of Social Theory. The New Syntheses. Columbia University Press* (1990): 33-67. <https://www.degruyter.com/document/doi/10.7312/ritz91254-003/html>
- Alyılmaz, Cengiz. "Uluslararası Türk Akademisi ve Altay Cumhuriyeti'ndeki Eski Türk Yazıtları Albümü Adlı Eser Üzerine." *Atatürk Üniversitesi Türkiyat Araştırmaları Enstitüsü Dergisi* 56 (2016): 657-690.
- Amirbek, Aidarbek, Almasbek Anuarbekuly, and Kanar Makhanov. "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Entegrasyonu: Tarihsel Geçmişi ve Kurumsallaşması." *Bölgesel Araştırmalar Dergisi* 1.3 (2017): 164-204. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/391701>

- Amreyev, Baghdad. "The Turkic Council Begins A New Decade." *Turkic Council* (2019): 27-35.
- APA. "Trade turnover between Azerbaijan and Türkiye reaches \$5,8 bn - Ambassador." Last modified February 28, 2023. <https://apa.az/en/infrastructure/trade-turnover-between-azerbaijan-and-turkiye-reaches-58-bn-ambassador-397506>
- Arslan, Mukaddes. "TÜRKPA ve Türk Dünyasına Yönelik Adımları (2008-2019)." *Atatürk Research Center* (2021): 1425-1452. <https://www.atam.gov.tr/wp-content/uploads/49.pdf>
- Asanov, Jandos. "TÜRKPA: The Parliamentary Dimension Of The Cooperation Among Turkic Countries." Fifth Summit Of The Turkic Council: A Rising Actor In Regional Cooperation In Eurasia. *Center for Strategic Research (SAM)* (2015): 25–28. JSTOR, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/resrep05095.9>. Accessed 20 Jan. 2023.
- Aydın, Mustafa "Kafkasya ve Orta Asya ile İlişkiler", içinde: *Türk Dış Politikası*, (Editor : Baskın Oran), İletişim Yayınları, İstanbul (2004): 366-439.
- Aydoğan, Merve. "Organization of Turkic States summit to start Friday in Uzbekistan", *Anadolu Agency*, November 9, 2022. <https://www.aa.com.tr/en/politics/organization-of-turkic-states-summit-to-start-friday-in-uzbekistan/2733426>
- Bagirov, Orkhan. "The Organization of Turkic States: Economic Potential and Cooperation Prospects among its Members". *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 27.1 (2022): 53-73. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/2559514>
- Baki, Pelin Musabay. "Turkic World Vision–2040: A Step Forward for the Resilience of Turkic Cooperation." *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 27.1 (2022): 26-52. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/2559488>
- Balci, Sebahattin, Dündar, Hakan and Gürbüz, Yunus Emre. "Internationalization of education: From Bologna process to Orhun exchange programme." *International Journal of Psychology and Educational Studies* 7.1 (2020): 170-181. <http://dx.doi.org/10.17220/ijpes.2020.01.015>

- Bıyıklı, Mustafa. "Türk Dünyası Ortak Kuruluşu Olarak Türk Akademisi Uluslararası Teşkilatı (TWESCO), Rolü Ve İş Birlikleri." *Dumlupınar University Journal of Social Science/Dumlupınar Üniversitesi Soysyal Bilimler Dergisi* (2016). <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/348209>
- Bıyıklı, Mustafa. "Kırgızistan Dış Politikasında Türk Konseyi/Keneşi'nin Yeri." *Kırgızistan Araştırmaları* (2019): 137.
- Bilgin, Pinar, and Ali Bilgiç. "Turkey's" new" foreign policy toward Eurasia." *Eurasian Geography and Economics* 52.2 (2011): 173-195. <https://doi.org/10.2747/1539-7216.52.2.173>
- Black Sea Economic Cooperation Organization. "Member States." Accessed June 6, 2022. <http://www.bsec-organization.org/member-states>
- Budak, Muhammet Musa, and Hacı Murat Terzi. "Scholarship Programs as Public Diplomacy Tool and Implementations in Turkic Council Countries." *Bilig* 96 (TBMM'nin 100. Yılı Özel Sayısı) (2021): 229-253. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/1540662>
- Chaix, Pierre. "The Turkic Council's Policy in Central Asia and the Caucasus: Assessment and Prospects." Ankara: *Avrasya Dünyası* 4 (2019): 40-46. <https://avim.org.tr/public/images/uploads/files/pierre%20chaix.pdf>
- Çalışır, Abdulkadir. "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler İşBirliği Konseyi: Orta Asya'da Bölgesel İşbirliği ve Entegrasyon." Diss. *Anadolu University* (Turkey), 2021.
- Çelik, Kadir Ertaç ve Erol, Mehmet Seyfettin. "Türk Dünyası'nda işbirliği denemesi: Türk Keneşi ve Kazakistan." *Türk Dünyası İncelemeleri Dergisi* 17.2 (2017): 15-32. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/386789>
- Daily Sabah. "Turkic states establish 'Alphabet Commission' to unify languages." October 22, 2022. <https://www.dailysabah.com/turkey/diaspora/turkic-states-establish-alphabet-commission-to-unify-languages>
- Dal, Emel Parlar, and Emre Erşen. "Reassessing the "Turkish model" in the post-cold war era: A role theory perspective." *Turkish Studies* 15.2 (2014): 258-282. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14683849.2014.926238>

- DEİK. "Türkiye-Azerbaycan İş Konseyi-T.C. Cumhurbaşkanı Yardımcısı Sayın Fuat Oktay'ın Teşrifleriyle Türkiye-Azerbaycan İş Forumu." Last modified November 4, 2022. <https://www.deik.org.tr/uploads/tr-azeifsonucraporu.pdf>
- DEİK. "Türkiye-Türk Cumhuriyetleri Ekonomi ve Ticaret Konferansı." Accessed November 11 2021. <https://www.deik.org.tr/uploads/turkic-sonuc-raporu-11-kasim-2021-1.pdf>
- Demir, Can. "The Organization of Turkic States: Implications for the Regional Balance of Power." *Güvenlik Stratejileri Dergisi Spec. Issue* (2022): 39-71. DOI: 10.17752/guvenlikstrjtj.1104776
- Durdular, Ercan. "Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic-Speaking Countries TURKPA: Beyond Parliamentary Diplomacy." *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 22.1 (2017): 115-142. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/815557>
- Durmuş M and Yılmaz H. "Son yirmi yılda Türkiye'nin Orta Asya'ya yönelik dış politikası ve bölgedeki faaliyetleri." In Aydıngün A and Balım Ç (eds.) *Bağımsızlıklarının Yirminci Yılında Orta Asya Cumhuriyetleri Türk Dilli Halklar-Türkiye ile İlişkileri*. Ankara: *Atatürk Kültür Merkezi Yayınları* (2012): 483-587.
- Ekşi, Muharrem. "Türkiye'nin Türk dünyasına yönelik kamu diplomasisi: Yeni araç ve mekanizmalar." *Türk Dünyası İncelemeleri Dergisi/ Journal of Turkish World Studies* 17/1 (2017).
- Elena Teslova, "Summit of Organization of Turkic States Kicks off in Samarkand, Uzbekistan", Anadolu Agency, November 11, 2022, <https://www.aa.com.tr/en/asia-pacific/summit-of-organization-of-turkic-states-kicks-off-in-samarkand-uzbekistan/2735044>
- Erdoğan, Hakan. "Türk Dili Konuşan Ülkeler Parlamenter Asamblesinin TÜRKPA Uluslararası Hukuki Kişiliği." *Yasama Dergisi* 27 (2014): 5-30. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/1120961>
- Erol, Aslı. "Yeni-işlevselcilik ışığında Avrupa bütünleşmesi." MS Thesis, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü (2007).

- Fida, Zeeshan. "Central Asia's Place in Turkey's Foreign Policy." *Policy Perspectives: The Journal of the Institute of Policy Studies* 15.1 (2018): 113-125. https://www.scienceopen.com/document_file/c4ba1a00-7df9-4217-8bd1-673ab24d7921/ScienceOpen/polipers.15.1.0113.pdf
- Fidan, Hakan. "Turkish foreign policy towards Central Asia." *Journal of Balkan and Near Eastern Studies* 12.1 (2010): 109-121. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19448950903507560>
- Geopolitical Futures. "Türkiye Reaches Out To Central Asia." Accessed June 9, 2022. <https://geopoliticalfutures.com/pdfs/turkey-reaches-out-to-central-asia-geopoliticalfutures-com.pdf>
- Gözde Bayar, "Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus admitted to OTS as observer", *Anadolu Agency*, November 11, 2022. <https://www.aa.com.tr/en/politics/turkish-republic-of-northern-cyprus-admitted-to-organization-of-turkic-states-as-observer/2735208>
- Güldoğan, Diyar. "Türkiye Welcomes Northern Cyprus' Admission to TÜRKPA as Observer." *Anadolu Agency*, April 29, 2023, <https://www.aa.com.tr/en/turkiye/turkiye-welcomes-northern-cyprus-admission-to-TürkPA-as-observer/2884410>
- Gündoğdu, Abdullah, and Cafer Güler. "Kazakistan'ın Bağımsızlığının Tanınma Süreci Ve Türk Kamuoyundaki Yankıları." *Tarih Araştırmaları Dergisi* 36.61 (2017): 75-93. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/781074>
- Haas, Ernst B. "The uniting of Europe and the uniting of Latin America." *J. Common Mkt. Stud.* 5 (1966): 315.
- Hamzaoğlu, Halit, Hakan Çora, and Elnur Hasan Mikail. "Institutional Development and Cooperation Mechanisms of the Organization of Turkic States." *China-USA Business Review* 21.2 (2022): 62-69. doi: 10.17265/1537-1514/2022.02.004
- İdrissoy, Erlan. "The Turkic Council: Engine of Turkic Integration." *Fifth Summit of the Turkic Council: A rising actor in regional cooperation in Eurasia*. Ankara: Center for Strategic Research 11 (2015): 15. Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.com/stable/resrep05095.6>

International Trade Center. "Trade Map." Accessed April 17, 2022. https://www.trademap.org/Country_SelProductCountry_TS.aspx?nvpm=1%7c792%7c%7c%7c23%7cTOTAL%7c%7c%7c2%7c1%7c1%7c2%7c2%7c1%7c2%7c1%7c1%7c1

International Trade Center. "Trade Map- Türkiye-Central Asia Imports." Accessed April 18, 2022. https://www.trademap.org/Country_SelProductCountry_TS.aspx?nvpm=1%7c792%7c%7c%7c23%7cTOTAL%7c%7c%7c2%7c1%7c1%7c1%7c2%7c1%7c2%7c1%7c1%7c1

International Trade Center. "Trade Map- Azerbaijan- imports." Accessed April 18, 2022. https://www.trademap.org/Country_SelProductCountry_TS.aspx?nvpm=1%7c031%7c%7c%7c%7cTOTAL%7c%7c%7c2%7c1%7c1%7c1%7c2%7c1%7c2%7c1%7c1%7c1

İpek, Pinar. "Ideas and change in foreign policy instruments: soft power and the case of the Turkish international cooperation and development agency." *Foreign Policy Analysis* 11.2 (2015): 173-193. <https://doi.org/10.1111/fpa.12031>

Jensen, Carsten Stroby. "Neo-functionalism." *European Union Politics* 4 (2013).

Jensen, Carsten Stroby. "Neofunctionalist theories and the development of European social and labour market policy." *J. Common Mkt. Stud.* 38 (2000): 71.

Jensen, Carsten Stroby. "Neo-functionalism." *European Union Politics* 4 (2013): 54.

Kalambekova, Baktygul. "The Paradigm of Soft Power and the Importance of the Organization of Turkic States: Perspective from Kyrgyzstan." *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 27.1 (2022): 91-194. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/2559562>

Karamatov, Ozodbek, Serkan Dilek, and Kosimjan Rakhmanov. "Türk Konseyi: Ekonomik İlişkiler Ve Entegrasyon Perspektifleri." *Econder* 2020 3rd. International Economics, Business and Social Sciences Congress. https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Nadia-Mansour-2/publication/348880700_Examination_of_Big_Data_Analytics_and_customer_segmentation_in_the_banking_sector_Learning_for_BNP_Paribas_Bank_of_France/links/60141be145851517ef24d82c/Examination-of-Big-Data-Analytics-and-customer-segmentation-in-the-banking-sector-Learning-for-BNP-Paribas-Bank-of-France.pdf#page=133

- Karın, Yerlan. "The Evolution of Turkic Integration: An Institutional Foundation for Interstate Relations." Fifth Summit of the Turkic Council: A rising actor in regional cooperation in Eurasia. Ankara: Center for Strategic Research 11 (2015): 11-15. Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.com/stable/resrep05095.13>
- Kasseinov, Dusen. "The Importance of TURKSOY on the 10th Anniversary of the Nakhchivan Agreement." *TURKIC COUNCIL* (2019): 41. <https://aircenter.az/uploads/files/TURKIC-COUNCIL-Kitab-185x250-web.pdf#page=43>
- Kaygusuz, Yeşim. "Kuruluşunun 10. Yılında Türk Konseyi'nin Türkiye İle Diğer Üye Ülkeler Arasındaki Ticarete Etkileri." *TESAM Akademi Dergisi* 8.1: 199-236. <http://dx.doi.org/10.30626/tesamakademi.748658>.
- Keser, Ahmet, İbrahim Çütücü, and Mehmet Vahit Eren. "Does country-level governance matter for national development? An analysis on the founding states of Turkic council." *Applied Economics* 54.5 (2022): 522-535. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00036846.2021.1966373>
- Keskin, Nihal, Fatih Aliyi, and Bilal Çakıcı. "Turkic Republics on the 30th Anniversary of Their Independence and TURKSOY." *Bölgesel Araştırmalar Dergisi* 6.1: 123-147. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/2204980>
- Kocaman, Ömer. "Adjusting to the "New Normal" of Post COVID-19: The Role of Organization of Turkic States in Multilateral Cooperation." *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 26.2 (2021): 189-215. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/2182031>
- Kushkumbayev, Sanat and Mussabekova, Aliya. "New Kazakhstan and the Future of the Organization of Turkic States". *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 27.1 (2022): 74-90. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/2559519>
- Kydrali, Darkhan. "International Turkic Academy: A New Platform For Intellectual Cooperation In Eurasia.", Center for Strategic Research (SAM) (2015): p. 29-33. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/resrep05095.10>
- Kydrali, Darkhan. "Türk Konseyi (Türk Keneşi). In M. Yılmaz ve T. Demirtepe. (eds.) *Türk Cumhuriyetleri ve Topluluğu Yılı* Ankara: Hoca Ahmet Yesevi Üniversitesi Yayınları (2013), pp. 576-589.

Kydrali, Darkhan. "Ten Years of the Turkic Academy: Activities, Achievements And Lessons." *Turkic Council* (2019): 49. <https://aircenter.az/uploads/k2uMyfTSChWA.pdf#page=51>

McGowan, Lee. "Theorising European Integration: revisiting Neofunctionalism and testing its suitability for explaining the development of EC competition policy?" *European Integration Online Papers* 11.3 (2007): 1-17. https://eif.univie.ac.at/EloP_Archive/pdf/2007-003.pdf

Middle East Briefing. "Türkiye's 2022 Central Asian Trade Reaches Over US\$12 Billion." Last modified January 12, 2023. <https://www.middleeastbriefing.com/news/turkiyes-2022-central-asian-trade-reaches-over-us12-billion/>

Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Türkiye. "TÜRKSÖY (Joint Administration of Turkic Culture and Art)." Accessed August 5, 2022. https://www.mfa.gov.tr/turksoy-_joint-administration-of-turkic-culture-and-art_en.mfa

Mustafoev, Murodjon. "The Organization of Turkic States: A New Approach to Global and Regional Challenges." *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 27.1 (2022): 105-120. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/2559564>

Niemann, Arne. "Neofunctionalism." *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Politics*. 2017. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acrefore/9780190228637.013.149>

Obydenkova, Anastassia. "Comparative regionalism: Eurasian cooperation and European integration. The case for Neofunctionalism?" *Journal of Eurasian Studies* 2.2 (2011): 87-102. doi:10.1016/j.euras.2011.03.001

Organization of Turkic States. "Ambassador Kubanychbek Omuraliev". Accessed September 4, 2022. <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/genel-sekreter>

Organization of Turkic States. "Annual Report 2017". October 4, 2022. <https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/yayinlar/turk-konseyi-2017-faaliyet-raporu-8-en.pdf>

Organization of Turkic States. "Annual Report 2016". Accessed May 16, 2022. <https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/yayinlar/turk-konseyi-2016-faaliyet-raporu-6-en.pdf>

- Organization of Turkic States. “Areas of Cooperation- Economic Cooperation”. Accessed May 12, 2022. <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-alanlari#2-economic-cooperation>
- Organization of Turkic States. “Areas of Cooperation- Education Cooperation”. Accessed May 12, 2022. <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-alanlari#6-education-cooperation>
- Organization of Turkic States. “Areas of Cooperation- Political Cooperation”. Accessed May 12, 2022. <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-alanlari#1-political-cooperation>
- Organization of Turkic States. “Baku Declaration of the Extraordinary Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States”. Accessed May 12, 2022. https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/extraordinary-summit-baku-declaration-2020-17-en.pdf
- Organization of Turkic States. “Bishkek hosted the Second Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States”. Accessed May 10, 2022. https://www.turkkon.org/en/haberler/bishkek-hosted-the-second-summit-of-the-cooperation-council-of-turkic-speaking-states_98
- Organization of Turkic States. “Chairman.” Accessed June 4, 2022. <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/baskan>
- Organization of Turkic States. “Declaration of the First Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States.” Last modified October 21, 2011. https://www.turkkon.org/assets/dokuman/Declaration_ENG.pdf
- Organization of Turkic States. “Declaration of The Seventh Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States.” Accessed April 9, 2023. https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/seventh-summit-declaration-14-en.pdf
- Organization of Turkic States. “Declaration Of The Eight Summit Of The Organization Of Turkic States.” Accessed April 9, 2023. https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/eighth-summit-declaration-15-en.pdf

- Organization of Turkic States. "Nakhchivan Agreement" Accessed May 30, 2022. https://www.turkkon.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/nakhchivan-agreement-on-the-establishment-of-the-cooperation-council-of-turkic-speaking-states-1-en.pdf
- Organization of Turkic States. "Organization Chart" Accessed May 8, 2022. <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/organizasyon-semasi>
- Organization of Turkic States. "OTS International Observation Mission Monitored the Constitutional Referendum in Uzbekistan." Accessed May 19, 2022. https://www.turkicstates.org/en/haberler/ots-international-observation-mission-monitored-the-constitutional-referendum-in-uzbekistan_2899
- Organization of Turkic States. "Presidential Summits." Accessed April 6, 2022. <https://www.turkkon.org/en/zirveler>
- Organization of Turkic States. "Samarkand Declaration Of The Ninth Summit Of The Organization of Turkic States." Accessed April 10, 2022. https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/temel_belgeler/ninth-summit-declarataion-16-en.pdf
- Organization of Turkic States. "Turkic Culture and Heritage Foundation." Accessed April 6, 2022. https://turkicstates.org/en/iliskili-kurumlar/turkic-culture-and-heritage-foundation_5
- Organization of Turkic States. "The First Summit of the Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States was held in Almaty on October 20-21, 2011." Accessed May 5, 2022. https://www.turkkon.org/en/haberler/the-1st-summit-of-the-cooperation-council-of-turkic-speaking-states-was-held-in-almaty-on-october-20-21-2011_144
- Organization of Turkic States. "Turkic Academy." Accessed April 16, 2022. https://turkicstates.org/en/iliskili-kurumlar/turkic-academy_1
- Organization of Turkic States. "TURKPA." Accessed April 18, 2022. https://www.turkicstates.org/en/iliskili-kurumlar/TürkPA_2
- Organization of Turkic States. "Transport Cooperation." Accessed May 17, 2022. <https://www.turkicstates.org/en/isbirligi-olanlari#2-economic-cooperation>

Organization of Turkish Speaking States. "Zirveler." Last modified December 14, 2021. <https://www.turkkon.org/tr/zirveler>

Ozan, Zeynep. "A Neofunctionalist Approach to the EU's External Border Management: The Case of Frontex " MS thesis. Middle East Technical University, 2021.

Özoğlu Murat, Gür Bekir and Coşkun İpek. "Küresel Eğilimler Işığında Türkiye'de Uluslararası Öğrenciler", Ankara: Seta Yayınları (2012): 1-185.

Öztürk, Batuhan Zeki. "Türk Devletleri Teşkilatı için Bir Avrupa Birliği Önerisi." Kafkasya'nın Geleceği Kongresi: 41. https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Kiram-Ashirov/publication/369182079_KONGRE_BILDIRI_TAM_METIN_KITABI/links/640e30dca1b72772e4ee8085/KONGRE-BILDIRI-TAM-METIN-KITABI.pdf#page=32

Parkhomchik, Lidia, Simsek, Hayal A. And Akhmetkaliyeva, Saule. Amirbek Aidarbek. "V Summit of the Turkic Council: Common Information Space and Enhancing Multilateral Cooperation" Eurasian Research Institute, No 33 (2015). <https://eurasian-research.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/aae-bulten-en-33.pdf>

Parkhomchik, Lidiya, Dauren Aben and Makhanov, Kanat. "The Sixth Summit of the Turkic Council: A New Era", *Eurasian Research Institute*, 2016. <https://eurasian-research.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/Weekly-e-bulletin-18-09-2018-24-09-2018-No-178.pdf>

Purtaş, Fırat. "Cultural diplomacy initiatives of Turkic Republics." *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 22.1 (2017): 91-114. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/815555>

Risse, Thomas. "Neofunctionalism, European identity, and the puzzles of European integration." *The Disparity of European Integration. Routledge* (2013): 75-93. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13501760500044033>

Rosamond, Ben. "The uniting of Europe and the foundation of EU studies: revisiting the Neofunctionalism of Ernst B. Haas." *Journal of European public policy* 12.2 (2005): 237-254. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13501760500043928>

Sapiyev, Yerkebulan. "Kazakhstan's Role In Strengthening The Turkic Council And Regional Cooperation In Central Asia". Diss. Istanbul Aydın University Institute Of Social Sciences, 2017.

Sapiyev, Yerkebulan. "Turkey and Turkic-Speaking States." *Anadolu Strateji Dergisi* 3.2 (2021): 1-31. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/2290214>

Schmitter, Philippe C. "Neo-Neofunctionalism." *European University Institute Vol. 6* (2004): 1-43. <https://www.eui.eu/Documents/DepartmentsCentres/SPS/Profiles/Schmitter/NeoNeoFunctionalismRev.pdf>

Shadybekov, Kuvanchybek. "The Cooperation Council of Turkic Speaking States: Main Stages and Prospects of Development." *Turkic Council* (2019): 95-114.

Shaukenova, Zarema. "Turkic Council: Achievements and Prospects." *Turkic Council*: 82-92. <https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/haberler/ozel-yayin-turk-konseyi-nahcivan-anlasmasinin-10-yil-donumu-1909-37.pdf#page=82>

Somuncuoğlu, B. Tümen. "The 25th Anniversary of the Turkic Republics" Independence: A View from Turkey." *25th Anniversary of the Independence of Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan, and Turkey's Contribution to Development and Cooperation in the Turkic Region* (2016): 94. <https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/yayinlar/ozel-yayin-azerbaycan-kazakistan-ve-kirgizistanin-bagimsizliginin-25yili-ve-turkiyenin-turk-bolgesinde-kalkinma-ve-isebirligine-katkisi-10-en.pdf#page=96>

Sultanov, Talant. "The Turkic Council's Increasing Role in Promoting Regional Cooperation in Eurasia." *Fifth Summit of the Turkic Council: A rising actor in regional cooperation in Eurasia. Center for Strategic Research* 11 (2015): 45-57. <http://www.jstor.com/stable/resrep05095.14>

Şahin, Köksal, and Candan, Gökçe. "Scientific productivity and cooperation in Turkic world: a bibliometric analysis." *Scientometrics* 115.3 (2018): 1199-1229. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11192-018-2730-x>

Şener, Ayşe. "Türk Dünyasında Entegrasyon Süreçleri ve Kurumsallaşma." PHD Diss. , Karabük University, 2021.

Tannam, Etain. "Cross-border co-operation between Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland: Neofunctionalism revisited." *The British journal of politics and international relations* 8.2 (2006): 256-276. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-856X.2006.00202.x>

TİKA. "About Us." Accessed May 22, 2022. https://www.tika.gov.tr/en/page/about_us-14650.

TİKA. "Türk İşbirliği ve Koordinasyon Ajansı- Faaliyet Raporu 2022." Accessed August 19, 2022. <https://www.tika.gov.tr/upload/old/2023/FAAL%C4%B0YET%20RAPORU/T%C4%B0KA%202022%20%C4%B0dare%20Faaliyet%20Raporu.pdf>

Turkic Universities Union. "Member Universities." Accessed June 7, 2023. <http://turkunib.org/en/site/index/#member>

TURKPA. "Chairman." Accessed December 9, 2022. https://turk-pa.org/en/content/about_TürkPA/chairman

TURKPA. "Eleventh Plenary Session of TURKPA. Cholpon-Ata, 24 June 2022." Accessed June 14, 2022. https://turk-pa.org/en/content/events/plenary_ses/11th_p/4119_eleventh_plenary_session_of_TürkPA_cholponata_24_june_2022

TURKPA. "Presidential and Parliamentary Elections." Accessed April 8, 2023. <https://turk-pa.org/en/content/events/preandparlelections/2>

TURKPA. "Statement of International Observers Mission of Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic-Speaking Countries on elections held on October 10, 2010 for Jogorku Kenesh of the Kyrgyz Republic" Last modified May 20, 2012. https://turk-pa.org/en/content/events/preandparlelections/312_parliamentary_elections_held_in_kyrgyz_republic_10102010

TURKSOY. "Sultan Raev." Accessed May 11, 2022. <https://www.turksoy.org/en-US/secretary-general>

TURKSOY. "Term Coordinator." Accessed April 3, 2022. <https://www.turksoy.org/en-US/term-coordinator>

TURKSOY. "Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus." Accessed April 19, 2022.
<https://www.turksoy.org/en-US/turkish-republic-of-northern-cyprus>

TURKSOY. "Traditional Events." Last modified April 8, 2022.
<https://www.turksoy.org/en-US/traditional-events>

Türk Devletleri Parlemlenter Asamblesi. "Daimi Komisyonlar." Accessed June 12, 2023. https://turk-pa.org/tr/content/about_TürkPA/komisyonlar

Turan Gafarlı, "ANALYSIS - Turkic Council's growing role in tackling crises of 2020", *Anadolu Agency*, September 10, 2020.
<https://www.aa.com.tr/en/analysis/analysis-turkic-councils-growing-role-in-tackling-crisis-of-2020/1968547>

Trading Economics. "Turkey Exports by Country." Accessed May 17, 2022.
<https://tradingeconomics.com/turkey/exports-by-country>

Türk Devletleri Teşkilatı. "Türk Konseyi Eğitim Bakanları 1. Toplantısını gerçekleştirdi." Accessed August 9, 2022.
https://turkicstates.org/tr/haberler/turk-konseyi-egitim-bakanlari-1-toplantisini-gerceklestirdi_101

Ulutaş, Ufuk, and Oktay F. Tanrısever. "The Turkic Council on the 10th Anniversary of the Nakhchivan Agreement: A View from Turkey." *Turkic Council* (2019): 112-125.
<https://www.turkicstates.org/assets/pdf/haberler/ozel-yayin-turk-konseyi-nahcivan-anlasmasinin-10-yil-donumu-1909-37.pdf#page=112>

Wessels, Wolfgang. "Cleavages, controversies and convergence in European Union Studies." *Palgrave Advances in European Union Studies*. Palgrave Macmillan (London, 2006): 233-246.

Wiener, Antje. "Constructivism and sociological institutionalism." *Palgrave advances in European Union studies*. Palgrave Macmillan (London, 2006): 35-55.

World Nomad Games. "About the World Nomad Games." Accessed June 10, 2022 <http://worldnomadgames.com/en/page/About-the-WNG/>.

Yesevi, Çaęla Gül. "Examining the Organization of Turkic States: A Teacher and Norm-Creator." *Perceptions: Journal of International Affairs* 27.1 (2022): 2-25. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/2559482>

Yılmaz, Baha Ahmet. "Soęuk Savaş Sonrası Türk-Orta Asya İlişkilerinde Türk Keneşi'nin Rolü: Dönemler ve Deęişim Dinamikleri." *Barış Araştırmaları ve Çatışma Çözümleri Dergisi* 7.1 (2019): 1-25. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/911050>

Yükseköğretim Bilgi Yönetim Sistemi. "Uyruęa Göre Öğrenci Sayıları Raporu." Accessed September 18, 2023. <https://istatistik.yok.gov.tr/>

APPENDICES

A. TURKISH SUMMARY / TÜRKÇE ÖZET

Bu tezin ilk bölümünde tezin kapsamı ve amacı kısaca anlatılmıştır. 1990 sonrasını inceleyen bu tezin araştırdığı soru, Yeni İşlevselci Teori'nin TDT'nin oluşumunu açıklayıp açıklayamayacağıdır ve tez, bu soruyu cevaplamaya çalışmaktadır.

Literatür Taramasında ise Yeni İşlevselcilik anlatılmaktadır. İlk Avrupa Birliği entegrasyon teorilerinden olan Yeni İşlevselcilik, esasen AB çalışmalarının temelini oluşturmaktadır.

Devlet dışı aktörleri ön plana çıkaran Yeni İşlevselcilik, 1950'lerde klasik realizme tepki olarak ortaya çıkmıştır. Ayrıca, bu teori yeniden inşa ve Federalizmi temel almaktadır. Yeni İşlevselcilik, işlevselciliğin devamı gibi düşünülmektedir⁶⁹⁴. Teori, David Mitrany'nin İşlevselcilik Teorisi'ni eleştirmiş ve bu teorinin eksikliklerini tamamlayarak ortaya çıkmıştır⁶⁹⁵. Bunun yanı sıra, Yeni İşlevselcilik karar verme süreçlerine, kademeli değişime ve öğrenme süreçlerine özel önem atfetmektedir.

Teori, 1950 ve 1960'larda Avrupa Kömür ve Çelik Topluluğu ve de Avrupa Topluluğu'nun kurulmasının ardından konuşulur hâle gelmiştir. Ancak, Yeni İşlevselcilik, ilk olarak Ernst B. Haas'ın "The Uniting of Europe: Political, Social and Economic Forces, 1950-1957" kitabı ile ortaya çıkmıştır⁶⁹⁶. Yeni İşlevselcilik Teorisi'nin mimarları Ernst B. Haas, Philippe Schmitter ve Leon Lindberg olarak

⁶⁹⁴ Ayşe Şener, "Türk Dünyasında Entegrasyon Süreçleri ve Kurumsallaşma", PHD Diss. , *Karabük University* (2021): 67.

⁶⁹⁵ *Ibid*, p. 67.

⁶⁹⁶ *Ibid*, p. 68.

kabul edilmektedir. Ayrıca, Yeni İşlevselcilik Jean Monnet'den de entellektüel düzeyde etkilenmiştir.

Ancak, Teori 1950 ve 1960'larda AB çalışmalarının başat teorisi iken 1970'lerde bu popülaritesini kaybetmiştir. Bunun sebebi ise teorinin, entegrasyon için ekonomik büyümeyi zorunlu olarak görmesidir. 1970'lerde ekonomik büyüme yavaşlayınca teori de başatlığını yitirmiştir. Ancak, Yeni İşlevselcilik 1970'lerden itibaren yeniden inşa edilmeye başlanmıştır. Örneğin, 1970'lerden itibaren teorinin yeniden inşası için uğraşan P. Schmitter, Yeni İşlevselcilik Teorisi'ne dış faktörleri, iç gerginlikleri ve de bölgesel entegrasyonun çelişkilerini eklemiştir. Ama Schmitter, otomatik yayılma gibi faktörlerden bahsetmemiştir. 1980'lerde ise AB entegrasyonunun tekrar gündeme gelmesiyle Yeni İşlevselcilik, yeniden konuşulur olmuştur. Bunun sebebinin ise Avrupa Topluluğu'ndaki gelişmeler, Avrupa Tek Senedi ve Ortak Pazarın kurulmasıdır.

Yeni İşlevselcilik Teorisi'nin özelliklerine baktığımızda ise en temel özelliğinin yayılma etkisi (spillover effect) olduğu görülebilir. Yayılma etkisi, genel itibarıyla belirli amaçla gerçekleşen siyasi işbirliğinin sonucunda yeni hedeflerin ya da işbirliği alanlarının oluşmasıyla tamamlanan süreçtir. Teori, üç tip yayılma etkisinden söz etmektedir. Bunlar sırasıyla işlevsel ya da teknik yayılma etkisi, siyasi yayılma etkisi ve de işlenmiş yayılma etkisidir.

İlk tip yayılma etkisi, bir işbirliği alanı çıkınca başka işbirliği alanlarının da tetiklenmesi şeklinde gerçekleşmektedir. Örneğin, bir ülkede sınır kontrolleri kaldırıldığında ülkede otomatikman göç kontrolü gibi başka işbirliği alanları tetiklenmiş olur.

Siyasi yayılma etkisinde ise aktörlerin siyasi hareket ettiği söylenebilir. Bu yayılmada aktörler, yani siyasi aktörler ya da çıkar grupları, amaçlarına göre belirledikleri gündemi gerçekleştirmek üzere çalışırlar. Siyasal yayılmada, siyasi elit ya da kâr grupları, entegrasyonun gerçekleşmesinin kendileri için kârlı olduğunu fark ettiklerinde sadakatlerini değiştirebilirler. Tabi, bu süreç elit sosyalleşmesi sayesinde gerçekleşir.

Son yayılma tipi olan işlenmiş yayılma (cultivated spillover) ise mevcut aktörlerin entegrasyon adına diğer aktörleri zorlaması ile gerçekleşir. Mesela, kurumların entegrasyon adına insiyatif kullanması ve arabuluculuk yapması bir işlenmiş yayılma örneğidir. Ancak, anlaşılacağı üzere bu yayılma türünde toplum gruplarının rolü önemlidir. Çünkü bu gruplar hükümetler istemese de entegrasyon için gerekli çabayı gösterebilirler.

Yeni İşlevselcilik hakkında bilinmesi gereken bir diğer nokta ise AB entegrasyonunu elitçi bir yaklaşımla ele almasıdır. Bu teoriye göre entegrasyonu sağlayan temel faktör elitlerin sosyalleşmesi ve yine aynı elitlerin öğrenme sürecinde entegrasyondan yana bir tavır sergilemeleridir. Yeni İşlevselci teorinin ortaya çıkışı AB bütünleşmesi taraftarı olan elit projelerinin bir araya gelmesiyle oluşturulmuştur⁶⁹⁷.

Ancak, teoriye yönelik birçok eleştiri de mevcuttur. Özellikle 1960'lardan sonra teori eleştirilmiştir. Bu eleştirileri yöneltten taraf çoğunlukla hükümetler arası (intergovernmentalist) görüşe sahip akademik çevreler olmuştur. Teoriye yönelik eleştirilerden biri bahsi geçen aktörlerin birden fazla kuruma sadakatinin olabileceğidir. Yani elitlerin entegrasyona olan sadakatleri kendi ulus devletlerine yönelik bağlılıklarından vazgeçmelerini gerektirmez. Yeni İşlevselcilik Teorisi'ne yönelik bir diğer eleştiri ise teorinin entegrasyona katılan ülkelerin hepsini demokrasi olarak kabul etmesidir. Ancak, bu durum gerçeğe her zaman uymamaktadır. Ayrıca, teoriye yönelik bir diğer eleştiri ise Yeni İşlevselciliğe göre entegrasyonun gerçekleşmesi için teorinin devamlı ekonomik büyümeyi zorunlu kılmasıdır. Bu da teorinin ekonomik determinizme bağlı olduğu eleştirisine sebep olmaktadır. Ayrıca, teori aktörlere fazla önem atfettiği için eleştirilere maruz kalmıştır. Bunlara ek olarak, Yeni İşlevselcilik dış şoklara, iç gerginliklere ve de siyasi süreçlere yeteri kadar önem atfetmediği için eleştirilere maruz kalmıştır.

⁶⁹⁷ Aslı Erol, "Yeni-işlevselcilik ışığında Avrupa bütünleşmesi", MS Thesis, *Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü* (2007), 17.

Daha sonra ise tezin temel argümanı, Araştırma metodu ve bölümlerin organizasyonu anlatılmıştır. Tezin temel argümanı, Yeni İşlevselcilik Teorisi'nin TDT'yi açıkladığı yönündedir. Bunun sebebi ise bir alandaki işbirliğinin diğer alandaki işbirliğini etkilemesi ve bunun da Foksiyonel Yayılıma sebep olmasıdır. Tezin diğer bir bulgusu ise TDT'nin zaman içinde aşama kaydettiği ve geliştiği yönündedir. Özellikle, siyasi alandaki işbirliğini geliştiren üye ülkeler birçok uluslararası ilişkiler meselesinde dayanışma içersinde hareket etmişlerdir. Özellikle, Kıbrıs'ın TDT ve TÜRKPA'ya gözlemci üye olarak alınması hem siyasi işbirliğinin artması hem de Türkiye'nin etkisi açısından önemli bir gelişmedir.

Bir sonraki bölümde ise Türk Devletleri Teşkilatı üye ülkelerinin Sovyetler Birliği yıkıldıktan sonraki süreçte birbirleriyle etkileşimleri ve de entegrasyona giden süreç incelenmiştir. Türki Devletlerin entegrasyon süreci temelde üçe ayrılmaktadır. Bu aşamalar sırasıyla 1992-2001 arası üye ülkelerin ortak işbirliği alanlarının arandığı ilk evre, 2001- 2010 arası işbirliğinin güçlendirilmeye çalışıldığı ikinci evre ve de 2010'dan günümüze kadar olan TDT'nin kurumsallaştığı ve pragmatik ilişkilerin kurulduğu üçüncü evredir.

İlk evre, üye ülkeler için bir dönüm noktası sayılabilecek 1992 Ankara Anlaşması ile başlamaktadır. Daha sonra TÜRKSOY'un ve DEİK'in kurulma kararlarının alındığı 1993 İstanbul Zirvesi gerçekleşmiştir. Bu örgütün kurumsallaşmaya giden ilk toplantısı olması açısından önemlidir. Bu zirveyi, 1995'te Bişkek ve kurumun tüzüğünün hazırlandığı 1996 Taşkent Zirvesi izlemiştir. 1998'de gerçekleşen Astana Zirvesi'ni ise 2000 Bakü Zirvesi takip etmiştir. Bakü Zirvesi'nde politik, kültürel ve ekonomik işbirliği konuları öne çıkarken aynı zamanda Sekreteryaya da kurulmuştur.

İkinci evre ise Örgütün isminin Türk Dili konuşan Devletler Zirvesi olarak değiştiği 2001 İstanbul Zirvesi ile başlamaktadır. Bu zirveden sonra ise 2006 Antalya Zirvesi gerçekleşmiştir. Daha sonra ise örgüt için yeni bir dönüm noktası olan 2009 Nahçıvan Zirvesi'nde üye ülkeler toplanmıştır. Nahçıvan Zirvesi, örgüte hükümetler arası bir yapı sağlamış ve örgütün yapısını ve temel organlarını oluşturmuştur. Bu bağlamda, Nahçıvan Zirvesi, TDT için önem arz etmektedir.

3.3’de ise üye ülkelerin entegrasyon sürecinin üçüncü kısmı anlatılmaktadır. Bu evre, 2010 İstanbul Zirvesi ile başlamıştır. 2011’de ise ekonomi temalı Almati Zirvesi gerçekleştirilmiştir. 2012 Bişkek Zirvesi ise Türk Kültür ve Miras Vakfı’nın ve de Türk Akademisi’nin kurulması açısından önemlidir. Bu zirveden sonra 2014 Bodrum ve 2015 Astana Zirveleri düzenlenmiştir. Macaristan’ın gözlemci üye olarak kabul edildiği ve Modern İpek Yolu’nun kurulmasının teklif edildiği 2018 Çolpan Ata Zirvesi gerçekleşmiştir. 2019’da ise Bakü’de bir zirve yapılmıştır ve Pandemi ile mücadelenin ön plana çıktığı 2020 Zirvesi video konferans yöntemi ile gerçekleşmiştir. 2021 yılında ise 2040 Türk Dünyası Vizyonu’nun kabul edildiği İstanbul Zirvesi düzenlenmiştir. Bu zirvede, Örgütün resmi ismi Türk Devletleri Teşkilatı olarak değişmiştir (Öztürk, 2022, 49). 2022 yılında ise Semerkand Zirvesi yapılmıştır.

Ayrıca bu bölümde Nahçıvan Anlaşması’ndan sonra oluşan Türk Devletleri Teşkilatı (TDT)’nin yapısı anlatılmaktadır. TDT genel itibariyle ana organ ve şemsiye örgütlerden oluşmaktadır. Örgüt Devlet Başkanları Konseyi, Dışişleri Bakanları Konseyi, Aksakalar Konseyi, Kıdemli Memurlar Komitesi ve de Sekreteryaya olmak üzere beş ana organdan oluşmaktadır. Ana organ olan Devlet Başkanları Konseyi’nin görevi Örgütün aktivitelerini yönetmek, Zirve Bildirgelerini basmak ve de eski aktiviteleri değerlendirmektir. Dışişleri Bakanları Konseyi ise aktiviteleri değerlendirmek ve Sekreteryaya’nın finansal raporlarını denetlemektir. Yılda bir defa toplanan Aksakallar Konseyi ise Devlet Başkanları Konseyi’ne ve de Dışişleri Bakanları Konseyi’ne fikir ve tavsiye sunmaktan sorumludur. Dördüncü organ olan Kıdemli Memurlar Komitesi ise Sekreteryaya’nın faaliyetlerini kontrol etmektedir. Ayrıca, sunulacak taslak belgelerin değerlendirilmesinden ve onaylanmasından sorumludur.

TDT’nin aynı zamanda TürkPA, TURKSOY ve Türk Akademisi gibi çatı kuruluşları da bulunmaktadır. Bunlar aracılığıyla Örgüt, üye devletler arasındaki ekonomik, sosyal, kültürel ve daha birçok alandaki işbirliğini arttırmaya yönelik çalışmalar yapmaktadır.

İkinci bölümde ise üye ülkeler arasındaki kültürel işbirliği anlatılmaktadır. Türkiye, Sovyetler Birliği zamanında bölge ile iliki kuramadığı için kültürel anlamda bir faaliyet gösterememiştir. Bunun bir sebebi Türki Ülkelerin kendilerini Sovyet vatandaşı olarak görmeleridir. Ancak, 1991 sonrasında Türkiye bölge ülkeleri ile ilk olarak kültürel ilişkiler kurmaya başlamıştır. Bu bağlamda TÜRKSÖY, Türk Akademisi ve Türk Kültür ve Miras Vakfı gibi kültürel işbirliği alanında faaliyet gösterecek örgütler kurarak kültürel işbirliği teşvik edilmiştir.

TDT üyeleri arasındaki kültürel işbirliğini arttırmak adına faaliyet gösteren başat kurum TÜRKSÖY'dur. 1993 senesinde Azerbaycan, Kazakistan, Türkmenistan, Kırgızistan, Özbekistan ve Türkiye'nin imzaladıkları anlaşma ile kurulmuş ve Türk Dünyasının UNESCO'su olarak adlandırılmıştır⁶⁹⁸. TÜRKSÖY, ayrı bir başlık altında detaylı bir şekilde açıklanmıştır.

Üye ülkeler arasında kültürel işbirliğini arttırmak adına faaliyet gösteren bir diğer çatı örgüt ise Türk Kültür ve Miras Vakfı'dır. Türk Kültür ve Miras Vakfı, Azerbaycan'ın inisiyatifi ile 2012'de kurulmuştur ancak 2015'ten sonra faal olmuştur. Vakfın amacı, Türk Kültür ve Mirasını korumak, bu amaca yönelik çalışmalar yürütmek ve de Türk kültürünü tanıtmaktır. Bu hedefleri gerçekleştirmek adına Vakıf seminer, konferans, saha çalışması ve kongreler düzenlemektedir. Ayrıca, Vakıf çeşitli proje, aktivite ve de programları finanse etmektedir. Bunun yanı sıra, Türk kültür ve tarihini çalışacak akademisyenler yetiştirmekte ve üye ülkelerden gelen sanatçıları finanse etmektedir. Kurumun şuan ki başkanı Günay Afandiyeva'dır.

Kültürel alanda faaliyet gösteren bir diğer çatı örgüt ise Türk Akademisi'dir. Türk Akademisi, bu amacı gerçekleştirmek adına Türk dili, tarihi ve kültürü hakkında yayın yapmakta, sosyolojik ve arkeolojik çalışmalar üretmekte, uluslararası forum ve konferanslar düzenlemektedir.

⁶⁹⁸ Kadir Ertaç Çelik ve Mehmet Seyfettin Erol, "Türk Dünyası'nda işbirliği denemesi: Türk Keneşi ve Kazakistan", *Türk Dünyası İncelemeleri Dergisi* 17.2 (2017): 27, <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/386789>

Bu çatı örgütler dışında TDT, üye ülkeler arasındaki kültürel işbirliğini geliştirmek adına burs ve değişim programları düzenlemektedir. Orhun Değişim Programı, bu programlardan en bilinenidir.

Kısaca, TDT'nin kültürel işbirliği alanında çatı örgütler ve çeşitli burs ve değişim programları aracılığıyla varlık göstermektedir. Kültürel işbirliği alanında, TDT'nin güçlü olduğu söylenebilir. Bunun nedeni, zaten ortak kültür, dil ve tarih TDT'nin kurulmasına imkan vermiştir.

Kültürel İşbirliği'nin bir alt başlığı olarak TÜRKSÖY daha detaylı bir şekilde anlatılmaktadır. TÜRKSÖY'a üye ülkeler 1993 anlaşmasını imzalayan kurucu üyeleridir ve de Altay Cumhuriyeti, Başkurt Cumhuriyeti, Gagavuzya, Hakas Cumhuriyeti, Saka Cumhuriyeti, Tataristan Cumhuriyeti, Kuzey Kıbrıs Türk Cumhuriyeti ve Tuva Cumhuriyeti TÜRKSÖY'un gözlemci üyeleridir.

TÜRKSÖY koordinatörü üye ülkelerin kültür bakanları arasından alfabetik sırayla seçilir ve şuanki koordinatörü Türkiye Kültür ve Turizm Bakanı, Mehmet Nuri Ersoy'dur. Genel Sekreteri ise Sultan Raev'dir.

TÜRKSÖY, üye ülkeler arasında eşit katılım ve ortak çıkarlara önem vermektedir. Örneğin, TÜRKSÖY merkezi Ankara'da bulunmaktadır ama Türkiye'nin üyeler arasında hiyerarşik bir üstünlüğü yoktur.

Örgüt'ün amacı Türk kültürünü tanıtmak, korumak ve gelecek nesillere aktarmaktır. Bunu yapmak adına bir sürü faaliyete imza atmıştır. Öncelikle, TÜRKSÖY, üye ülkelerin tarihe mâl olmuş önemli isimlerini tanıtmaktadır. Bu amacı gerçekleştirmek adına TÜRKSÖY, her yılı bu tarihi isimlerin yılları ilan etmektedir. Örneğin, 2022 Süleyman Çelebi'nin 600. yaş günü vesilesiyle Süleyman Çelebi'yi anma yılı ilan edilmiştir.

İlaveten, TÜRKSÖY, Türk sanatını tanıtmak adına organizasyonlar düzenlemektedir. Bu doğrultuda, Örgüt, şu ana kadar 19 opera günü, 10 fotoğrafçı buluşması, 9 heykel

sergisi ve 7 kongre düzenlemiştir. Bu etkinliklere üye ülkelerden birçok sanatçı katılmıştır.

TÜRKSOY'un bir başka faaliyeti ise üye ülkelerin şehirlerini kültür başkenti ilan etmesidir. Örneğin 2012'de Astana Kültür başkenti ilan edilmiştir. Bu gelenek hâla devam etmektedir.

TÜRKSOY'un kültür alanında yaptığı bir diğer faaliyet ise gelenek hâline gelmiş olan Nevruz kutlamalarıdır. Şu ana kadar TÜRKSOY'un Nevruz kutlamaları üye ülkelerin çeşitli şehirlerinde ve UNESCO Paris Merkezi gibi alanlarda gerçekleşmiştir.

Ayrıca, TÜRKSOY, Türk kültür ve tarihini tanıtmak adına akademik konferanslar düzenlemekte ve akademik yayınlar yapmaktadır.

TÜRKSOY'un bir diğer faaliyeti ise Gençlik Projeleri Düzenlemektir. Bu bağlamda, TÜRKSOY Gençlik Odası ve TÜRKSOY Gençlik Orkestrası kurulmuştur.

TÜRKSOY, Türk kültürünü yaşatmak ve bunu gelecek nesillere aktarabilmek adına yayınlar da yapmaktadır. Bunların en bilinenleri Manas Destanı ve Dede Korkut Hikâyeleri'dir.

Bunlar haricinde TÜRKSOY'un TDT çatı örgütleri ve de çeşitli uluslararası Örgütler ile ilişkileri ve ortak faaliyetleri bulunmaktadır. Örneğin, UNESCO ile ilişkileri mevcuttur.

Bir sonraki bölümde ise üye ülkelerin ekonomik ilişkilerini geliştirmek adına yapılan çalışmalar, çatı kuruluşlar ve de projeler anlatılmaktadır. Öncelikle, ekonomik işbirliği üye ülkeler arasındaki temel işbirliği alanlarından biri olarak tanımlanmaktadır. Öyle ki, sürdürülebilir büyüme ve de eşit ortaklık ilkleri TDT'nin temel prensipleri arasında yer almaktadır. Üye ülkeler arasındaki ekonomik işbirliğini geliştirmek adına TDT eğitim ve değişim programları düzenlemekte, özel sektör yetkililerini düzenli olarak toplamakta ve Türk İş Konseyi ve Yuvarlak Masa

toplantıları düzenlemektedir. Bu bağlamda günümüze kadar 11 bakanlar düzeyinde ve 13 çalışma grubu toplantısı düzenlenmiştir ve birçok mutabakat metni imzalanmıştır.

Birçok TDT Zirve ve toplantısında ekonomik işbirliğinin önemi vurgulanmıştır. Örneğin, 2011 Zirvesi ekonomik işbirliğinin önemini vurgulandığı ve de ekonomik işbirliğinin temel taşı olarak mal, sermaye, hizmet ve teknolojilerin serbest dolaşımı olarak açıklanmıştır. Ayrıca, TDT 2019 Zirvesi'nin konusunu "Küçük ve Orta Ölçekli İşletmeleri Geliştirme" olarak belirlemiştir. Bunun dışında, TDT'nin ekonomik işbirliğini geliştirmek adına kurmuş olduğu 3 çalışma grubu bulunmaktadır.

2011'de kurulmuş olan Türk İş Konseyi adlı çatı örgüt ise üye ülkelerin ticaret ilişkilerini geliştirmek amacıyla kurulmuştur. Türk İş Konseyi'nin bir diğer amacı ise üye ülkelerinin ticaret ilişkileri önündeki engelleri kaldırmaktır.

Bunun haricinde eski Kazakistan Cumhurbaşkanı Nazarbayev'in teklifiyle, 2010'da Türk Ticaret Odası kurulmuştur. Merkezi İstanbul olan Türk Ticaret Odası, üye ülkelerin ticaret odaları ve iş çevrelerinden oluşmaktadır. Türk Ticaret Odası kurulduğu tarihten itibaren birçok başarılı toplantıya imza atmış ve üye ülkelerin ekonomik ilişkilerinin geliştirilmesine katkı sağlamıştır.

Türki Devletlerin ekonomik ilişkilerini geliştirmek adına tasarlanmış bir diğer proje ise Türk İş Portalı'dır. Türk İş Portalı'nın amacı TDT üye ülkeleri arasında oluşan fiziksel, bürokratik ve dilsel engelleri kaldırmak ve bu vesileyle bu ülkelerin birbiriyle daha rahat ticaret yapmasını sağlamaktır.

TDT'nin ekonomik işbirliğini geliştirmek adına geliştirdiği bir diğer inisiyatif ise Türk Yatırım ve Gelişim Fonu'dur. Bu projenin amacı üye ülkelere gelen yatırımı yükseltmek, üye ülkelerde istihdamı ve de üye ülkelerdeki girişimciliği arttırmaktır.

Son olarak, üye ülkelerin ekonomik alandaki işbirliğini arttıran bir diğer inisiyatif ise Türk Ticaret Evleri'dir. Bu projenin amacı üye ülkelerin birbirlerinin pazarlarındaki

pozisyonunu güçlendirmek, üye ülkeler arasındaki ticareti güçlendirmek ve bu bağlamda, üye ülkelerin ekonomik ilişkilerini yoğunlaştırmaktır.

TDT üyesi ülkelerin ekonomik işbirliği incelenirken ele alınması gereken bir diğer nokta ise üye ülkeler arasındaki enerji işbirliğidir. Bunun temel sebebi enerji alanındaki işbirliğinin üye ülkeler arasındaki ekonomik işbirliğine doğrudan katkı yapıyor olmasıdır. Bu bağlamda, TDT, üye ülkeler arasındaki enerji işbirliğine önem vermiş ve Nahçıvan Bildirisi'nde çok yönlü enerji transferinin güvenliğine atıf yapılmıştır.

Ancak, TDT, üye ülkeler arasındaki ekonomik işbirliğini geliştirmek adına kapsamlı faaliyetler yürütüyor olsa da üyeler arasındaki ekonomik işbirliği potansiyelin altında seyretmektedir. Örneğin, üye ülkeler birbirlerinin en çok ticaret yaptıkları ülkeler arasına girememektedirler. Bunun temel sebebi ise üye ülkelerin ekonomik görünümündeki farklılıklardır.

Yedinci Bölüm ise TDT üye ülkelerinin eğitim, bilim ve kültür alanındaki işbirliklerine değinmektedir. TDT, eğitimi gelecek nesillere Türk kültürünü öğretmek ve Türk Kültürünü yaşatmak için tek araç olarak görmektedir. Bu sebeple de eğitim alanındaki işbirliğine önem vermektedir.

Üye ülkeler alanında eğitim alanında işbirliği sağlamak ve üye ülkelerin eğitim alanındaki sorunlarını çözmek adına Eğitim Bakanları Seviyesinde toplantılar düzenlenmektedir. Örneğin, Türk Konseyi Eğitim Bakanları Toplantısı, 10 Ağustos 2012 tarihinde Çolpan-Ata, Kırgızistan'da yapılmıştır⁶⁹⁹. 2012'den beri bu toplantılar devam etmektedir.

2012'de yapılan bu toplantıların ilkinde Türki Üniversiteler Birliği'nin kurulması teklif edilmiş ve 2013'te kurulmuştur. Amacı üye ülkelerin Üniversiteler bazında işbirliğini geliştirmek olan Türki Üniversiteler Birliği'nin, üye ülkelerin

⁶⁹⁹ "Türk Konseyi Eğitim Bakanları 1. Toplantısını gerçekleştirdi", Türk Devletleri Teşkilatı, https://turkicstates.org/tr/haberler/turk-konseyi-egitim-bakanlari-1-toplantisini-gerceklestirdi_101

öğrencilerinin sorunlarını ele almak ve çözüm üretmekle yükümlü bir Öğrenci Konseyi de bulunmaktadır.

Bunlara ek olarak, çeşitli burs ve değişim programları üye ülkelerin eğitim alanındaki ilişkilerini güçlendirmek için kullanılmaktadır. Örneğin, 1990'lerden itibaren Türkiye, Türkiye Burslarını üye ülkelerden gelen öğrenciler için tahsis etmektedir. Bunun haricinde, Mevlana Değişim Programı ve Orhun Değişim Programı da aynı amaçla kullanılmaktadır.

Üye ülkelerden olan Azerbaycan, 2006'dan beri burs imkanı sağlamaktadır. Kazakistan ise Bolaşak bursu ile üye ülkelerin öğrencilerine destek vermektedir.

Ayrıca, TDT'nin bir diğer çatı örgütü olan, Türk Akademisi, üye ülkelerde eğitimli insan gücü oluşturmak ve bilim ağını genişletmek adına kurulmuştur. Türk Akademisi bu amaca yönelik yayınlar yapmakta ve çeşitli faaliyetler yürütmektedir.

Üye ülkelerin eğitim alanında yürütülen bir diğer çalışması ise spor alanındadır. TDT, ilk Göçebe Oyunları'nı 2014'te düzenlemiştir. Daha sonra ise Göçebe oyunları, 2016 ve 2018'de, Kırgızistan'da tekrar düzenlenmiştir.

Üye ülkelerin eğitimine katkı sağlamak için, TDT, ortak Üniversiteler kurmaktadır. Bunlara örnek olarak Uluslararası Hoca Ahmet Yesevi Türk- Kazak Üniversitesi ve Kırgız Türk Manas Üniversitesi gösterilebilir.

TDT'nin eğitim alanında gerçekleştirmiş olduğu bir diğer proje ise Kardeş Okullar Projesi'dir. Kardeş Okullar Projesi, 14 Mart 2019'da, Türk Keneşi Üst Düzey Yetkilileri yedinci toplantısında başlamıştır.

Bunlar ek olarak, Örgüt, ortak alfabe alanında da çalışmalar yürütmektedir. Eylül 2022'de, Bursa'da yapılan toplantı sonucunda Ortak Alfabe Komisyonu kurulmuştur ve bu komisyon hâlâ çalışmalarına devam etmektedir.

Ancak, TDT'nin bütün bu çabalarına rağmen üye ülkelerin eğitim alanındaki durumları potansiyelinin altında seyretmektedir. Üye ülkelerden sadece Türkiye, THE (Times Higher Education) standartlarına girebilen üniversitelere sahiptir. Ayrıca, üye ülkelerin yeterli düzeyde burs ve değişim programı yoktur.

Bir sonraki bölümde ise 25 Mayıs 2010'da, Azerbaycan'da kurulmuş olan Uluslararası Türk Akademisi anlatılmaktadır. Merkezi Astana'da bulunan Akademi, üye ülkelerin Eğitim Bakanlarından oluşan Bilim Konseyi, Akademi Başkanı ve Akademi Başkan Yardımcısı tarafından yönetilmektedir. Darkhan Kydralı 2014'ten beri Akademi Başkanlığı görevini yürütmektedir.

Akademi'nin 5 ana organı bulunmaktadır. Bunlar: Tarih ve Etnoloji Merkezi, Sanat ve Kültür Merkezi, Sosyo-Ekonomik Araştırma Merkezi, Uluslararası Araştırma Merkezi ve Dil ve Terminoloji Merkezleri'dir.

Temel amacı üye ülkelerdeki akademisyenlerin çalışmalarına katkı sağlamak ve onları Türk kültürü, dili, tarihi konusunda çalışmalara sevk etmek olan Uluslararası Türk Akademisi, bu amacı gerçekleştirmek adına çeşitli çalışmalar yapmaktadır. Akademi'nin öncelikli çalışması Türki Cumhuriyetlerin tarihi, dili, kültürü ve sanatı hakkında kitap basmaktır. Örneğin, Akademi Ortak Türk Tarihi Ders Kitabı'nı basmıştır ve bu ders kitabı üye ülkelerin okullarında okutulmuştur. Ayrıca, Akademi, Türk Dünyası Coğrafyası ve Edebiyatı adlı bir ders kitabı ve de monografiler de basmıştır.

Kitap basmanın yanı sıra, Akademi Atalar Mirası adlı bir websitesi yapmıştır. Türkçe, Rusça, İngilizce ve Kazakça yayınlar yapan bu site Türk kültürü ile ilgili içerikler yayınlamaktadır.

Akademi, aynı zamanda Türk kültürü ve tarihi ile ilgili akademik konferanslar da düzenlemektedir. Örneğin, 2015'te Hazar Transit Geçişi, Korkut'un Mirası ve Türk Dünyası konferanslarını düzenlemiştir. Benzeri konferansları her sene düzenli olarak yapmaktadır.

Ayrıca, Akademi arkeolojik çalışmalar da yürütmektedir. Bu çalışmaları Moğolistan, Karaganda ve Doğu Kazakistan'da bulunan heykelleri inceleyerek sürdürmektedir. Bunun yanı sıra, Akademi'nin UNESCO ve Birleşmiş Milletler gibi bağlantıları da mevcuttur. Bu bağlantıları sayesinde, ilgili uluslararası kuruluşların organizasyonlarına katılmakta ve bu kurumlarla ortak organizasyon düzenlemektedir.

7.2'de ise Eğitim alanında işbirliğini sağlayan Orhun Değişim Programı anlatılmaktadır. İlk olarak Türk Üniversiteler Birliği toplantısında kurulması teklif edilen Orhun Değişim Programı, 6-7 Nisan 2017'de üye ülkelerin onayıyla kurulmuştur.

Orhun Değişim Programı, üye ülkelerin öğrenci ve akademik kadrolarının üye ülke üniversiteleri arasında değişimini sağlamaktadır. Bu bağlamda program ilk olarak Uluslararası İlişkiler ve Siyaset Bilimi öğrencilerine, 2017-2018 eğitim yılı için açılmıştır. Açıldığı ilk sene programdan 43 öğrenci ve akademisyen faydalanmıştır. Daha sonra program kapsamındaki üniversitelerin sayısı artmış ve Türkoloji Bölümü öğrencileri de programa katılmaya başlamıştır.

Orhun Değişim programı her ne kadar üye ülkelerin birbirlerinin eğitim sisteminin tanınmasını ve eğitim alanında işbirliğini teşvik etse de etkisi çok güçlü değildir. Bunun sebebi, programa katılan öğrencilerin ve üye üniversitelerin az olmasıdır.

Bir sonraki bölümde ise üye ülkeler arasındaki siyasi işbirliği anlatılmaktadır. TDT, siyasi işbirliğini sağlamak için Dışişleri Bakanları seviyesinde toplantılar, Kıdemli Memurlar Komitesi Toplantıları, Genç Diplomatlar Eğitim Programı ve Dış Politika Araştırma Merkezi Toplantıları düzenlemektedir. İlaveten, Uluslararası Seçim Gözlemci Misyonları Örgüt tarafından düzenlenmektedir.

Üye ülkelerin Dışişleri Bakanları Toplantıları yıllık olarak düzenlenmektedir ve bu toplantılarda ortak dış politika konular tartışılmaktadır. Yıllık toplantılar haricinde, dış politika krizleri sebebiyle Olağanüstü Toplantılar düzenlenmektedir. En son 2021'de Afganistan konusunu tartışmak üzere üye ülkelerin Dışişleri Bakanları Olağanüstü Toplantısı gerçekleşmiştir.

Ayrıca, üye ülkeler, 2015'ten beri güvenlik istişareleri düzenlemektedirler. Örneğin, 2016'da güvenlik istişaresi düzenlenmiştir. Bu toplantıda terörle mücadele ve üye ülkelerin Afganistan ile ilişkileri ele alınmıştır.

Siyasi alanda işbirliğini sağlamak amacıyla ortaya çıkan bir diğer girişim ise Genç Diplomatlar Eğitim Programı'dır. İki hafta süren ve üye ülkelerin diplomatlarına eğitim veren bu program sayesinde genç diplomatlar üye ülkelere ve o ülkelerin dillerine aşina olmaktadır. Bu programda Türk Tarihi, Uluslararası Örgütler, Müzakere Teknikleri, Kamu İlişkileri ve Dış Politika gibi dersler verilmektedir. 2023'e kadar 138 diplomat bu programdan mezun olmuştur.

TDT'nin siyasi işbirliğine katkı sağlayan bir diğer faaliyeti ise seçim izleme misyonlarıdır. Örneğin, TDT, 2011'de Kırgızistan ve 2012'de Kazakistan seçim izleme görevini icra etmiştir. Ayrıca, TDT, TürkPA adlı çatı örgütü vasıtasıyla da seçim izleme misyonları düzenlemekte ve üye ülkelerin siyasal işbirliğine katkı sağlamaktadır.

İlaveten, TDT, Resmi Dış Politika Merkezleri ile toplantılar düzenlemekte ve üye ülkelerin akademisyenleri ile ortak politik gündem oluşturmaktadır. Bu toplantılar sayesinde TDT, ortak iletişim stratejisi geliştirmekte ve üye ülkelerdeki araştırma merkezlerinin iletişim kurmasını sağlamaktadır.

Genel olarak, TDT'nin siyasi işbirliği alanında hatırı sayılır çalışmaları olduğu söylenebilir. Bu durum TDT üyelerimin dış politika krizlerinde kolektif bir kimlik sergilemelerinden de anlaşılabilir. Örneğin, Karabağ krizinde üye ülkeler Azerbaycan'ı desteklemişlerdir. Bunun yanı sıra Kazakistan'da çıkan protestolar sırasında da TDT, Kazakistan'a destek vermiştir.

Sonraki bölümde ise siyasi işbirliğini destekleyen bir çatı Örgüt olan TÜRKPA anlatılmak anlatılmaktadır. TÜRKPA, 2006 Zirvesi'nde bir örgütlenmeye

gidilmesinin teklif edilmesinden sonra, 2008 İstanbul Anlaşması ile kurulmuştur⁷⁰⁰. Esas itibariyle, TÜRKPA'nın kurulma süreci 2000'li yıllarda başlamıştır ve kurulmasını ilk teklif eden kişi dönemin Kazakistan Parlamento Sözcüsü Jarmahan Tuyakbay olmuştur. Daha sonra, 2006 Antalya Zirvesi'nde dönemin Kazakistan Cumhurbaşkanı Nazarbayev, TÜRKPA'nın kurulması isteğini yinelemiştir. Bunun üzerine, 21-22 Şubat 2008'de TÜRKPA'yı kurmak için Antalya'da çalışmalar başlamıştır ve nihayetinde İstanbul Anlaşması ile kurulmuştur.

Üye ülkeleri Azerbaycan, Kazakistan, Kırgızistan ve Türkiye olan TÜRKPA, ilk toplantısını 2009'da, Bakü'de yapmıştır. Bu toplantıda kurumun tüzüğü, Seketeryası ve Bakü Bildirgesi kabul edilmiştir.

TÜRKPA'nın temel dört Organı bulunmaktadır. Bunlar: Dönem Başkanlığı, Asamble Konseyi, Genel Kurul ve Sekreteryadır. TÜRKPA'da üye ülkelerin her birinin 9 delegesi vardır. Ayrıca, TÜRKPA yıllık olarak toplanmaktadır.

TÜRKPA'nın amacı üye ülkelerin parlamentoları arasında işbirliğini sağlamak ve üye ülkeler arasındaki diyalog ve politik işbirliğini güçlendirmektir.

BM değerlerini benimsemiş olan TÜRKPA, üye ülkelerin parlamentolarına tavsiyeler de vermektedir. Bunun yanı sıra, TÜRKPA'nın 4 farklı komisyonu bulunmaktadır. Bunlar: Hukuk İşleri ve Uluslararası ilişkiler Komisyonu, Ekonomik İşbirliği Komisyonu, Sosyal, Kültürel ve İnsani Meseleler Komisyonu ve de Çevre, Doğal Kaynaklar ve Sağlıkın Korunması Komisyonu'dur⁷⁰¹. Bu komisyonlarda ilgili sorunlar tartışılmaktadır.

Bunlara ek olarak, TÜRKPA'nın seçim izleme misyonları mevcuttur ve şu ana kadar, TÜRKPA birçok seçimde bulunmuştur. Ayrıca, AGİT gibi birçok uluslararası

⁷⁰⁰ Baha Ahmet Yılmaz, "Soğuk Savaş Sonrası Türk-Orta Asya İlişkilerinde Türk Keneşi'nin Rolü: Dönemler ve Değişim Dinamikleri", *Barış Araştırmaları ve Çatışma Çözümleri Dergisi* 7.1 (2019): 13, <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/911050>

⁷⁰¹ "Daimi Komisyonlar", *Türk Devletleri Parleментар Asamblesi*, https://turkpa.org.tr/content/about_TurkPA/komisyonlar

kuruluşla ilişkisi olan TÜRKPA, üye ülkeler arasında değişim programları da düzenlemektedir.

Son bölümde ise tezin genel bir özeti ve sonuç kısmı yer almaktadır. Bu bölüm, 1991 yılının Türki devletler ve Türkiye için bir dönüm noktası olduğu kabul edilmektedir. Bu tarihten sonra Türkiye ve Türki Devletlerin entegrasyonu üç aşamada gerçekleşmiştir. Bu aşamalar 1992-2001 arası olan birinci evre, 20001-2010 arası ikinci evre ve 2010'dan günümüze kadar olan üçüncü evredir. Bu tarihler arasında üye ülkelerin entegrasyon sürecini başlattığı için 1992 Ankara Anlaşması, TDT'nin kurumsallaşmasına katkı sağladığı için 2009 Nahçıvan Anlaşması ve TDT'nin şimdiki ismini almasını sağlayan 2021 istanbul Bildirgesi özel önem taşımaktadır.

TDT, 1992'den beridir üye ülkeler arasında ekonomik, siyasi, kültürel ve eğitim alanında işbirliğini geliştirmektedir. Bunu da TÜRKSOY, TÜRKPA ve Türk İş Konseyi gibi çatı örgütleriyle yapmaktadır.

Genel itibariyle, Yeni İşlevselcilik Teorisi Türki devletler arasındaki işbirliğini ve TDT'yi açıklamaktadır. Bunun sebebi, şu ana kadar hep bir işbirliği alanı diğerini tetiklemiştir. Mesela, kültürel işbirliği eğitim alanındaki işbirliğini de tetiklemiştir. Örneğin, Türksoy faaliyetleri aynı zamanda eğitime katkı sağlamaktadır. Ayrıca, ekonomik işbirliği genel olarak diğer alanlardaki işbirliğine katkı sağlamaktadır. Örneğin, turizm, taşımacılık ve de enerji alanındaki işbirliği çalışmaları ekonomik alandaki işbirliğine de katkı sağlamıştır. Ayrıca, bahsi geçen alanlardaki işbirliği çalışmaları da ekonomik işbirliğini geliştirmiştir.

Ancak, TDT'nin etkisini arttırmasının önünde çeşitli engeller mevcuttur. Bunlar daha çok Rusya ve çin etkisi olarak kabul edilmektedir. Öncelikle, Rusya'nın bölgedeki etkisi azımsanamayacak kadar fazladır. Orta Asya'da Rus dili hâlâ egemenliğini korumakta ve Orta Asya ülkelerinde azımsanamayacak Rus azınlık grupları bulunmaktadır. Bunun haricinde, bölgedeki ekonomik projeleri ile Çin, bölgedeki güçlü bir diğer aktördür. Bugün, üç orta Asya ülkesi Şangay İşbirliği Örgütü'ne üyedir.

Bütün bunlara rağmen, TDT, 1992'den beri büyük aşama kaydetmiştir. Çatı örgütleriyle çeşitli işbirliklerine imza atan TDT, üye ülkelerin dinamik nüfusu, gelişmekte olan ekonomileri ve de stratejik konumları ile potansiyeli olan bir kurumdur. Bu bağlamda, engellere rağmen ilerde çok daha etkili olacaktır. İlaveten denilebilir ki, TDT'nin özellikle siyasi işbirliği alanında gelişimi öne çıkmaktadır. Siyasi işbirliği geliştikçe üye ülkeler dış politika sorunlarında kolektif bilinç göstermektedirler. Örneğin, üye ülkeler Karabağ Meselesi'nde ve 2022 yılının başında Kazakistan Protestolarında birbirleriyle dayanışma içinde hareket etmişlerdir. Bunun en önemli örneği ise KKTC'nin gözlemci üye olarak önce TDT'ye daha sonra ise TÜRKPA'ya kabul edilmesidir. Bu durum ise Türkiye'nin TDT aracılığıyla Kıbrıs politikasında güç kazandığının bir göstergesidir.

B. THESIS PERMISSION FORM / TEZ İZİN FORMU

(Please fill out this form on computer. Double click on the boxes to fill them)

ENSTİTÜ / INSTITUTE

Fen Bilimleri Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Natural and Applied Sciences

Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Social Sciences

Uygulamalı Matematik Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Applied Mathematics

Enformatik Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Informatics

Deniz Bilimleri Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Marine Sciences

YAZARIN / AUTHOR

Soyadı / Surname : Ünver

Adı / Name : Reşide Deniz

Bölümü / Department : Avrasya Çalışmaları / Eurasian Studies

TEZİN ADI / TITLE OF THE THESIS (İngilizce / English): THE ANALYSIS OF THE INTEGRATION PROCESS OF THE ORGANIZATION OF TURKIC STATES (OTS) FROM A NEOFUNCTIONALIST PERSPECTIVE

TEZİN TÜRÜ / DEGREE: Yüksek Lisans / Master Doktora / PhD

1. **Tezin tamamı dünya çapında erişime açılacaktır.** / Release the entire work immediately for access worldwide.
2. **Tez iki yıl süreyle erişime kapalı olacaktır.** / Secure the entire work for patent and/or proprietary purposes for a period of **two years.** *
3. **Tez altı ay süreyle erişime kapalı olacaktır.** / Secure the entire work for period of **six months.** *

* Enstitü Yönetim Kurulu kararının basılı kopyası tezle birlikte kütüphaneye teslim edilecektir. / A copy of the decision of the Institute Administrative Committee will be delivered to the library together with the printed thesis.

Yazarın imzası / Signature

Tarih / Date

(Kütüphaneye teslim ettiğiniz tarih. Elle doldurulacaktır.)
(Library submission date. Please fill out by hand.)

Tezin son sayfasıdır. / This is the last page of the thesis/dissertation.